

5

YORK REGION TRANSIT WASTE COLLECTION AT YORK REGION TRANSIT FACILITIES

The Transit Committee recommends:

- 1. The presentation by Rick Takagi, Manager, Operations and Ann Marie Carroll, Transit Facilities Co-ordinator, be received; and**
- 2. The recommendations contained in the following report, August 26, 2004, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works be adopted:**

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. York Region Transit staff be authorized to issue an RFP for the design, supply, installation and maintenance of waste/recycling containers with advertising panels at transit facilities, and report back to Transit Committee and Council.
2. The local municipalities in York Region be requested to endorse the concept of waste/recycling containers at designated transit facilities on the road allowances under their respective jurisdictions.
3. The City of Vaughan be advised that the installation of additional waste containers will be considered at transit stops based on an annual program review.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to address the need to standardize waste collection at transit facilities Region-wide.

York Region Transit (YRT) staff is seeking Transit Committee and Regional Council approval to issue an RFP for the design, supply, installation, maintenance and collection of waste/recycling materials from containers. The containers would include advertising panels to defray the cost of the program.

Staff must also address a City of Vaughan request from June 10, 2003 in which the Region of York was requested to install litter containers at all transit shelter locations within the City of Vaughan, and at all transit stops located on Regional roads within the City.

3. BACKGROUND

At present, YRT maintains 1,480 bus stops on Regional road allowances and 1,666 on municipal road allowances. A total of 572 bus stops have shelters located at them. Current waste collection practices vary throughout the Region. The Region inherited a variety of contracts and operating methods with the amalgamation of the local municipal transit services in 2001. The combination of operating methods requires YRT to employ Regional and municipal staff as well as private contractors to collect and dispose of waste from transit facilities. In some cases, property agreements, such as at the Bernard Bus Terminal, require property management companies to provide waste collection. Table 1 outlines the variety of waste collection services provided at YRT facilities.

Table 1
Waste Collection at YRT Facilities

Municipality	Waste Collector(s)
Aurora	Private Contractor
East Gwillimbury	Private Contractor
Georgina	Private Contractor
Markham	Private Contractor
Newmarket	Private Contractor/Property Management
Richmond Hill	Municipal Staff/Private Contractor/Property Management
Vaughan	Municipal Staff/Private Contractor
Region-wide illegal dumping	Region Staff/Municipal Staff

The City of Vaughan's request to York Region to install litter containers at all transit shelter locations within the City of Vaughan and all transit stops located on Regional roads within the City has been reviewed by YRT staff. It is recommended that waste containers be installed Region-wide at all bus stops warranting a shelter. Bus stops are placed 200 – 500 metres apart along Regional road allowances. Staff do not feel that all stops require a waste container since the number of customers utilizing stops varies significantly.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

YRT receives requests from the local municipalities and from transit customers to install waste containers at bus stops. To accommodate these requests and to address the need for waste containers at transit facilities, YRT staff recommend that the Region standardize the type of waste container and collection method at all transit facilities. It is suggested that waste containers be installed at all transit terminals, including the new bus rapid transit stations, and at all bus stops on both Regional and municipal road allowances where a bus shelter is warranted.

There is currently a variety of waste receptacles placed at YRT bus stops. There are 269 advertising benches with waste receptacles built in, 35 waste/recycling advertising

receptacles (only located in the Town of Markham), and 80 other containers made of wood, metals and plastic (*Attachment 1*).

YRT staff surveyed current waste collection practices of other transit authorities. The results are shown in Table 2.

Table 2
Other Transit Authorities Waste Collection Practices

Municipality	Waste Collection Practice
Ottawa	• Own staff collect waste. (4 persons) • No waste containers provided. • Weekly collection. • All stops.
Edmonton	• Contracted. • Concrete containers with liners. • Weekly/ Twice Weekly collection. • Shelter locations.
Oakville	• Halton Region Waste Department. • Wire baskets attached to shelters. • Weekly collection. • Shelter locations.
Burlington	• Halton Region Waste Department. • Large green drums and mesh containers. • Twice a month collection. • Shelter + various locations.
Mississauga	• Region of Peel • Plastic and Concrete Bins • Weekly/ Twice Weekly collection. • Shelter locations.
Winnipeg	• Winnipeg's Solid Waste Management • Weekly/As required collection. • Bus Terminals + shelter locations.

Considering York Region Transit's current waste collection practices and those of other transit authorities, and after further investigation by staff of other possible waste solutions, three options have been identified (*Attachment 2*):

1. Traditional waste collection.
2. Advertising bench with waste container attached.
3. Advertising waste/recycling container.

4.1.1. Traditional Waste Collection

For this method of waste collection, a standard waste container would be selected and installed in approved locations Region-wide. YRT would contract the waste collection, disposal and cleaning service.

4.1.2 Advertising Bench with Waste Container Attachment

The YRT bus stop standard provides for a bench to be installed inside all shelters. External seating is provided by advertising benches. At present, the Region has an agreement with Creative Outdoor Advertising (COA) for advertising benches in the City of Vaughan, and the Towns of Richmond Hill and Newmarket. Currently, there are 269 advertising benches installed with built-in waste containers at approved locations throughout the three municipalities. The agreement(s) is a three-party agreement between COA, Region of York and the local municipality. The agreement(s) gives COA the right to place their advertising benches at various bus stop locations in return for the installation and maintenance of the units, including waste collection. The Region also receives a portion of the advertising revenue totalling \$16,500 annually.

In the Towns of Georgina and East Gwillimbury, the Region has an advertising contract with The Centre Group. The agreement(s) provides for the installation and maintenance of the benches but does not include a waste collection component. There are 29 benches installed in total. The Region receives an annual revenue amount of \$3,700 under this contract.

The YRT standard provides for a bench to be installed inside all shelters. The ad benches provide exterior seating, however, the use of such seating is limited by winter weather conditions in particular.

4.1.3 Advertising Waste/Recycling Container

Several municipalities are now embarking on the introduction of a combined waste and recycling collection program in public spaces. They include the City of Toronto, the City of Barrie, the Town of Markham, and the Town of Whitby, to name a few.

Administration of these units varies throughout the different municipalities. Some municipalities have purchased the containers and contracted the advertising and maintenance out themselves. In these cases, a larger portion of the advertising revenue is retained by the municipality to offset the waste collection and maintenance costs. The Town of Markham's agreement stipulates that the contractor provide and maintain the container, collect the waste and sell the advertising space, all at no cost to the Town. However, the Town forfeits 100% of the revenue to the contractor for the first five years and in the next five years, the Town of Markham will receive a portion of the revenue.

4.2 Evaluation of Options

4.2.1 Option 1 – Traditional Waste Collection

The Region would invest a large amount of money in the purchase of waste containers and also pay an annual operating cost to collect waste and maintain the containers. There would be no potential for recovery of funds.

4.2.2 Option 2 – Bench Advertising with Waste Container Attached

The benches are large in size and cannot be installed at all required locations. Some of the local municipalities will not accept the units currently being installed. The Region may have to combine this option with traditional waste containers in order to be able to provide waste containers Region-wide. Currently, the Region does not pay for the bench units or the maintenance of them. The same stipulation would be anticipated for future contracts. There could, however, be a cost to the Region for the purchase and maintenance of additional waste containers if required. Some of the cost would be recovered from the bench advertising revenue.

4.2.3 Option 3 – Waste/Recycling Containers with Advertising

The Region would specify a container type that could be installed at all transit facilities, and that would be accepted by the local municipalities, including heritage and specific streetscape districts. The contractor would be required to provide, install and maintain the container, and provide waste collection at no cost to the Region. The waste/recycling materials collected would be delivered to the Region's new waste facility in the Town of East Gwillimbury for processing. Revenue from the material would remain with the Region.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The financial implications will vary depending on the selected method of waste collection.

5.1 Option 1 - Traditional Waste Collection

YRT staff have estimated waste collection costs for 2004 to be \$171,000. This estimate is based on the current waste collection practices. On average, the Region pays \$9.70 per container, per collection.

To install waste containers at all terminals, including bus rapid transit stations, and bus stops warranting shelters, YRT would have to purchase 572 waste containers at an estimated cost of \$1,000 per container. The cost to the Region for the initial purchase of waste containers would be \$572,000. An annual budget would be required for the purchase of additional and replacement containers as well as for supplies and paint to undertake maintenance and repairs. In addition, the collection of waste from the 572 containers once a week at \$9.70 per container would be an annual operating cost to the Region of \$288,517.

5.2 Option 2 - Bench Advertising with Waste Container Attached

There are no costs to the Region for the bench units. The Region receives approximately \$18,000 annually in revenue from bench advertising.

Of the 572 locations identified for waste containers, 273 locations currently have a COA bench. Due to the size of the bench units and the non-acceptance of the units by some of the local municipalities, YRT staff anticipate another waste container type will have to be

supplied and installed at the other 300 transit stops. The cost to the Region for the initial purchase of waste containers would be \$300,000. An annual budget would be required for the purchase of additional and replacement containers as well as supplies and paint to undertake maintenance and repairs. In addition, the collection of waste from the 300 containers once a week at \$9.70 per container would be an annual operating cost to the Region of \$152,834. The annual revenue of \$18,000 received for advertising would reduce the cost of waste collection marginally.

5.3 Option 3 - Advertising Waste/Recycling Container

Based on an all encompassing waste/recycling service by a contractor, YRT anticipates that there will be no cost to the Region. The contractor would be permitted to sell advertising space on the containers.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

If the Region chooses to install waste containers with advertising at bus stops, it will be necessary for YRT staff to consult with the local municipalities to discuss placement of these units. Special consideration might be necessary in heritage and specific streetscaped districts.

The local municipalities will benefit from the increased number of waste containers on the boulevards. Increasing the number of waste containers along municipal boulevards will reduce the amount of waste requiring pickup by staff or contractors.

7. CONCLUSION

YRT staff conclude from their evaluation of the three options that the waste/recycling container with advertising offers the most benefits to the Region. One container type will help create a standard look for transit facilities Region-wide, and on-street waste/recycling also offers a visible commitment to recycling by the Region and promotes waste diversion. The advertising revenue will allow a contractor to provide a complete service at no cost to the Region.

In discussion with rapid transit project staff, it has been agreed that the waste containers to be located at the BRT stations should have a look that is in keeping with the design theme for the other infrastructure, including shelters. York Consortium staff continue to refine the container design for the BRT stations. This design will be incorporated into the RFP document.

It is recommended that staff be authorized to issue a RFP for the design, supply, installation, maintenance and waste/recycling collection from advertising containers placed at all bus stops and facilities.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in this Clause is included with this report and is also on file in the Regional Clerk's office.)