

4

YORK REGION TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD

The Transit Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendation contained in the following report, September 24, 2008, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

1. This report be received for information.

2. PURPOSE

This report updates Regional Council on York Region Transit's Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card program for the first and second quarters of 2008 (see *Attachment 1* for 2008 Q1 and Q2 accumulated results).

3. BACKGROUND

Since 2005, York Region Transit (YRT) has used a Contractor Report Card program to record and score contractor performance

The report card provides staff with tools to monitor and report on the performance of the contractors that operate YRT and Viva services. The report card was introduced to Regional Council in September 2006, and is reported on a semi-annual basis.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

2008 Q1 AND Q2 CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD RESULTS OVERVIEW

YRT/Viva contractors continue to meet the Region's expectations overall

The report card scores the conventional and Viva contractors on 22 performance measures identified in the performance-based operations and maintenance contract. The results of the accumulated Q1 and Q2 Contractor Report Card indicate that all contractors are meeting the Region's performance expectations overall. Where contractors fall below standard on the individual performance measures, staff initiate corrective action and work

with the contractors to improve the deficient areas. The performance measures are described in detail in Table 1.

Table 1
Performance Standards

	Performance Standard	Measurement Period	Req.
1A	On-Time Departures <i>% of on-time vehicle observations; departing no later than 5:00 minutes after the scheduled departure time</i>	Quarterly	90 – 95%
1B	Operating Ahead of Schedule <i>% of not early vehicle observations; no vehicle shall depart before its scheduled departure time for any reason</i>	Quarterly	100%
1C	Missed Trips <i>% of not missed trip observations; vehicles departing more than 20:00 minutes late shall be considered a missed trip</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2A	Kilometres Between Road Calls <i>Average # of km per vehicle per in-service Road Call</i>	Quarterly	8,000 – 10,000 km
2B	In-Service Wheelchair Lift / Ramp Failures <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning wheelchair lifts / ramps</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2C	In-Service Air Conditioning / Heating <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning HVAC systems</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2D	Preventative Maintenance Inspections <i>% of incidences within 5,000 km PMI interval</i>	Quarterly	90 – 95%
2E	Accident Damage Repairs <i># of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles</i>	Quarterly	Repair allowance of 20 days
2F	In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations <i>% of vehicle observations without body damage</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2G	Exterior Bus Clean <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned exteriors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2H	Interior Bus Clean <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned interiors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
3A	CVOR <i>Commercial Vehicle Operator's Registration; status of carrier safety rating</i>	Annually	Satisfactory – unaudited
3B	Accidents <i>Average kilometres per vehicle per preventable accident</i>	Quarterly	150,000 – 200,000 km
4A	Customer Complaints² <i># of complaints per 100,000 passenger boardings</i>	Quarterly	10 – 15 complaints
4B	Customer Satisfaction Survey <i>(Biennial survey)</i>	Bi-Annually	70 – 90%
5A	Customer Service Training <i>1/3rd of bus operators to receive 24 hours of CUTA Ambassador Training per year; pass/fail</i>	Annually	33%
5B	Ongoing Bus Operator Training <i>% of bus operators to receive 16 hours of ongoing training and 1 hour wheelchair lift / ramp training; pass/fail</i>	Annually	90 - 95%
5C	Ongoing Diesel Technician Training <i>% of diesel technicians to receive 12 hours of ongoing training; pass/fail</i>	Annually	80 – 100%
5D	Destination Signs <i>% of vehicle observations with accurate / operational destination signs</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
5E	Bus Operator Appearance <i>% of vehicle observations with drivers in proper attire</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%

6A	Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets⁴ <i># of days late for all reports</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
6B	Accident / Incident Reports³ <i># of days beyond reporting allowance for all accidents</i>	Quarterly	

- Notes: 1. Average calculated using either three or four divisions, based on available date.
2. Customer complaints for Veolia do not include issues regarding schedule adherence or fare dispute.
3. Accident / Incident Reports to be submitted within 2 days of event.
4. Veolia is scored only on TW CARES Tickets.

The performance benchmarks determine whether or not the contractor exceeds, meets or falls below the standard

Each quarter, physical random checks of service schedule adherence and equipment are performed by YRT Operations Inspectors. In addition, data pertaining to vehicle maintenance, accident reports, responses to customer concerns and personnel training is provided to YRT by the contractors. This data is submitted on a daily, monthly and annual basis as specified in the performance-based contract. The results of the YRT random checks and data collection are compiled and used to score each of the 22 performance standards.

Each of the 22 performance standards has been assigned a benchmark score. Scores are illustrated by a percentage, percentage range, pass or fail. Scoring of the performance measures is done using 1, 2, or 3 scores, where:

1. Exceeds standard
Contractor's score is greater than the benchmark score.
2. Meets standard
Contractor's score is equal to, or falls within, the percentage range.
3. Below standard
Contractor's score is less than the benchmark score.

First Student (formerly Laidlaw Transit) ranks third amongst the three conventional contractors achieving a total overall score of 39

First Student operates the YRT conventional transit service in the Newmarket, King, Aurora, East Gwillimbury and Georgina areas (Division 2).

Performance measures scoring one (exceeding standard) or two (meeting standard) are listed in Table 2.

Table 2
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard (First Student)

Exceeding Standard	Meeting Standard
• On-Time Departures • In-service Air Conditioning/Heating • Missed Trips • Exterior Bus Clean • Destination Signs • Bus Operator Appearance - o In-Service Vehicle Damage	• In-service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration • Customer Complaints • Customer Satisfaction Survey • Preventative Maintenance Inspections

Performance measures scoring three (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 3.

Table 3
Performance Requirements Below Standard (First Student)

Below Standard
• Operating Ahead of Schedule • Kilometres Between Road Calls • Interior Bus Clean • Customer Service Training¹ • Ongoing Bus Operator Training¹ • Ongoing Diesel Technician Training¹ • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Accidents

Notes: 1. Training results are calculated annually based on the contract year.

Tokmakjian Transit ranks second overall achieving a total overall score of 36

Tokmakjian operates YRT's conventional transit service in the Vaughan and Richmond Hill areas (Division 4).

Performance measures scoring one (exceeding standard) or two (meeting standard) are listed in Table 4.

Table 4
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard (Tokmakjian)

Exceeding Standard	Meeting Standard
• Missed Trips • Exterior Clean • Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration • Exterior Bus Clean • Customer Complaints • Bus Operator Appearance - o On-Time Departures - o Kilometres Between Road Calls • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating Preventative Maintenance Inspections	• Customer Satisfaction Survey • Destination Sign • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Customer Service Training • Ongoing Bus Operator Training • Ongoing Diesel Technician Training

Performance measures scoring three (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 5.

Table 5
Performance Requirements Below Standard (Tokmakjian)

Below Standard
• Operating Ahead of Schedule • In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • Accidents • In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations • Interior Clean

Miller Transit ranks first overall achieving a total overall score of 31

Miller operates YRT's conventional transit service in the Markham and Richmond Hill area. (Division 1).

Performance measures scoring one (exceeding standard) or two (meeting standard) are listed in Table 6.

Table 6
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard (Miller)

Exceeding Standard	Meeting Standard
• Missed Trips • Kilometres Between Road Calls • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating • Customer Complaints • Bus Operator Appearance • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • On-Time Departures • In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • Accidents • Destination Sign	• Customer Satisfaction Survey • Ongoing Diesel Technician Training • In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations • Ongoing Bus Operator Training • Customer Service Training • Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration • Preventative Maintenance Inspections

Performance measures scoring three (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 7.

Table 7
Performance Requirements Below Standard (Miller)

Below Standard
• Operating Ahead of Schedule • Interior Clean • Exterior Bus Clean

Veolia Transportation scored one (exceeding standard) or two (meeting standard) in 81% of the performance measurements and achieved a total overall score of 31

Veolia operates the Viva bus rapid transit service. They are not ranked in comparison to the other three conventional bus operating contractors for various reasons, including:

- Buses are operated on an accelerated basis maintaining equal spacing between buses as opposed to adhering to a bus stop to bus stop schedule. Staff monitor the contractor schedule adherence from beginning and end points on routes, typically at terminals, through both physical observation and the Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) system.
- On-street operating conditions are somewhat different. Viva buses do not operate on the local road network and are only required to stop at Viva stations. These stations are spaced at approximately one kilometre apart. Conventional bus stops are typically spaced every 250-300 metres.

- Veolia is operating the BRT service only. They are not required to operate services such as shuttles and school specials.
- Veolia has had the advantage of operating with all new buses since 2005.

Performance measures scoring one (exceeding standard) or two (meeting standard) are listed in Table 8.

Table 8
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard (Veolia)

Exceeding Standard	Meeting Standard
• On-Time Departure • In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failure • Kilometres Between Road Calls • Missed Trips • In-service Air Conditioning/Heating • Preventative Maintenance Inspections • Accidents • Customer Complaints • Customer Satisfaction Survey • Customer Service Training • Ongoing Bus Operator Training • Ongoing Diesel Technician Training • Destination Sign • Bus Operator Appearance	• Exterior Bus Clean • Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration

Performance measures scoring three (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 9.

Table 9
Performance Requirements Below Standard (Veolia)

Below Standard
• Operating Ahead of Schedule • In-Service Vehicle Damage Observations • Interior Clean • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets

CORRECTIVE MEASURES

YRT staff continue to work with contractors to implement corrective measures to improve upon their overall performance

Current initiatives include:

- Monthly review of report card data by both Operations and Fleet sections of YRT.
- Development of fleet related technical instruction sheet processes and service criteria for contractors.
- Electronic vehicle maintenance tracking database being developed in-house (operational by Q4).
- Ensuring complete document control of defects found on vehicles by contractors. Currently, an inspection of 1/3 of the fleet's maintenance records is completed quarterly through a contract audit process.
- Additional meetings held with the contractors that focus solely on fleet-related issues. This includes a review of fleet maintenance and parts warranty issues, and mechanic training requirements.
- Audit pertaining to contractor hiring and operator training program and practices was completed in Q1 of 2008 with the following recommendations to be implemented:
 - o Develop standard Human Resource practices for driver recruitment, selection and hiring.
 - o Establish a standard personnel filing system for all contractors.
 - o YRT to become involved with setting training standards and implementing a training curriculum for new drivers.
 - o Increased participation in contractor's driver training by YRT staff.
- Continue to conduct monthly operations meetings with the contractors to discuss service issues, resource issues, and operator training requirements.
- Quarterly meetings of the Driver Training and Communications Team. The team is made up of YRT, Risk Management and contractor staff. The team's focus is on the development of training practices and procedures for the bus operators, "Safety First".

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Total incentives paid to the conventional bus operating contractors as of June 30, 2008 total \$104,300

Incentive payments are made to the conventional contractors based on data collected pursuant to the performance-based contract. This program is not currently applied to Veolia Transportation, the Viva operator. Each contractor has the opportunity to receive up to a total of \$144,000 in incentive payments during each contract year. Contractors receive incentives for individual performance standards when they exceed the minimum

range identified in the report card. Disincentives are levied against the contractor when they do not meet the minimum score.

Incentive payments made to the conventional contractors in 2008 are outlined in Table 10.

Table 10
Performance Payments to the Conventional Contractors

Contractor	2008 Incentives	2008 Disincentives	Total Payments to Contractors as of June 30, 2008
First Student	\$24,500	\$10,500	\$14,000*
Miller Transit	\$46,500	\$ 7,500	\$39,000*
Tokmakjian	\$62,000	\$10,700	\$51,300*

Notes: 1. Incentives/disincentives are calculated based on the contract year not a calendar year.

The dollars required for incentive payments to the contractor are included in the budget each year.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Transit customers from the local municipalities benefit from the Contractor Report Card Program through the continual monitoring of service, and the identification of areas in need of improvement. This ensures that customers will continue to receive quality public transit services.

7. CONCLUSION

The Contractor Report Card provides staff with another management tool to continually monitor the performance of transit operations and maintenance contractors, and identify opportunities for quality improvement.

The 2008 combined Q1 and Q2 Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card summary is attached as *Attachment 1*.

For more information on this report, please contact Ann-Marie Carroll, Assistant Manager, Operations, (Ext. 5677), of the Transit Branch of Transportation Services.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause is attached to this report.)