

## **18**

### **CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES BATHURST STREET TOWN OF NEWMARKET AND TOWNSHIP OF KING (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-06-08)**

**The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, June 7, 2006, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:**

#### **1. RECOMMENDATIONS**

It is recommended that:

1. The proposal of Morrison Hershfield Limited, in the upset limit amount of \$353,125, excluding GST, be accepted for the detailed design of Bathurst Street (Y.R. 38) from Mulock Drive (Y.R. 74) to Highway 9 (Y.R. 31), in the Town of Newmarket and Township of King.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

#### **2. PURPOSE**

This purpose of this report is to recommend the retention of a consulting engineering firm to carry out the detailed design of Bathurst Street from Mulock Drive to Highway 9 (*see Attachment 1*), in the Town of Newmarket and Township of King.

In compliance with the Region's Purchasing By-law, a report to Council is required prior to authorizing an award when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the award is not proposed to be made to the bidder with the lowest cost responsive bid.

#### **3. BACKGROUND**

Brief details of the project is provided below. The design of this project was included in the 2006 10-Year Road Construction Program.

The Environmental Study Report (ESR), Bathurst Street from Gamble Road to Highway 9 was approved by the Ministry of the Environment (MOE) on September 1, 2000. Various sections of Bathurst Street from Gamble Road to Mulock Drive have been constructed, are currently under construction, or are under detailed design for construction soon. The last section covered in the Class Environmental Assessment Study (Class EA Study), between Mulock Drive and Highway 9, is scheduled for construction

in 2008. Accordingly, the detailed design phase will proceed immediately upon award of the consulting assignment.

Bathurst Street between Mulock Drive and Highway 9 is a two-lane rural section with turning lanes at the intersecting roads. The proposed improvements include widening Bathurst Street to a four-lane urban road from Mulock Drive to Sykes Road and a five-lane urban section from Sykes Road to Highway 9.

#### **4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS**

In accordance with the Regional purchasing by-law, interested firms, as selected from Expression of Interest Nos. P-05-69, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of consultants, with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering, were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

##### **4.1 Evaluation Summary**

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

**Table 1**  
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary – Bathurst Street

| <b>Firm</b>              | <b>Technical Score<br/>(out of 80)</b> | <b>Upset Fee<br/>(Excluding GST)</b> | <b>Financial Score<br/>(out of 20)</b> | <b>Total Score<br/>(out of 100)</b> |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Morrison Hershfield Ltd. | 59.9                                   | \$353,125.00                         | 17.7                                   | 77.6                                |
| Giffels Associates Ltd   | 56.6                                   | \$366,041.00                         | 17.1                                   | 73.7                                |
| Stantec Consulting Ltd.  | 51.3                                   | \$312,750.00                         | 20.0                                   | 71.3                                |

The proposals from Giffels Associates Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited received comparable technical evaluations since both proposals fully met the requirements and expectations of the detailed design assignment. Their respective management qualifications were strong and their project team and implementation process also met expectations. Specifically, the proposals of Morrison Hershfield and Giffels expressed a thorough understanding of the issues, challenges, opportunities and requirements related to this assignment. The financial fee proposal from Morrison Hershfield Limited, however, is lower and their total score placed the firm in a position that the company be recommended to be engaged for the engineering assignment.

The proposal of Stantec Consulting Limited has the lowest price, but their technical score was considerably lower than the proposal of Morrison Hershfield Limited. The Morrison Hershfield Limited proposal therefore, ranked highest in the overall evaluation and represents the best value to the Region.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that Morrison Hershfield Limited be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Bathurst Street detail design assignment under Request for Proposal P-06-08.

## **5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

Funding for the project is included in the Region's 2006 10-Year Roads Construction Program. The 2006 Budget allocated for this project amounts to \$254,000, which is less than the award amount of \$353,125, but is adequate to cover anticipated 2006 expenditures. Hence, the difference will be requested in the 2007 Budget and Business plan.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. stage two archaeological assessments or additional public consultation, permits and approvals, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

## **6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT**

The project is required to address the transportation needs and accommodate growth in the Region and municipalities. The project will improve traffic safety and operations for the travelling public within the local road network.

## **7. CONCLUSION**

The detailed design assignment must be commenced to permit the improvements scheduled under the approved capital program proceed in a timely manner.

Consultants' proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Regional purchasing by-law and it is recommended that the assignment be awarded as outlined, since the proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

*(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the June 14, 2006 Committee meeting.)*