

13

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES BAYVIEW AVENUE ROAD IMPROVEMENTS TOWNS OF MARKHAM AND RICHMOND HILL PROJECTS 97000, 81420 AND 82740

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, August 26, 2005, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of McCormick Rankin Corporation be engaged to undertake the Engineering Services for the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for road improvements on Bayview Avenue (Y.R. 34) from south of John Street to north of Major Mackenzie Drive East (Y.R. 25) at a total upset limit fee of \$628,687.06, including GST.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement with McCormick Rankin Corporation for engineering services, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends the retention of consulting engineers to complete the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for road improvements on Bayview Avenue from south of John Street to north of Major Mackenzie Drive East.

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Project Description

The Region's transportation and roadway management strategies have identified future road network needs in the area of Bayview Avenue from south of John Street to north of Major Mackenzie Drive East. The traffic from major commercial and residential developments in the area, together with the increasing traffic from outside the project area has necessitated this study.

To address these needs, York Region's objectives for this project are, but not limited to, the following:

- Providing a roadway constructed to Regional standards that is capable of safely serving the existing and future travel needs of the area.
- Enhancing road user safety by improving the geometry and roadside environment of Bayview Avenue.
- Improving vehicle operation and easing traffic congestion in the corridor, in particular at intersections and property accesses.
- Augmenting incident management for ETR 407 and Highway 7 by improving vehicle operation in the corridor.
- Improving the strategic linkages between communities with York Region by systematically upgrading Bayview Avenue between Richmond Hill and Markham.
- Improving and developing transit service and accessibility to serve short and long term transit needs in the corridor, currently one of the busiest transit routes in the Region's Transit Priority Network.
- Improving and enhancing the roadside environment and connectivity to residences, schools, daycares, community centre, and transit stops to promote a friendly and safe environment for the high pedestrian traffic in the corridor.
- Assessing traffic patterns and alternative routes in the broader road network bounded by Steeles Ave. to the south, Stouffville Road to the north, Yonge St. to the west and Leslie Street to the east.
- Promoting local community activities such as cycling through complimentary Streetscaping and designated cycle paths.

3.2 Scope of Assignment

The scope of work for this assignment includes:

- A complete study of roadway improvements for Bayview Avenue from south of John Street to north of Major Mackenzie Drive East in accordance with all requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) document for municipal projects, prepared by the Municipal Engineers Association dated June 2000. The study shall be classified as a Schedule 'C' and be completed through to the end of Phase 4 as outlined in the Class EA document.
- Complete the study to meet the requirements of Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) as required and coordinate it with the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, under the concept of "one project – one assessment".

Complete the preliminary design of the project requirements, including all field investigations, reviews, relevant tests, inspections and studies, with due regard for environmental, traffic accommodation and safety concerns, capital cost and operating efficiency all in accordance with York Region standards, specifications and practices.

3.3 Project Phasing

The Region's 10 Year Road Construction Program for 2005 has identified the timing for the improvement works on Bayview Avenue as follows:

- ETR 407 to 16th Avenue 2007
- John Street to Highway 7 2011
- 16th Avenue to Major Mackenzie Drive East 2013

The anticipated schedule for the first stage of this work is as follows:

- Bayview Avenue Schedule 'C' Class Environmental Assessment (EA) – 2005/2006.
- Detailed Design (Stage 1) – 2006/2007.
- Construction (Stage 1) – 2007/2008.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Outcome of Evaluation of Proposals

In accordance with the Regional Purchasing By-law, Expressions of Interest (EOI) were received for this work in response to an appropriate advertisement in a publication of general circulation. All EOI's were reviewed and based on the results of the evaluation four firms were invited to submit a response to our Request for Proposal (RFP) document.

The four firms invited to submit written proposals for this assignment were as follows:

- McCormick Rankin Corporation
- URS Canada Inc.
- Delcan Corporation
- SNC-Lavalin Consulting Engineers & Constructors Inc.

All four consulting firms submitted a proposal in response to this RFP.

The Region used the "two envelope" evaluation process for this RFP, in which Technical/Management Proposals were opened and evaluated prior to the opening and evaluation of the corresponding Financial Proposals. The total weighting of the technical/management proposal is 80% and the total weighting of the financial proposal is 20%. This allocation of technical/management and financial will ensure that the assignment is awarded to a consultant that is very technically competent as well as cost competitive.

The technical proposals were evaluated based on the following technical criteria:

- Project Team Experience.
- Project Management.
- Project Implementation.

In accordance with the terms of the RFP, the financial proposals were opened only after Region staff agreed to the overall technical scores. After compliance of the financial proposals had been established, the overall proposal was evaluated based on a weighting

of 80% for the technical/management proposal and 20% for the financial proposal. The best proposal was deemed the one with the highest total score.

The consultant proposal evaluation summary is presented in Table 1 and includes the Technical Score, the Upset Limit Fee and corresponding Financial Score and the Total Score for each proponent.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Limit Fee Excluding GST	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
McCormick Rankin Corporation	70.1	\$ 628,687.06	14.8	84.9
Delcan Corporation	64.4	\$ 772,060.64	12.1	76.5
SNC-Lavalin Engineers and Constructors Inc.	57.2	\$ 632,742.36	14.7	71.9
URS Canada Inc.	48.4	\$ 464,979.20	20.0	68.4

The best overall (combination of technical and financial) proposal was received from McCormick Rankin Corporation as their proposal had the highest total score and represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

The proposal from McCormick Rankin received the highest technical score and featured a good combination of project management and technical staff with a firm corporate commitment of the necessary resources to complete this complex assignment. Their proposal presented a sound understanding of the unique project requirements and the sensitive environmental issues. In addition, their proposal elaborated on the significant involvement and communication that will be required with agencies and stakeholders and elaborated on the need to not only meet but also exceed the minimum requirements of the Municipal Class EA document. McCormick Rankin also developed a reasonable and achievable project work plan and schedule that focused on project delivery and milestone deliverables and highlighted the importance of coordination and communication.

The fee proposal from McCormick Rankin ranks second lowest, however, is a more realistic estimate of the financial commitment required to properly address all of the stakeholders' needs and RFP requirements within a realistic time frame.

The Supplies and Services Branch has reviewed the evaluation summary and has issued their internal report confirming that McCormick Rankin Corporation be recommended as the successful overall proponent for this assignment.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the work is \$ 628,687.06, including GST.

There are sufficient funds in the Region's 2005 Roads Capital Budget and Ten-Year Program for this assignment.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e., stage two archaeological assessments or additional public consultation, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

There are no local municipal implications associated with this report.

The Bayview Avenue road improvement will be constructed in the Towns of Markham and Richmond Hill. The project will improve traffic safety and operations for the travelling public within the local road network. It will also support continued growth within the Towns of Markham and Richmond Hill.

Throughout the Class EA, Regional staff will work closely with staff from the Towns of Markham and Richmond Hill to accommodate their requirements in the Class EA and preliminary design.

7. CONCLUSION

Consultants' proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, by-laws and practices. The proposal submitted by McCormick Rankin addressed all of the requirements for this assignment, including qualified and knowledgeable personnel, and proposed a sound methodology to complete this assignment. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.