12

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES LESLIE STREET PUMPING STATION AUTOMATION TOWN OF MARKHAM, PROJECT 79890

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, August 25, 2005, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of MacViro Consultants Inc. be engaged to undertake the Engineering Services for an Assessment, Design and Construction for the automation of the Leslie Street Pumping Station located on the east side of Leslie Street north of Steeles Avenue at a total upset limit fee of $548,980.00 excluding GST.

2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement with MacViro Consultants Inc. for the Engineering Services, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends the retention of consulting engineers to complete the engineering services for the Assessment, Design and Construction for the Automation of the Leslie Street Pumping Station. The site is located on the east side of Leslie Street north of Steeles Avenue.

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Project Description

The Leslie Street Pumping Station design and operation has been reviewed and upgraded over the last several years in order to improve station reliability. As part of this process, The Leslie Street Pumping Station Electrical Control System Evaluation report identified the need to upgrade the control equipment and technology in the pumping station to improve the reliability and efficiency of the operation. To address these needs, York Region's objectives for this project include:

- Replacing existing electrical relay based technology with RPU controls.
- Revise generator set operation to include rationalized operation.

- Implement a fully automated operating system.
- Installing additional pumping and surge suppression equipment.

3.2 Scope of Assignment

The scope of work for this assignment includes:

- Assess various methods of implementing improvements to the station based on current technologies and equipment.
- Prepare a pre-design report to implement the improvements. The Leslie Street Pumping Station is the largest pumping station on the York Durham Sewage System. Due to the significance of this station it is paramount that continuous operation of the pumping station is ensured. The pre-design report will include sequencing and staging plans to ensure that the pumping station remains operational during all stages of this project.
- Prepare detailed design.
- Prepare tender documents and specifications. Some of the works have been identified as being required in the short term. In order to expedite those items, the work will be tendered in two contracts.
- Prepare revised Operations Manuals, Process and Control Narratives, and Maintenance Manuals.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Outcome of Evaluation of Proposals

In accordance with the Purchasing By-law, Expressions of Interest (EOI) were received for this work in response to an appropriate advertisement in a publication of general circulation. All EOI's were reviewed and based on the results of the evaluation three firms were invited to submit a response to our Request for Proposal (RFP) document.

The three firms invited to submit written proposals for this assignment were as follows:

- AWS Engineers and Planners Corp.
- Eramosa Engineering Inc.
- MacViro Consultants Inc.

All three consulting firms submitted a technical proposal in response to this RFP.

The Region used the "two envelope" evaluation process for this RFP, in which Technical/ Management Proposals were opened and evaluated prior to the opening and evaluation of the corresponding Financial Proposals. The total weighting of the technical/management proposal is 80% and the total weighting of the financial proposal is 20%. This allocation of technical/management and financial will ensure that the assignment is awarded to not only a technically competent consultant but also a cost competitive consultant.

The technical proposals were evaluated based on the following technical criteria:

- Project Team Experience.
- Project Understanding.
- Approach and Methodology.
- Project Timing and Schedule.

In accordance with the terms of the RFP, the financial proposals were opened only after Region staff agreed to the overall technical scores. Proponents were required to achieve a technical score of 50 out of 80 in the technical component. After compliance of the financial proposals had been established, the overall proposal was evaluated based on a weighting of 80% for the technical/management proposal and 20% for the financial proposal. The best proposal was deemed the one with the highest total score.

The consultant proposal evaluation summary is presented in Table 1 and includes the Technical Score, the Upset Limit Fee and corresponding Financial Score and the Total Score for each proponent.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Limit Fee Excluding GST	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
MacViro Consultants	59.5	$548,980.00	20.0	79.5
Eramosa Engineering	50.3	$935,969.25	11.7	62.0
AWS Engineers*	57.6	N/A	N/A	N/A

*Proposal Rejected

MacViro Consultants was ranked highest on the technical portion of the proposal. The MacViro Consultants technical proposal had a good combination of project management, technical staff and specialists with a firm corporate commitment of the necessary resources to complete this complex assignment.

The best overall (combination of technical and financial) proposal was received from MacViro Consultants as their proposal had the highest total score and represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

A post closing addendum was issued to all three consultants requesting a revised financial proposal be submitted by August 22nd, 2005 at 1:00 p.m. in order to provide better detail of the service pricing. The original envelopes were returned to each proponent unopened. AWS Engineers and Planners Corporation failed to submit the revised financial proposal. The Bid Review Committee, (composed of staff of the Transportation and Works Department and Legal Services and Supplies and Services

Branches met and determined their proposal could not be fairly compared with the two proposals that met the deadline. Accordingly, the AWS Engineers and Planners proposal was rejected.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the work is $548,980.00 plus GST.

There are sufficient funds in the 2005 budget for the assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project will improve reliability, efficiency and maintenance requirements for the Leslie Street Pumping Station on the York Durham Sewage System. It will also support continued growth within the Towns of Markham, Richmond Hill and the City of Vaughan.

7. CONCLUSION

The consultants' proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, by-laws and practices. The proposal submitted by MacViro Consultants Inc. addressed all of the requirements for this assignment, including qualified and knowledgeable personnel, and proposed a sound methodology to complete this assignment. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The consulting engineering firm of MacViro Consultants Inc. be engaged to carry out the engineering services for the assessment, design and construction for improvements to the Leslie Street Pumping Station at an upset limit fee of $548,980.00 excluding GST.

This report has been reviewed by the Senior Management Group.