

11

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES NORTH RICHMOND HILL ELEVATED TANK AND WATERMAINS TOWN OF RICHMOND HILL PROJECTS 76100 AND 76230

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, August 25, 2005, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of KMK Consultants Limited be engaged to undertake the Environmental Assessment (EA), detailed design and contract administration for the construction of the North Richmond Hill Elevated Tank and watermain at an upset limit of \$1,053,000.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary formal agreement with KMK Consultants Limited for the completion of these services, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report is provided in order to obtain Council authorization to retain consulting engineering services related to the construction of the North Richmond Hill Elevated Tank and watermain.

3. BACKGROUND

The Long-Term Water Master Plan (2004) has identified the requirement for an elevated tank and watermain to provide additional water servicing to Pressure District 9.

It is estimated that construction will commence in December 2006 and the works will be commissioned in December 2007.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

The project includes:

- Project 76100 – Construction of an elevated tank and watermain – The tank with a top water level of 360.3 metres requiring approximately 60 metres times 60 metres of

land and 300-millimetre diameter watermain connecting the elevated tank to the 500-millimetre diameter concrete pressure pipe (CPP) Regional watermain on Yonge Street (project 76230, below). This work will require a “Schedule B” EA. The tank is to be placed within the Study Area shown in *Attachment 1*.

- Project 76230 – Construction of approximately 2.3 kilometres of 500-millimetre diameter CPP Regional watermain on Yonge Street from Jefferson Sideroad to Lake Avenue connecting the Regional watermain along Jefferson Sideroad (currently under construction) to the Town watermains at Lake Avenue. This work will require a “Schedule A” EA.

York Region is interested in obtaining a consultant to provide full engineering services relating to the projects above to satisfy the requirements of the EA, detailed design and contract administration phases.

4.1 Expression of Interest (EOI)

A Request for Qualification for Engineering Services, P-04-61, closed on July 15, 2004. Expressions of Interest were received from nine firms. Table 1, below, summarizes the results of the EOI evaluation.

Table 1
Expression of Interest Evaluation Results

Firms	EOI Score
MacViro Consultants Inc.	78
KMK Consultants Limited	77
AWS Engineers & Planners Corp.	60
CH2M Hill Canada Limited	54
Clean Water Engineering Company Limited	54
Totten Sims Hubucki Associates	52
Earth Tech Canada Inc.	44
Stantec Consulting Limited	43
Cole Engineering Group Ltd.	42

Three firms were above the cut-off mark of 60: KMK Consultants Limited, AWS Engineers & Planners Corp. and MacViro Consultants Inc. Only these three firms were considered qualified to submit proposals.

4.2 Request for Proposals

Request for Proposal P-05-43 invited KMK Consultants Limited, AWS Engineers & Planners Corporation and MacViro Consultants Limited to submit proposals. Proposals were received from all three firms.

The proposals were evaluated using the two envelope system – with technical and financial information kept in separate envelopes. The technical proposal is judged prior to

any knowledge of financial bids. Technical content is weighted at 60% and a proponent must achieve a minimum competency (40 out of 60) to progress to the financial evaluation. The technical evaluation was based on the following criteria:

- Project Team Experience.
- Project Understanding.
- Approach and Methodology.
- Project Management Approach.
- Quality Assurance and Quality Control.

The financial evaluation composes the remaining 40% weight of the total evaluation. All of the proposals received at least 40 out of 60 on the technical evaluation, therefore all of the financial proposals were opened. The technical and financial results are summarized below in Table 2.

Table 2
Request for Proposal Evaluation Results

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 60)	Upset Fee (No GST)	Financial Score (Out of 40)	Total Score (Out of 100)
KMK Consultants Limited	47.5	\$1,053,000	40.0	87.5
MacViro Consultants Inc.	45.6	\$1,129,378	37.3	82.9
AWS Engineers & Planners Corp.	40.8	\$1,101,900	38.2	79.0

The firm with the best score was KMK Consultants Limited with an upset limit of \$1,053,000.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee provided in the proposal is \$1,053,000.

The sensitive and complex nature of the project including extensive public consultation and potential added complexities such as dewatering, have the potential to increase project costs. The upset limit fee is based on predefined scope of services and unit prices. Therefore, many of the consulting cost items will be prorated as they are expected to vary as the project scope becomes clearer. This was done in order to bind the proponents to competitive unit prices for extra work that would arise from scope changes dependent on the outcome of the environmental assessment.

There are sufficient funds identified in the 2005 capital budget to cover all expenditures in 2005.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

This project will provide additional water supply servicing to the community of North Richmond Hill by 2008 to satisfy the needs of population growth.

The North Richmond Hill locality is mainly a family-oriented residential area that also contains pockets of environmentally sensitive areas. The EA phase in this area is expected to be of interest, as it will incorporate the selection of a suitable location for the elevated tank.

Traffic control for the watermain along Yonge Street will require extra awareness as this major street is subject to high volumes of traffic during construction hours.

If dewatering is required, special permits involving extensive monitoring will be necessary, adding to the expense of the project and duration of the project. If the monitoring suggests that there is influence on privately owned wells, the cost of mitigation will be accounted for as well.

7. CONCLUSION

The consultant's proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy. It is recommended that the consulting engineering firm KMK Consultants Limited be engaged to undertake the EA, detailed design and contract administration relating to construction of the North Richmond Hill Elevated Tank and watermains at an upset limit of \$1,053,000.

In anticipation of the possibilities for cost increases, many of the consulting cost items have been prorated as they are expected to vary as the project scope becomes clearer. This was done in order to bind the proponents to competitive prices for extra work that would arise from scope changes dependent on the outcome of the environmental assessment.

Furthermore, it is recommended that appropriate Regional officials be authorized to take all necessary steps to execute a formal agreement with KMK Consultants Limited for the completion of these services.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the September 7, 2005 Committee meeting.)