

19

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES 2ND CONCESSION ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT GREEN LANE TO QUEENSVILLE SIDEROAD, TOWN OF EAST GWILLIMBURY

(Regional Council at its meeting on June 19, 2008 amended this Clause by adding the following recommendation:

- 3. *The consultants to involve and consult with the Town of Newmarket throughout the Environmental Assessment process.)***

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, May 29, 2008, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting firm of McCormick Rankin Corporation be engaged to undertake the Engineering Services for the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for Road Improvements to the 2nd Concession (Y.R. 34) in the Town of East Gwillimbury, and such other services as may be deemed appropriate, not to exceed an upset limit cost of \$1,028,350.00, excluding GST.
2. The Regional Chair and the Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary contract with McCormick Rankin Corporation, subject to the approval of the General Manager of the Roads Branch and review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends the retention of consulting engineers to complete the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) and Preliminary Design for improvements to the 2nd Concession between Green Lane and Queensville Sideroad.

3. BACKGROUND

The location of the study is depicted in *Attachment 1*. On September 1, 2006, Regional Council approved the assumption of the 2nd Concession from the north limit of Green Lane to the north limit of Queensville Sideroad, in the Town of East Gwillimbury.

2nd Concession, within the project limits, is an existing 2-lane north-south road with a rural cross section and posted speed which varies from 60 to 70 km/hr.

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (June 2006) indicates that York Region will experience significant growth in population and employment. By 2031, the population of York Region is anticipated to be 1,500,000 with employment of 780,000. Prior to the release of the Growth Plan in June 2006, York Region and the Town of East Gwillimbury had developed community plans for Queensville (OPA 89), Sharon (OPA 122), and Holland Landing (OPA 60), as a means of planning for future population and employment growth in these areas.

York Region's transportation and roadway management strategies have identified future road network needs in the area of the 2nd Concession corridor between Green Lane and Queensville Sideroad. Accordingly, York Region's latest approved 10 Year Roads Construction Program has scheduled the implementation of improvement works on 2nd Concession from Green Lane to Doane Road in 2014.

As a result, York Region requires the satisfactory completion of all requirements of a Class Environmental Assessment Study for the anticipated 2nd Concession improvements in the study area.

A key feature along this corridor is the Rogers Reservoir, which is part of the Regional Greenlands System and includes a provincially significant wetland. The site is a great place to watch nesting birds and participate in recreational activities, including fishing, hiking, and cycling along the Nokiidaa Trail system. This area also includes remnants of the abandoned canal, lock and swing bridge originally constructed in 1922 to accommodate shipping between Newmarket and Lake Simcoe.

It should be noted that this construction year might change in future 10 Year Road Construction Programs.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

Consultants were shortlisted

In accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms as selected from the Request for Quotation No. P-07-43, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of three consultants with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Three proposals were evaluated

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the technical proposal and the fee proposal to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The financial proposal envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a financial score and then weighted along with the technical score to determine the total score.

McCormick Rankin Corporation Received Highest Total Score for their Proposal

The proponents, their technical scores, proposed upset limit fees (financial scores and total scores) are tabulated in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Limit Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)
McCormick Rankin Corporation	64.2	\$1,028,350.00	14.3	78.5
Dillon Consulting Limited	57.2	\$1,002,463.00	14.7	71.9
UMA Engineering Limited	46.5	\$737,136.00	20.0	66.5

The technical proposals from Dillon Consulting Limited, McCormick Rankin Corporation and UMA Engineering Limited were evaluated based on the evaluation criteria summarized in the Request for Proposal P-08-41.

The technical proposal from McCormick Rankin Corporation received the highest technical score because it was the most thorough and illustrated better understanding of the key issues and details of the complex and challenging 2nd Concession Project. The distinguishing elements of the McCormick Ranking Corporation included:

- Superior project manager and key staff.
- Well detailed budget development and control mechanisms.
- Quality control of services.
- Superior project understanding/scope.

The technical proposal from Dillon Consulting Limited scored marginally lower and the technical proposal from UMA Engineering Limited scored significantly lower than the technical proposal from McCormick Rankin Corporation. These technical proposals were scored lower because they were not as thorough in the areas of project planning, staff /subconsultant allocation and control, work plans and methodology and deliverables. The lower scores in these areas represents an incremental risk for scope of work changes compared with the other proposal.

The financial proposals from both Dillon Consulting Limited and McCormick Rankin Corporation were within approximately 2.5% of each other. The financial proposal from UMA Engineering Limited was considerably lower than the other proponents' financial proposals. UMA Engineering Limited's much lower technical score indicates that their project understanding and knowledge of the complexity of this assignment provides a high probability for budget increases.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that McCormick Rankin Corporation be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the 2nd Concession environmental assessment assignment under Request for Proposal P-08-41.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the environmental assessment and preliminary design for improvements to the 2nd Concession is \$1,028,350.00, excluding GST.

There are sufficient funds in the 2008 budget for this assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Road improvements to the 2nd Concession between Green Lane and Queensville Sideroad will address anticipated future transportation servicing deficiencies in York Region, specifically in the Town of East Gwillimbury.

Upgrading this road to the Regional standards will provide a strong backbone to support the current and planned developments along this corridor, and the anticipated increase in level of traffic that will be generated.

Throughout the course of this assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Town of East Gwillimbury to accommodate local municipal requirements.

7. CONCLUSION

Three proposals for the provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal from McCormick Rankin Corporation represents the best overall value to York Region as it achieved the highest total score

It is recommended that the assignment for Class Environmental Assessment on 2nd Concession from Green Lane to Queensville Sideroad be awarded to McCormick Rankin Corporation as successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-08-41.

For more information on this report, please contact Paul Jankowski, General Manager, Roads Branch at Extension 5901.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the June 11, 2008 Committee meeting.)