

18

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES ST. JOHN'S SIDEROAD DETAILED DESIGN TOWNS OF AURORA AND WHITCHURCH-STOUFFVILLE (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-08-22)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, May 29, 2008, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting firm of Giffels Associates Limited be engaged to undertake the Detailed Design for Road Improvements on St. John's Sideroad (Y.R. 26) from Bayview Avenue to Woodbine Avenue in the Towns of Aurora and Whitchurch-Stouffville as outlined in this report, at an upset limit cost of \$772,942, excluding G.S.T.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to execute the contract, subject to the review by Legal Services, as to form and content

2. PURPOSE

This report seeks Council authorization to engage a qualified consulting engineering firm to carry out the detailed design for road improvements to St. John's Sideroad from Bayview Avenue to Woodbine Avenue in the Towns of Aurora and Whitchurch-Stouffville (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with York Region's Purchasing By-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

York Region's Transportation Master Plan 2002 identified transportation network improvement requirements for St. John's Sideroad between Yonge Street and Woodbine Avenue to be phased in during the period 2002-2011. Specifically, the road improvements were identified as follows:

- St. John's Sideroad from Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue: Widening to four lanes.

- St. John's Sideroad from Bayview Avenue to Woodbine Avenue: Reconstructing the road to two paved lanes.

The 2008 10 Year Roads Capital Program schedules the implementation of improvement works on St. John's Sideroad between Bayview Avenue and Woodbine Avenue for the year 2016.

Project receives Environment Assessment Clearance to proceed in 2000

A Class Environmental Assessment Study for the improvements on St. John's Sideroad from Bathurst Street to Woodbine Avenue was completed in August 1999 and received Environment Assessment clearance in late 2000 to proceed to detailed design and construction.

York Region initiated the Implementation Phase of the overall Class EA planning process in 2004 with the detailed design and construction of the four-lane widening of St. John's Sideroad from Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue, which was completed in 2006.

St. John's Sideroad between Bayview Avenue and Woodbine Avenue

St. John's Sideroad between Bayview Avenue and Woodbine Avenue is a two-lane rural roadway running east-west within the Towns of Aurora and Whitchurch-Stouffville, a distance of approximately four kilometres, and is situated immediately south of the mostly urbanized Town of Newmarket. The road intersects with the major regional roads (Bayview Avenue, Leslie Street, and Woodbine Avenue), local road (Mavrinac Boulevard, just east of Bayview Avenue) and crosses over Highway 404 via a grade separation under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Transportation.

Two significant watercourses, both tributaries to the East Holland River, cross St. John's Sideroad just east of Bayview Avenue and immediately west of Leslie Street.

The York Region Official Plan designates lands at the west end of the corridor, between Bayview Avenue and the new local road, Mavrinac Boulevard, as Urban Area where development is now emerging.

East of Mavrinac Boulevard to Highway 404, the land is designated as Rural Policy Area. The Town of Aurora is currently undertaking servicing studies for these lands (known as Area 2C) for future secondary plan studies to satisfy Regional requirements for the incorporation of these lands into the Urban Area boundary.

East of Highway 404, the lands are identified as Agricultural Area and also lie within the Greenbelt area known as "Protected Countryside".

St. John's Sideroad is in Current Need of Upgrade to Regional Standards

The two-lane roadway is generally in poor condition and the roadway and intersection geometrics are deficient, with certain sections in urgent need of full pavement rehabilitation. With the expanding area of urban development encroaching from the west, south and north, the number of vehicles travelling along St. John's Sideroad has increased. In recognition of the expanding arterial function of St. John's Sideroad, the road was transferred to York Region in 1996. However, the existing roadway geometrics do not meet the current standard for Regional Roads.

The major objectives of this project are to improve existing traffic flow on St. John's Sideroad from Bayview to Woodbine, improve operational efficiency of the intersections and provide capacity for future traffic growth, improve safety, and bring the roadway up to current Regional Standards.

Enhanced Detailed Design to Incorporate New Regional Policies and Guidelines and Provincial Legislation since 2000

Since the completion of the Environmental Assessment in 1999, new legislation, regulations, policies, standards and guidelines have been introduced by the Province of Ontario and York Region that will have an influence on this project, which include but are not limited to the following:

- The Regional Streetscape Policy (2001).
- The Greenbelt Act and the Greenbelt Plan (2005).
- York Region Traffic Noise Mitigation Policy (2006).
- Ontario Regulation 179/06 (under the Conservation Authorities Act) – Lake Simcoe Region Conservation Authority: Regulation of Development, Interference with Wetlands and Alterations to Shorelines and Watercourses (2006).
- York Region Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan (Draft – 2007).
- York Region Road Design Guidelines (2008).

York Region's Request for Proposal P-08-22 incorporated requirements to address all of the above in the scope for this project.

Project team will be coordinating with key stakeholders

This assignment will include coordination with various key stakeholders, including the following:

- Town of Aurora.
- Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.
- Ministry of Transportation.
- Lake Simcoe Region Conservation Authority.
- Utility companies.
- Property owners along the corridor.

- Local developers.

Potential to Advance the 10 Year Roads Construction Program Year

Previously, the approved 10 year Roads Construction Programs for 2006 and earlier had indicated that improvements to this section of St. John's Sideroad would be implemented in 2009, consistent with the Transportation Master Plan (2002).

For York Region's 2007 Budget and Business planning process, a Reprioritization of the 10 Year Roads Construction Program was undertaken based on revised criteria of prioritizing projects as approved by Council. As a result, the road improvements for St. John's Sideroad previously targeted for 2009 were postponed to 2016.

Due to the current need for major rehabilitation of the pavement structure and the current and planned development along this corridor, senior management has authorized the commencement of detailed design for this project, to allow for the feasibility of earlier implementation, pending the upcoming review and possible revision of the 2009 10 Year Roads Construction Program.

Advancing the detailed design process will allow the Region to begin acquiring property, securing regulatory and relocating utilities as early as possible in advance of construction. The Region will also have the opportunity to advance the construction timing by several years, thereby avoiding the throw-away expenditures for temporary repairs on St. John's Sideroad, which are expected to increase. This approach is consistent with the recommendations of York Region's Transportation Master Plan.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

Consultants were shortlisted

In accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms as selected from the Expression of Interest No. P-05-69, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of three consultants with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Three proposals were evaluated

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.

- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

Giffels Associates Limited Received Highest Overall Score for their Proposal

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)	Dollars Per Technical Point
Giffels Associates Limited	52.6	\$772,942.00	20.0	72.6	\$14,694.71
Morrison Hershfield Limited	52.7	\$845,034.00	18.3	71.0	\$16,034.80
Delcan Corporation	58.2	\$1,290,330.29	12.0	70.2	\$22,170.62

The technical proposals from Delcan Corporation, Giffels Associates Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited were evaluated based on the evaluation criteria summarized in the Request for Proposal P-08-22.

The technical proposal from Delcan Corporation received the highest technical score because it featured a comprehensive project plan and illustrated a very good understanding of the key issues and details of the Project.

The technical proposals from Giffels Associates Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited received lower scores because they were not as thorough in their discussion of project deliverables and in their discussion of project issues, work plan and methodology.

The Giffels Associates Limited proposal provided the lowest upset limit and therefore received full allotment of points for their financial proposal. The combination of both technical and financial scores resulted in this firm receiving the highest total score.

As the total scores of the proposals were within five points of each other, the proposals were further evaluated using “dollar cost methodology” following York Region’s Purchasing By-law.

Further analysis of the proposals and the unit costs per technical point verified that the Giffels Associates proposal, with the lowest cost per technical point, represented the best value to York Region.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that Giffels Associates Limited be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the St. John’s Sideroad detailed design assignment under Request for Proposal P-08-22.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the detailed design and contract preparation for the St. John’s Sideroad road improvement project is \$772,942.00, excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in York Region’s approved 10 Year Roads Construction Program.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity such as exposing underground utilities, public meetings or workshops, review of contractor submissions during construction, quantity breakdown sheets, and additional requirements for watercourse crossings. The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by York Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Road improvements to St. John’s Sideroad between Bayview Avenue and Woodbine Avenue will address transportation servicing deficiencies in York Region; and specifically, in the Towns of Aurora and Whitchurch-Stouffville.

Upgrading this road to the regional standard will provide a strong backbone to support the current and planned developments along this corridor, and the anticipated increase in level of traffic that will be generated.

Throughout the course of this assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Towns of Aurora and Whitchurch-Stouffville to accommodate local municipal requirements.

7. CONCLUSION

York Region's Transportation Master Plan identified transportation needs within the St. John's Sideroad corridor and the 2008 10 Year Roads Construction Program schedules improvements for 2016.

A Class Environmental Study for the road improvements on St. John's Sideroad from Yonge Street to Woodbine Avenue received clearance to proceed to delivery from the Ministry of Environment in 2000.

The improvements for the section of St. John's Sideroad between Bayview Avenue and Woodbine Avenue will complete the implementation phase of the environmental assessment process, which commenced in 2004 with the four-lane widening of St. John's Sideroad from Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue.

A detailed design of St. John's Sideroad to upgrade the two-lane roadway to regional standards including road and intersection geometrics improvements is required for implementation of this project.

To promote timely and cost-effective delivery of this project, detailed design services are required to be retained by York Region.

Three proposals for the provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal from Giffels Associates Limited represents the best overall value to York Region.

It is recommended that the assignment for detailed design be awarded to Giffels Associates Limited as successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-08-22.

For more information on this report, please contact Paul Jankowski, General Manager - Roads Branch at Extension 5901.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the June 11, 2008 Committee meeting.)