

17

CONSULTANT SELECTION ENGINEERING SERVICES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT DESIGN AND CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION CONSTRUCTION YONGE STREET WATERMAINS PROJECTS 70360, 71240, AND 75140

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, June 2, 2005, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Trow Associates Inc. be engaged to undertake the environmental assessment, detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision for the construction of the Yonge Street (Y.R. 1) Watermains, from Batson Drive in Aurora to Savage Road North in Newmarket, from Mulock Drive (Y.R.74)to Eagle Street (Y.R. 5) and along Eagle Street (Y.R. 5) from Yonge Street (Y.R. 1) to Peevers Crescent, at an upset limit cost of \$638,014.25 including GST.
2. The Commissioner of Transportation and Works be authorized to execute the necessary engineering contracts.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to engage qualified consultants as soon as possible to ensure timely completion of Regional water works in the Town of Newmarket. This report recommends the retention of consulting engineering firms to carry out the Environmental Assessment, detailed design, contract administration, and full-time site supervision services for the construction of the Yonge Street watermains in the Town of Newmarket.

3. BACKGROUND

The Long Term Water Master Plan (2004) has identified the requirement for watermains to convey water from the Aurora Central Zone into the Newmarket Central Zone and strengthen the Newmarket Central Zone by supplying water to the Kirby Reservoir. The project includes:

- Project 70360 - Approximately 2750m of 600mm diameter Concrete Pressure Pipe (CPP) watermain connecting at the southern end of the project to an existing 200mm diameter PVC Town of Aurora watermain at Yonge Street and to the 300mm diameter PVC Town of Aurora watermain on Batson Drive. The connection at the

northern end is to the proposed 600mm diameter CPP Regional watermain stub at Yonge Street and Savage Road North and to the existing local watermain on Yonge Street and Savage Road. (*see Attachment 1*)

- Project 75140 - Approximately 1000m of 600mm diameter CPP watermain connecting at the southern end to the 600mm diameter CPP Regional watermain at Yonge Street and Mulock Drive. The connection at the northern end is to the existing Town of Newmarket watermain at Eagle Street and to the proposed 600mm diameter CPP Regional watermain (71240) stub at Yonge Street and Eagle Street. (*see Attachment 2*)
- Project 71240 - Approximately 670m of 600mm diameter watermain connecting at the southern end to the proposed 600mm diameter CPP Regional watermain (75140) at Yonge Street and Eagle Street. The connection at the northern end of the project is the existing Town of Newmarket watermain at Eagle Street and Peevers Crescent. (*see Attachment 3*)

The watermain will all be constructed in the road right of way with a total of four stream crossings for the three watermain. A Schedule B Class Environmental Assessment will be required.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Submission of Proposals

The following nine firms submitted written proposals in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) issued on March 18, 2005, for the construction of the Yonge Street watermain:

- Chisholm, Fleming and Associates
- KMK Consultants Limited
- MacViro Consultants Limited
- Marshall Macklin Monaghan
- Mitchell Hatt and Associates
- Stantec Consulting Limited
- The Municipal Infrastructure Group
- TSH Associates Limited
- Trow Associates Incorporated

The RFP for the construction of the Yonge Street watermain, was issued as an open invitation through an advertisement in the Daily Commercial News.

4.2 Proposal Evaluation

The submission deadline for technical and price proposals was April 14, 2005. The technical proposals were evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team qualifications.
- Project implementation (including project understanding, approach and methodology, project management approach and quality assurance and quality control).

The financial proposals were opened once the technical evaluations were complete and the prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures. Only proposals attaining the minimum technical score of 40 out of 60 had the financial envelopes opened. The evaluation results are summarized in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Construction of Yonge Street Watermains

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 60)	Upset Fee (including GST)	Financial Score (Out of 40)	Total Score (Out of 100)
Trow Associates Incorporated	41.5	\$638,014	40.0	81.5
MacViro Consultants Limited	43.6	708,245	36.0	79.6
The Municipal Infrastructure Group	42.5	694,977	36.7	79.2
Marshall Macklin Monaghan	45.2	791,800	32.2	77.4
KMK Consultants Limited	42.2	816,891	31.2	73.4
TSH Associates Limited	37.3	--	--	--
Stantec Consulting Limited	38.5	--	--	--
Mitchell Hatt and Associates	31.2	--	--	--
Chisholm, Fleming and Associates	34.7	--	--	--

The proposal by Trow Associates Inc. provided a good overall understanding of the project, demonstrated strong team experience on similar type projects, and included a sound approach and methodology consistent with the project requirements.

The Trow Associates Inc. proposal ranked highest in the overall evaluation and on balance, represents the best value to The Regional Municipality of York.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fees for the project is \$638,014.25.

The fee for the contract administration services for this project was based on the assumed contract duration of 50 weeks.

The consultant quoted on the contract administration based on the assumed duration. The proposals provided the Region with a “per-week” cost to establish a pro-rata cost if the

contract varies from the assumed durations and approvals for any adjustments would be obtained through a Council approved process.

Sufficient funds are included in the 2005 Budget and Business Plan for this assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The construction of the Yonge Street watermain will convey water from the Aurora Central Zone into the Newmarket Central Zone and strengthen the Newmarket Central Zone by supplying water to the Kirby Reservoir. Typical traffic delays and construction impacts may be encountered along Yonge Street in various locations during construction of the watermain.

7. CONCLUSION

The proposal by Trow Associates Inc. is proposed as the preferred proposal for the construction of the Yonge Street watermain. The proposal represents the best overall value to the Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachments referred to in this clause were included in the agenda for the June 15, 2005 Committee meeting.)