13
CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES

BATHURST STREET WATERMAIN AND ROAD RECONSTRUCTION IN THE TOWNS OF AURORA AND NEWMARKET

PINE VALLEY SEWAGE PUMPING STATION IN THE CITY OF VAUGHAN

BAYVIEW AVENUE ROAD RECONSTRUCTION IN THE TOWNS OF AURORA AND NEWMARKET

PROJECTS 70130, 80620, 77400, 73020, 73700 AND 9666

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, June 2, 2004, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Municipal Infrastructure Group be engaged to undertake the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA), detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision for the Bathurst Street Watermain from the Northwest Elevated Tank in Aurora to the West Newmarket Reservoir and the detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision of the Bathurst Street (Y.R. 38) road reconstruction from Wellington Street (Y.R. 15) to Mulock Drive (Y.R. 74) as outlined in this report, at an upset limit cost of $713,954.00 excluding GST.

2. The consulting engineering firm of KMK Consultants Limited be engaged to undertake the contract administration and full time site supervision for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station in the City of Vaughan as outlined in this report, at an upset limit cost of $230,270.00, excluding GST.

3. The consulting engineering firm of NCE Limited be engaged to carry out the detail design and contract preparation for the widening of Bayview Avenue (Y.R. 34) from St. John's Sideroad (Y.R. 26) to Mulock Drive (Y.R. 74) in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket, at an upset limit of $182,000.00, excluding GST.

4. The Commissioner of Transportation and Works be authorized to execute the necessary engineering agreements.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to engage qualified consultants as soon as possible to ensure timely completion of Regional works in the Towns of Aurora, Newmarket and the City of Vaughan. This report recommends the retention of consulting engineering firms to carry out the following projects:

- Class EA, detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision services for the Bathurst Street Watermain and the detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision services for the Bathurst Street road reconstruction in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket (*see Attachment 1*).
- Contract administration and full time site supervision services for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station and Forcemain in the City of Vaughan (*see Attachment 2*).
- Detail design and contract preparation for the widening of Bayview Avenue from St. John's Sideroad to Mulock Drive, in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket (*see Attachment 3*).

3. BACKGROUND

Brief details of the subject projects are provided below.

3.1 Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction

The Aurora and Newmarket Water Supply Assessment, 1999, identified the need for the Bathurst Street Watermain to interconnect the Northwest Elevated Tank in Aurora and the West Newmarket Reservoir. This watermain is approximately 3.0 km of new 600 mm diameter watermain with an estimated construction cost of $2.6 million.

Bathurst Street is currently scheduled to be reconstructed from two lanes to five lanes between Wellington Street and Mulock Drive. The Class EA for the road reconstruction project was completed in 2001. Bathurst Street road reconstruction from Wellington Street to Mulock Drive involves road widening from two lanes to five lanes with an estimated construction cost of $5.4 million.

The Bathurst Street Watermain and road reconstruction projects have been included in the 10 year Capital Plan for 2004, with construction scheduled for 2006.

3.2 Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station

The Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station is required to service the Vellore Village Development north of Langstaff Road on the east side of Pine Valley Drive.
The Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station, a submersible sewage pumping station, will include a wet well, control building, 500mm forcemain, and a 250mm gravity sewer. The estimated construction cost for the project is $6.8 million.
The detailed design for the project construction contract documents is currently being completed under the direction of the City of Vaughan and will be tendered by York Region in accordance with Clause 4 of Report No. 2 dated January 23, 2003 of the Transportation and Works Committee. The report recommends that, the Region assume

responsibility of the proposed Pine Valley sewage pumping station and the associated sewage forcemain on Pine Valley Drive and Langstaff Road from the City of Vaughan, subject to conditions contained within the report.

Funding for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station project has been included in the 2004 Capital Budget and the 10 year Capital Plan and is subject to a pre-paid development charge agreement.

3.3 Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction

This section of Bayview Avenue from St. John's Sideroad to Mulock Drive was part of a Municipal Class EA study completed in June 2002. With the finalization of this study, the Region was authorized under the Environmental Assessment Act to proceed to detail design and construction of the improvement works.

The Class EA studies identified preferred design which includes two through lanes in each direction with a continuous centre left-hand turn lane. Additional turning lanes are proposed at key intersections.

The Bayview Avenue road reconstruction project has been included in the 10 year Roads Capital Plan for 2004, with construction scheduled for 2005.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Submission of Proposals

4.1.1 Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction:

The following fourteen firms submitted written proposals in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) advertised on March 24, 2004, for the Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction:

- URS Canada Inc.
- Stantec Consulting Limited.
- McCormick Rankin Corporation.
- Cansult Limited.
- Earth Tech Canada Inc.
- Trow Associates Inc.
- SRM Associates.
- MacViro Consultants Inc.
- Municipal Infrastructure Group.
- UMA Engineering Limited.
- LEA Consulting Limited.
- Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited.
- R.V. Anderson & Associates Limited.
- Giffels Associates Limited.

The RFP for the Bathurst Street Watermain and road reconstruction stipulated that only teams with past experience in the design and construction of a 600mm or greater diameter watermain and a road reconstruction project would be considered. The RFP also stipulated that technical proposals must achieve a score of 40 out of 60 to be considered. Proposals not meeting these requirements were to be disqualified.

Of the fourteen firms that submitted proposals the following firms met the above mandatory requirements:

- McCormick Rankin Corporation.
- Earth Tech Canada Inc.
- Municipal Infrastructure Group.

The proposals from the other 11 firms were disqualified as they did not meet the mandatory requirements.

4.1.2 Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station

The following six firms submitted written proposals in response to the RFP advertised on March 30, 2004, for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station:

- KMK Consultants Limited.
- Earth Tech Canada Inc.
- MacViro Consultants Inc.
- Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited.
- Totten Sims Hubicki Associates
- Clean Water Engineering Company Limited.

The RFP for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station stipulated that only teams with past experience in the construction of a Sewage Pumping Station would be considered. The RFP also stipulated that technical proposals must achieve a score of 40 out of 60 to be considered. Proposals not meeting these requirements were to be disqualified.

Of the six firms that submitted proposals the following firms met the above mandatory requirements:

- KMK Consultants Limited.
- MacViro Consultants Inc.

The proposals from the other 4 firms were disqualified as they did not meet the mandatory requirements.

4.1.3. Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction

In accordance with York Region Purchasing By-law, Expressions of Interest (EOI) were received for this work in response to an appropriate advertisement in a publication of general circulation. Based on this EOI, the following four firms were provided with a RFP document:

- iTrans Consulting Inc.
- Mitchell Pound & Braddock Limited.

- NCE Limited.
- R. V. Anderson Associates Limited.

All but iTrans Consulting Inc. submitted a proposal in response to this RFP.

4.2 Proposal Evaluation

The submission deadline for technical and price proposals were as follows:

- Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction - April 22, 2004.
- Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station - April 29, 2004.
- Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction – May 6, 2004

The technical proposals were evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team qualifications.
- Project Implementation (including project understanding, approach and methodology, project management and quality assurance and quality control).

The financial proposals were opened once the technical evaluations were complete and the prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures. The evaluation results are summarized in Tables 1, 2, and 3.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 60)	Upset Fee (excluding GST)	Financial Score (Out of 40)	Total Score (Out of 100)
Municipal Infrastructure Group	45.9	$713,954.00	40.0	85.9
Earth Tech Canada Inc.	40.1	$893,704.00	32.0	72.1
McCormick Rankin Corporation	46.5	$1, 492,340.00	19.1	65.6

For the Bathurst Street Watermain and road reconstruction, the Municipal Infrastructure Group proposal provided a greater overall understanding of the project and demonstrated a superior team organization and project management approach. The Municipal Infrastructure Group proposal provided one of the two highest overall technical scores and the highest financial score.

The Municipal Infrastructure Group proposal ranked highest in the overall evaluation and represents the best value to the Region.

Table 2
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 60)	Upset Fee (excluding GST)	Financial Score (Out of 40)	Total Score (Out of 100)
KMK Consultants Limited	43.5	$230,270.00	40.0	83.5
MacViro Consultants Inc.	42.7	$304,550.00	30.2	72.9

For the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station, the KMK Consultants Limited proposal provided the highest scoring in Project Team Experience, Project Understanding, Project Management/Team Organization, Quality Assurance/Quality Control, and provided the highest overall technical score.

The KMK Consultants Limited proposal ranked highest in the overall evaluation and represents the best value to the Region.

Table 3
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Fee (excluding GST)	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
NCE Limited	57.5	$182,000.00	16.3	73.8
R. V. Anderson Associates Limited	50.5	$138,785.00	20.0	70.5
Mitchell Pound Braddock Limited	50.0	$197,453.00	14.1	64.1

The proposal of NCE Limited provided a significantly superior understanding of the key project challenges, and outlined a clearer methodology to address those challenges. Once the technical and financial scores were combined, NCE Limited attained the highest total score and is therefore recommended for this assignment.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fees for the individual projects are as follows:

- Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction: $713,954.00 excluding GST.
- Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station: $230,270.00 excluding GST.
- Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction: $182,000.00 excluding G.S.T.

The fee for any contract administration services for these projects, as applicable, was based on the assumed contract duration as follows:

- Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction: 50 weeks.
- Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station: 52 weeks.
- Bayview Avenue Road Reconstruction: Not Applicable

The consultant quoted on the contract administration based on the assumed duration. The proposals provided the Region with a "per-week" cost to establish a pro-rata cost if the contract varies from the assumed durations and approvals for any adjustments would be obtained through a Council approved process.

Sufficient funds are included in the draft 2004 Budget and Business Plan for these assignments.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The Bathurst Street Watermain will be constructed in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket. It is required to ensure the integrity of the water supply system and accommodate growth in the Town of Newmarket.

The Bathurst Street road reconstruction will be completed in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket. It is required to accommodate growth within York Region, and particularly between Yonge Street and Bathurst Street within the Towns of Richmond Hill, Aurora, and Newmarket.

The Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station will be constructed in the City of Vaughan. It is required to service the Vellore Village Development north of Langstaff Road on the east side of Pine Valley Drive.

The Bayview Avenue reconstruction will improve traffic operations for the travelling public, within the local area road network in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket. During the course of the detailed design, staff will discuss with the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket their requirements for sidewalks, mid-block illumination and landscaping. This consultant assignment allows for the inclusion of Town works in the Region's contract.

7. CONCLUSION

The proposal by the Municipal Infrastructure Group is proposed as the preferred proposal for the Bathurst Street Watermain and Road Reconstruction. The proposal represents the best overall value to the Region.

The proposal by KMK Consultants Limited is proposed as the preferred proposal for the Pine Valley Sewage Pumping Station. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The proposal by NCE Limited is proposed as the preferred proposal for the Bayview Avenue road reconstruction project. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(A copy of the attachments referred to in the foregoing was forwarded to each Member of Council with the June 16, 2004, Transportation and Works Committee agenda and a copy thereof is on file in the Regional Clerk's Office.)