

8

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES WESTERN VAUGHAN ARTERIAL ROAD IMPROVEMENTS INDIVIDUAL ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT STUDY (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-06-118)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, April 19, 2007, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The proposal of UMA Engineering Ltd., in the upset limit amount of \$2,980,303, excluding G.S.T., be accepted for the Western Vaughan Transportation Improvements Individual Environmental Assessment.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends retaining a consulting engineering firm to carry out the Western Vaughan Transportation Improvements Individual Environmental Assessment. The study area for the Individual Environmental Assessment is bounded by Highway 407 to the south and Teston Road to the north, Highway 50 to the west and Highway 400 to the east. A location plan is appended to this report (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with the Region's purchasing by-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

The background and rationale to proceed with the Individual Environmental Assessment for this project was outlined in detail in Clause 13, Report No. 7 of the Transportation and Works Committee dated June 14, 2006.

Key highlights of that report include:

- The City of Vaughan initiated the Pine Valley Drive Schedule C Municipal Class Environmental Assessment to complete the connection between Langstaff Road and Rutherford Road in January 2002.

- By May 2004, there was significant opposition to the Pine Valley Drive Class Environmental Assessment from Toronto and Region Conservation Authority, Friends of Boyd Park and First Nations communities.
- In response to the opposition, the City of Vaughan requested the Ministry of the Environment elevate the study from a Class EA to an Individual Environmental Assessment.
- Recognizing that York Region was programming improvements to Pine Valley Drive north of Rutherford Road, the City of Vaughan invited York Region to participate as co-proponents in the Individual Environmental Assessment for an expanded study area. York Region agreed to participate as a co-proponent.
- York Region and the City of Vaughan prepared a Terms of Reference for the Individual Environmental Assessment and submitted it to Ministry of the Environment for approval in December 2004.
- Ministry of the Environment approved in the Terms of Reference, subject to six amendments, on February 13, 2006.
- A notable amendment was that no alternative to the undertaking could go through Boyd Park, thereby eliminating the possibility of completing the link on Pine Valley Drive between Langstaff Road and Rutherford Road.

The City of Vaughan had been a joint proponent on the study due to the need to extend a road in their jurisdiction, Pine Valley Drive, between Rutherford Road and Langstaff Road. With the Minister's decision to exclude this section of road from further study, the City of Vaughan no longer had a direct interest as co-proponent for the Individual Environmental Assessment.

3.1 Project Purpose

The Region continues to have an interest in providing sufficient transportation capacity to serve the ongoing growth in the City of Vaughan. With the exclusion of completing the Pine Valley Drive link between Langstaff Road and Rutherford Road, other Regional roads in the area will need to accommodate the planned growth in the area.

Through consultation with Ministry of the Environment project staff it was determined that the intent of the Ministry of the Environment in approving Terms of Reference with the amendments, was to encourage the City of Vaughan and York Region to complete a comprehensive study that analyzes the transportation deficiencies and develop alternatives to address the deficiencies on a network/wide area basis and not to look only at individual corridors. Therefore, the preferred approach is to proceed with the Individual Environmental Assessment for a comprehensive study based on the approved Terms of Reference.

Therefore the purpose of the Individual Environmental Assessment is to identify transportation deficiencies in Western Vaughan as a whole, develop alternatives to address the deficiencies and secure Environmental Assessment Act clearance for the preferred alternatives.

3.2 Expected Timing

Subject to approval by council, the project will be initiated immediately once the Engineering Agreements are finalized over the summer. Given the scope of the project it is expected that the study will take approximately three years to complete. Council will be updated at key points during the study with the final Environmental Study Report expected to be filed in 2010.

3.3 Coordination With Other Studies

3.3.1 Regional Studies

This assignment will include coordination with several other concurrent Regional transportation studies. These studies include:

- Transportation Master Plan update.
- 10 Year Roads Construction Program annual update.
- Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan.

3.3.2 Other Related Studies

There are three key studies that are being undertaken by outside agencies that affect the study area for the West Vaughan Individual Environmental Assessment as noted below:

Highway 427 Extension Individual Environmental Assessment

Ministry of Transportation is the proponent for the Highway 427 Extension Individual Environmental Assessment. This much needed freeway extension will have a significant impact on relieving congestion on a number of adjacent arterial roads and provide opportunities to develop the commercial/industrial land uses in west Vaughan. The study was initiated in spring 2006. The first Public Consultation Centre is planned for April 25, 2007. To date, the study team has identified the need to extend Highway 427 and is now examining the options for the terminus and will continue to explore route alternatives over the next several months. The current schedule anticipates completion of the study by 2008. It should be noted that the Highway 427 Extension Individual Environmental Assessment is a separate project from York Region's interim arterial road extension of Highway 427 from the existing terminus at Highway 7 to Vogel/Zenway Boulevard, which staff are working on and will report to the Transportation and Works Committee under a separate report.

Highway 427/Highway 50 Boundary Study

Peel Region is the proponent for this study. This study is being undertaken to identify the alternatives to improve arterial road connectivity between York Region and Peel Region to integrate with the planned Highway 427 extension. The study was initiated in summer 2006. Preliminary studies are being completed and a formal Master Plan Environmental Assessment process is expected to be initiated in spring 2007.

Greater Toronto Area West Corridor Study

Ministry of Transportation is the proponent for this study. The purpose of this study is to identify transportation solutions to serve the planned growth in the western part of the Greater Toronto Area, from the western portion of York Region to Guelph. This study has recently been initiated and the team is currently undertaking data collection to evaluate alternatives to the undertaking.

It should be noted that each of these studies have a specific purpose and they are all important as part of the overall planning for transportation improvements in this area. In this regard, it is important that these studies continue on their own merits and schedule. While data and input from one study will complement the other studies, the progress of any one study should not deter the schedule and priority of the other studies. Regional staff is part of the study team for all of these studies and will work collaboratively to coordinate and share information as needed.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Region's purchasing by-law, interested firms, as selected from Request for Pre-qualification (RFPQ) No. P-06-103, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment.

The Consulting Engineers of Ontario represents the interests of the engineering consulting industry and had stated that their membership is looking for larger, more substantial projects. This project provided one of the largest consulting assignments for a Roads Environmental Assessment study and York Region received two proposals. Ideally, three or more proposals would have been preferred. Given the importance of this study and the implications on timing for infrastructure in West Vaughan, staff determined that it was best to move ahead with the two proposals rather than re-issue the proposal and risk another four to six month delay in starting the project.

Two consultants, with substantial expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering, submitted proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fee.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposals and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and weighed along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

4.1 Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score	Upset Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Proposal Score (out of 100)	Dollars per point
UMA Engineering Ltd. (UMA)	47.3	\$2,980,303	20.0	67.3	\$63,075
McCormick Rankin Corporation (MRC)	62.4	\$7,234,500	8.2	70.6	\$115,938

The total scores of the two proposals were within five points of each other. When this occurs, the Region's purchasing by-law states that the "dollar cost methodology" shall be used. Therefore the proposal with the lowest dollars per point shall be selected.

In the evaluation of the proposals, McCormick Rankin Corporation scored higher on the technical portion based on their experience in managing Environmental Assessment studies and the depth of discussion in their understanding of key issues related to this project. In the area of project management, both firms were relatively equal with UMA providing additional documentation related to the industry accepted project management principles and risk management. McCormick Rankin Corporation had a significantly higher fee compared to UMA. The McCormick Rankin Corporation proposal identified a significant amount of time dedicated to the preparation of preliminary engineering drawings. For a project of this nature, scope management, risk management and public consultation will play a vital role in the success of the project. In conclusion, staff is satisfied that UMA will provide the needed technical expertise and provides the best value for this project.

Due to the variance in the Financial Proposals, staff reviewed the content and requirements of the project Request of Proposal document and the UMA Technical Proposal to ensure that all requirements were adequately reflected. Based on the review staff feel that the proposed work plan in the UMA proposal and corresponding fee will

meet the project requirements. Further, the UMA Financial Proposal is consistent with the staff estimate of the external costs for this assignment.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that UMA Engineering Ltd. be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the West Vaughan Individual Environmental Assessment and preliminary design assignment under Request for Proposal P-06-118.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the Class Environmental Assessment and preliminary design studies is \$2,980,303 excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in the Region's draft 2007 Capital Budget and 10 Year Capital Program

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. stage two archaeological assessments, additional public consultation, railway crossing grade separation, exposing underground utilities, respond to Requests for Part II Orders, Oak Ridges Moraine Conservation Act and Conservation Plan and Greenbelt Act and Greenbelt Plan Requirements, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project is required to address transportation needs in York Region; specifically in the City of Vaughan where plans have been approved for continued growth.

Throughout the course of the Individual Environmental Assessment Study and preliminary design studies, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the City of Vaughan to coordinate local municipal needs

7. CONCLUSION

The West Vaughan area has a number of road projects that are needed to support ongoing growth in the area. With exclusion of the Pine Valley Drive project between Rutherford Road and Langstaff Road by the Minister of the Environment, there is a need to review other road projects that will support the planned growth. The terms of reference for an Individual Environmental Assessment has been approved by the Ministry of Environment and this study will provide a comprehensive, coordinated study to evaluate the transportation improvements for the West Vaughan area.

Two proposals for provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with the Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal from UMA

Engineering Ltd. represents the best overall value to York Region. It is recommended that the assignment be awarded to UMA Engineering Ltd. as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-06-118.

For more information on this report contact Dino Basso, Director, Capital Delivery, Roads Branch at extension 5902 in the Transportation and Works Department.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the May 2, 2007 Committee meeting.)