

7

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES YORK/DURHAM LINE TOWN OF MARKHAM (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-07-53)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, April 10, 2008, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of URS Canada Inc. be engaged to undertake the detailed design for road improvements on York/Durham Line (Y.R. 30) from Steeles Avenue to Highway 7 (Y.R. 7) as outlined in this report, at an upset limit of \$734,462.40 including GST.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report is to engage a qualified consulting engineering firm to carry out the detailed design for road improvements to York/Durham Line from Steeles Avenue to Highway 7 in the Town of Markham (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with York Region's purchasing by-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

York Region's Transportation Master Plan identified future road needs in the York/Durham Line corridor between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7. The 2008 10 Year Roads Capital Program includes York/Durham Line road improvements between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 in 2014.

A Class Environmental Assessment Study was completed for the proposed road improvements in July 2006, and detailed design of the project should now proceed.

Project Description

York/Durham Line is a 'Boundary Road' between the Regional Municipalities of York and Durham. The length of road between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 is 5.1 km and is under the sole jurisdiction of York Region.

York/Durham Line from Steeles Avenue to Highway 7 is part of the general north-south and east-west road grid that provides service to traffic from Markham, Toronto, and Pickering and aids in the distribution of traffic to and from Highway 407. With continuous growth in population and development in both York and Durham Regions, the York/Durham Line has become a critical component providing a safe, high capacity roadway in a north-south direction.

The York Region Official Plan designates the lands west of the York/Durham Line as an Agricultural Policy Area for agricultural operations. Similarly, the lands east of the York/Durham Line are designated as Permanent Agricultural Reserve under Durham's Official Plan.

The Environmental Study Report completed for the project identified a traffic capacity deficiency on the York/Durham Line by 2011. To accommodate the projected long term traffic demand by 2021, a four lane facility will be required.

It is proposed to reconstruct and widen the York/Durham Line from the existing substandard two-lane rural cross-section to an upgraded four lane arterial roadway, with proper shoulders, improved geometrics and drainage to Regional road standards.

Project Purpose

The purpose of this assignment is to complete the detailed design for the reconstruction and widening of the York/Durham Line to a four lane road with required intersection improvements and modifications to the Highway 407 interchange and bridge over the highway to accommodate the wider York/Durham Line roadway over the Highway 407 corridor.

Coordination with Other Stakeholders

This assignment will include coordination with various other stakeholders and concurrent studies. These include:

- Town of Markham
- City of Pickering
- Region of Durham
- City of Toronto
- 407/ETR and the Ministry of Transportation

- Utility companies
- Toronto Region Conservation Authority
- Southeast Collector Trunk Sewer Project
- Green Belt Plan
- Rouge Park
- Master Bike Plans

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms, as selected from Request for Qualification (RFQ) No. P-05-69, were invited to submit proposals under Request for Proposal (RFP) P-07-53 for the York/Durham Line assignment. A short-list of consultants, with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences, structural engineering and Ministry of Transportation interchange design were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fee.

The following four pre-qualified firms were invited to submit proposals for the assignment:

1. McCormick Rankin Corporation
2. Morrison Hershfield Limited
3. Totten Sims Hubicki Associates
4. URS Canada Inc.

The RFP closed on December 14, 2007 and proposals were received from the firms of Totten Sims Hubicki Associates and URS Canada Inc. Both, McCormick Rankin Corporation and Morrison Hershfield Limited were unable to commit sufficient staff resource allocations to the assignment due to their current workloads and respectively declined to submit proposals.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposals and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Qualifications and Experience, demonstration of relevant experience and discussions on key staff, technical support staff and sub-consultants.
- Project Deliverables, specifically project plans, schedule development and control, budget development and control, sub-consultant time allocation and control and quality control of services.
- Project implementation, including project understanding, discussion on key project issues, work plan and methodology, deliverables and value and innovation of services.

The fee envelopes were opened following the technical evaluations of the proposals. The proposed fees were converted to a score and weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary – York/Durham Line

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Limit (including G.S.T.)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)	Dollars Per Technical Point
Totten Sims Hubicki Associates (TSH)	56.58	\$964,845.0 0	15.22	71.80	\$17,052.76
URS Canada Inc. (URS)	50.05	\$734,462.4 0	20.00	70.05	\$14,674.57

Both proposals provided thorough project management plans and discussions on their understanding of the key issues and details such as the coordination of the road improvements with stakeholders, environmental challenges within the corridor, approval requirements and project deliverables.

In the evaluation of the proposals, Totten Sims Hubicki scored higher on the technical portion based on their relevant experience on similar assignments and their understanding for project implementation.

The URS Canada Inc. proposal provided the lowest upset limit, therefore receiving full allotment of points for their financial proposal.

The total scores of the proposals were within five points of each other. When this occurs, York Region's Purchasing By-law states that the "dollar cost methodology" shall be used. Therefore the proposal with the lowest dollars per point shall be selected. Once the "dollar cost methodology" was applied, URS Canada Inc. represented the best value to York Region.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that URS Canada Inc. be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the York/Durham Line detailed design for road improvements under Request for Proposal P-07-53.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the detailed design for the York/Durham Line road improvement project is \$734,462.40, including GST. Funding for the project is included in York Region's approved 2008 10 Year Roads Construction Program.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Road improvements to York/Durham Line between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 will address transportation servicing deficiencies in York Region; specifically in the Town of Markham.

Throughout the course of the assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Town of Markham to accommodate local municipal requirements.

7. CONCLUSION

York Region's Transportation Master Plan identified transportation needs within the York/Durham Line corridor and the 2008 10 Year Roads Construction Program schedules improvements for 2014.

A Class Environmental Study for the proposed road improvements was completed in 2006 and the project is approved for implementation.

Detailed design of the York/Durham Line to a four lane road with required intersection improvements and modifications to the Highway 407 interchange is required for the implementation of the project.

To promote timely and cost-effective delivery of this project, engineering consultant services are required to be retained by York Region.

Two proposals for provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal from URS Canada Inc. represents the best overall value to York Region. It is recommended that the assignment be awarded to URS Canada Inc. as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-07-53.

For more information on this report, contact Dino Basso, Director, Capital Delivery - at Ext. 5902.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the April 30, 2008 Committee meeting.)