

8

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES STOUFFVILLE ROAD DETAILED DESIGN TOWN OF WHITCHURCH-STOUFFVILLE (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-07-06)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, March 8, 2007, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The proposal of SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. for the detailed design study of road improvements on Stouffville Road (Y.R. 14), from west of Woodbine Avenue (Y.R. 8) to Highway 48, in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville in the amount of \$935,076 excluding GST, be accepted.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to recommend retaining a consulting engineering firm to carry out the detailed design study for Stouffville Road from west of Woodbine Avenue to Highway 48 in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. A location plan is appended to this report (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with the Region's Purchasing By-law, a report to Council is required prior to authorizing an award when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

The approved 2006 10 Year Roads Construction Program scheduled the implementation of improvement works on Stouffville Road between west of Woodbine Avenue and Warden Avenue for the year 2007 and between Warden Avenue and Highway 48 for the year 2010. The Region brought forth a draft proposal updating the 10 Year Roads Construction Program schedule to Council in February 2007 and it is anticipated that these dates will be revised with the construction of Stouffville Road occurring within the

same time period as the Main Street widening which is currently planned for 2008/2009 by the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.

The Region initiated a Schedule “C” Class Environmental Assessment (EA) Study in 2003 for roadway improvements on Stouffville Road from Woodbine Avenue to Highway 48 in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. The Class EA Study findings and recommendations are for roadway improvements comprising of road widening from two to four lanes, intersection improvements at crossing roadways and water crossing structure replacements and extensions, as well as other ancillary improvements.

A Notice of Completion for the Class EA Study is anticipated to be advertised in the spring of 2007.

3.1 Project Description

The study area encompasses Stouffville Road between west of Woodbine Avenue and Highway 48, a distance of approximately 8 kilometres. The study area included the major intersections of Woodbine Avenue, Warden Avenue, Kennedy Road and McCowan Road and the minor intersections of Union Street, Stalwart Industrial Drive, Kennedy Lane and McCowan Lane.

The section of Stouffville Road between Woodbine Avenue and Highway 48 serves as the westerly approach to the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville and is an important component in connecting the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville to Highway 404. The land uses adjacent to the study area comprise of agriculture (within the Agriculture Policy Area of The Regional Municipality of York), recreation (conservation area, golf course), commercial (plaza at Stouffville Road and Woodbine Avenue), industrial (e.g. Cessaroni Technology Inc.) and residential. Stouffville Road to the east of Highway 48 becomes Main Street and is under the jurisdiction of the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. Highway 48 and its intersection with Stouffville Road and Main Street are under the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Transportation.

3.2 Project Purpose

The purpose of the project will be the detailed design of the widening of Stouffville Road from two to four lanes between west of Woodbine Avenue and Highway 48. The Stouffville Road improvements will be a symmetrical widening between Woodbine Avenue and McCowan Road and a south-side widening between McCowan Road and Highway 48. Other improvements related to the proposed widening will include:

- Intersection improvements at crossing roadways, including full build-out of north-south arterials through the intersection plus left- and right-turn lanes as required.
- Improved vertical alignment of Stouffville Road in the vicinity of Bruce’s Mill Conservation area.
- Drainage improvements, including replacement of all corrugated steel pipe cross culverts, concrete culvert extensions and/or replacements where required to accommodate the proposed widening and the implementation of stormwater management measures.

- Rehabilitation of existing pavement.
- Entrance modifications and/or realignments for entrances affected by the road improvements.
- Considerations to close minor local roads to improve operations and safety on Stouffville Road in consultation with Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.
- Modifications to traffic signals to suit the revised intersection configurations.
- Develop environmental mitigation and compensation strategies.
- Undertake necessary design work acceptable to regulatory agencies for obtaining all necessary permits, approvals and clearances for the construction of Stouffville Road from west of Woodbine Avenue to Highway 48.

3.3 Relevant Studies

The Regional Municipality of York is proposing to extend the existing trunk watermain on McCowan Road easterly along Stouffville Road to east of Highway 48 in 2009. A Class EA for the proposed watermain construction has been completed and the preferred watermain is located within the easterly limit of the Stouffville Road widening improvement project. The proposed trunk watermain will be located on the south side of Stouffville Road between McCowan Road and Highway 48 and on the north side of Stouffville Road east of Highway 48. The proposed watermain will be an important aspect of the Stouffville Road detailed design assignment.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms as selected from Expression of Interest No. P-04-61, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of consultants with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

4.1 Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary – Stouffville Road

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)
SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc.	56	\$935,076	20	76
Giffels Associates Limited	46	\$1,124,700	17	63
Totten Sims Hubicki Associates	38	\$1,036,220	18	56

The technical proposals from Giffels Associates Limited, SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. and Totten Sims Hubicki Associates were evaluated based on the evaluation criteria summarized in the Request for Proposal P-07-06. The technical proposal from SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. received the highest technical score because it was the most thorough and illustrated better understanding of the key issues and details of the Stouffville Road project.

The technical proposals from Giffels Associates Limited and Totten Sims Hubicki Associates were scored lower because they were not as thorough in the areas of project deliverables and in their discussion of project issues. Totten Sims Hubicki Associates obtained a lower technical score compared with the other two proposals because of their assumption and staff hour allocation. Their proposal made the assumption that was not consistent with the requirements documented in the Environmental Study report for open-footed culverts at several water crossings. This assumption represents a risk for scope of work changes compared with the other two proposals. Their proposal also does not provide any details of the staff hour allocation for the project.

Given the best overall score, which comprised the combination of both technical and financial scores, the total score for SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. placed the firm in a position that the company be recommended to be engaged for the engineering assignment. The SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. proposal, with the highest total score of 76, represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Stouffville Road detailed design assignment under Request for Proposal P-07-06.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the detailed design study is \$935,076, excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in the Region's approved 10 Year Roads Construction Program.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. borehole requirements, exposing underground utilities, streetscaping, public meeting/workshops, CCTV video inspection, separate McCowan Road to Highway 48 design/tender package option, review of contractor submissions, engineering services during construction, Main Street detailed design incorporation, condition survey of exiting buildings, CEEA requirements, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

This project is required to address the transportation needs and accommodate growth in the Region and the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. The project will address improving traffic safety and operations for the travelling public within the Regional and local road network.

The Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville supports the proposed road improvements and staff has requested implementation of the Stouffville Road improvements to occur within the planned Main Street improvement horizon of 2008/2009 to support the planned urban development within the community of Stouffville as well as other areas of the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.

7. CONCLUSION

The Class EA Study for Stouffville Road from west of Woodbine Avenue and Highway 48 has identified required improvements to provide improved traffic safety and operation for the travelling public and to provide sufficient roadway capacity for future demands resulting from planned growth within the community of Stouffville and other areas of the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.

The Stouffville Road detailed design assignment must commence to permit the implementation of the improvements to proceed within the same time period as the Main Street widening that is currently planned for 2008/2009 by the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville to support the future urban development within the community of Stouffville.

Consultants' proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Regional Purchasing By-law and the proposal from SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. represents the best overall value to York Region. It is, therefore, recommended that the Stouffville Road

detailed design assignment be awarded to SNC Lavalin Engineers & Constructors Inc. as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-07-06.

For more information on this report contact Dino Basso, Director Capital Delivery, Roads Branch at extension 5902 in the Transportation and Works Department.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the April 4, 2007 Committee meeting.)