

6

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES - CLASS ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND WATER RESOURCE EXPLORATION FOR WATER AND SEWAGE SERVICING IN KLEINBURG-NASHVILLE, PROJECTS 77450, 77480, 77470 WATER SUPPLY AND STORAGE IN KING CITY, PROJECTS 73170, 73200 WATER SUPPLY TO THE COMMUNITY OF MOUNT ALBERT, PROJECT 71200

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, March 31, 2004, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of KMK Consultants Limited be engaged to undertake the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) for Water and Sewage servicing in Kleinburg-Nashville as outlined in this report at an upset limit cost of \$979,619.24 including GST.
2. The consulting engineering firm of KMK Consultants Limited be engaged to undertake the Class EA and Water Resource Exploration for Water Supply and Storage in King City as outlined in this report at an upset limit cost of \$673,163.75 including GST.
3. The consulting engineering firm of Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited be engaged to undertake the Class EA and Water Resource Exploration for Water Supply in the Community of Mount Albert as outlined in this report at an upset limit cost of \$682,832.94 including GST.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to recommend retention of consultants to carry out the Class Environmental Assessment and associated Water Resource Exploration for the following works:

- Water and sewage servicing for the Community of Kleinburg-Nashville.
- Water supply and storage in King City.
- Water supply to the Community of Mount Albert.

3. BACKGROUND

The 2003 Long Term Water Master Plan Update has identified the infrastructure needed to accommodate projected growth in the Region up to 2036. The Master Plan Update

addressed needs of the predominantly lake Ontario-based, York Water System as well as stand-alone groundwater-based systems. Based on an assessment of the existing groundwater supply systems in the communities of Kleinburg-Nashville, King City and Mount Albert, the Master Plan Update determined the need to expand these systems in the next few years. To implement the infrastructure works recommended in the Water Master Plan, a Class EA is required. A component of the Class EA is to carry out a groundwater resource exploration program to locate viable groundwater sources. To this end, Regional staff has proposed the following projects in the 2004 Ten-Year Capital Plan for the following communities:

3.1 The Kleinburg-Nashville Community

The Kleinburg-Nashville Community Plan (OPA No. 601) was approved by the Regional Municipality of York in October 2001, and it proposed a build-out population of up to 6,800 people. The Regional water supply system in the Kleinburg-Nashville area can currently accommodate a serviced population of approximately 4,000 people. The Regional sewage treatment system can currently accommodate a serviced population of approximately 3,800 people. As such, the Region is seeking to retain consulting services to undertake a Class EA and associated Groundwater Resource Exploration for studying alternatives to provide water and sewage services to meet the projected growth of the Kleinburg-Nashville Community Plan.

The scope of the assignment includes:

- The completion of a Class EA study including identification and evaluation of alternative solutions, public consultation, and the preparation and filing of an Environmental Study Report.
- The completion of groundwater resource exploration work to identify potential sites for the development of production wells.

3.2 King City

The proposed build-out population of King City is approximately 12,500 people. Regional water supply in the King City area can currently accommodate a population of approximately 4,800 people. As such, the Region is seeking to retain consulting services to undertake a Class EA and associated Groundwater Resource Exploration to augment the water supply and storage capacity to service the projected growth in King City.

The scope of the assignment includes:

- The completion of a Class EA study including identification and evaluation of alternative solutions, public consultation and the preparation and filing of an Environmental Study Report.
- The completion of groundwater resource exploration work to identify potential sites for the development of production wells.

3.3 The Community of Mount Albert

The proposed Community of Mount Albert has a build-out population of up to 5,700 people. Regional water supply in the Mount Albert area can currently accommodate a population of approximately 2,800 people. As such, the Region is seeking to retain consulting services to undertake a Class EA and associated Groundwater Resource Exploration to augment the water supply capacity to service the projected growth of the Mount Albert Community.

The scope of the assignment includes:

- The completion of a Class EA study including identification and evaluation of alternative solutions, public consultation and the preparation and filing of an Environmental Study Report.
- The completion of groundwater resource exploration work to identify potential sites for the development of production wells.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

Requests for Proposals (RFP) for all three projects were issued on February 11, 2004:

- Kleinburg-Nashville Community P-04-15
- King City P-05-11
- Mount Albert Community P-04-12

Submissions were received on February 25, 2004, and technical evaluations were completed on March 3, 2004. Regional staff evaluated the technical proposals based on the following criteria:

1. Responsiveness and completeness of submission
2. Experience and qualifications of the project team.
3. Management qualifications and experience.
4. Project implementation (including approach, methodology, schedule, etc.).

Evaluation was based on an overall score of 100 points, with 80 points assigned for technical and 20 points for financial. Proposals were required to achieve a minimum technical score of 48 out of 80 to be eligible for consideration.

Evaluation results are described in the following sections.

4.1 The Kleinburg-Nashville Community

Four submissions were received for the work in the Kleinburg-Nashville Community:

1. Earth Tech Canada Inc.
2. KMK Consultants Limited
3. MacViro Consultants Inc.
4. Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited

All four proposals met the minimum technical score requirement and their financial proposals were opened after the technical evaluation was complete. The prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures, as summarized in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary (P-04-15)

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Fee (including GST)	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
KMK Consultants Ltd.	58.9	\$ 979,619.24	20.0	78.9
MacViro Consultants Inc.	57.4	\$1,001,004.26	19.6	76.9
Earth Tech Canada Inc.	59.9	\$1,301,660.35	15.1	75.0
Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited	48.9	\$981,269.85	20.0	68.9

Earth Tech Canada Inc. was ranked highest and KMK Consultants Ltd. was ranked second highest on the technical portion of the proposal. Their proposals clearly demonstrated their experience and knowledge in the Class EA process for water and wastewater projects. Earth Tech Canada Inc. received the lowest score on the financial proposals.

KMK Consultants Limited attained the highest total score along with the lowest submitted cost, and is recommended as the preferred consultant.

4.2 King City

Four submissions were received for the work in King City:

1. Conestoga-Rovers and Associates Limited
2. Giffels Associates Ltd.
3. International Water Supply Ltd.
4. KMK Consultants Ltd.

International Water Supply Ltd. did not meet the minimum technical score requirement and their financial proposal was not opened.

The remaining three consultants met the minimum technical score requirement. Their financial proposals were opened after the technical evaluation was complete. The prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures, as summarized in Table 2.

Table 2
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary (P-04-11)

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Fee (including GST)	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
KMK Consultants Ltd.	54.8	\$ 673,163.75	20.0	74.8
Conestoga-Rovers and Associates Ltd.	57.5	\$ 901,189.31	14.9	72.4
Giffels Associates Ltd.	57.8	\$ 1,061,358.68	12.7	70.4
International Water Supply	46.6	-	-	46.6

Giffels Associates Ltd. ranked highest on the technical portion of the proposal. Their proposal clearly demonstrated their experience and knowledge in Class EA process for water servicing projects as well as groundwater resource exploration. Giffels Associates Ltd. received the lowest score on the financial proposals.

KMK Consultants Limited attained the highest total score along with the lowest submitted price, and is recommended as the preferred consultant for this assignment.

4.3 The Community of Mount Albert

Five submissions were received for the work in the Mount Albert Community:

1. Giffels Associates Limited
2. International Water Supply Ltd.
3. KMK Consultants Ltd.
4. Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited
5. XCG Consultants Inc.

The following two consultants did not meet the minimum technical score requirement and their financial proposals were not opened:

1. International Water Supply Ltd.
2. XCG Consultants Inc.

The remaining three consultants met the minimum technical score requirement. Their financial proposals were opened after the technical evaluation was complete. The prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures, as summarized in Table 3.

Table 3
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary (P-04-12)

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Fee (including GST)	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited	57.4	\$682,832.94	20.0	77.4
KMK Consultants Ltd.	54.0	\$706,125.10	19.3	73.3
Giffels Associates Ltd.	57.4	\$801,931.83	17.0	74.4
International Water Supply	45.1	-	-	45.1
XCG Consultants Inc.	43.0	-	-	43.0

Giffels Associated Ltd. and Marshall Macklin Monaghan Ltd. ranked highest on the technical portion of the proposal. Their proposals clearly demonstrated their experience and knowledge in Class EA process for water servicing projects as well as groundwater resource exploration.

Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited attained the highest total score along with the lowest submitted cost, and is recommended as the preferred consultant for this assignment.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fees for the projects are:

The Kleinburg-Nashville Community: \$ 979,619.24 (including GST)
 Funding for the Class EA project will be 80% from Development Charge and 20% from Water and Wastewater Operating. The capital project numbers supporting this work are 77450, 77480, and 77470.

King City: \$ 673,163.75 (including GST)
 Funding for the Class EA project will be 80% Development Charge and 20% from Water Operating. The capital project numbers supporting this work are 73170 and 73200.

The Community of Mount Albert: \$ 682,832.94 (including GST)
 Funding for the Class EA project will be 80% from Developer Up-front contribution and 20% from Water Operating. The capital project number supporting this work is 71200.

Sufficient funds for these projects are available in the 2004 Capital Budget.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

6.1 The Kleinburg-Nashville Community

The Class EA will determine the preferred solution for providing the needed water and sewage services to meet the projected growth for the Kleinburg-Nashville Community in Vaughan.

6.2 King City

The Class EA will determine the preferred solution for providing the additional water supply and storage capacity needed to service the expected growth in King City.

6.3 The Community of Mount Albert

The Class EA will determine the preferred solution for providing the additional water capacity needed to service the expected growth in the Community of Mount Albert in East Gwillimbury.

7. CONCLUSION

Regional staff selected the proposal by KMK Consultants Limited as the preferred consulting firm for the Kleinburg-Nashville Community Class EA study and Water Resource Exploration. The proposal represented the best overall value to the Region and demonstrated that KMK Consultants has highly qualified and knowledgeable personnel to complete the respective assignments successfully.

Regional staff selected the proposal by KMK Consultants Limited as the preferred consulting firm for the King City Class EA study and Water Resource Exploration. The proposal represented the best overall value to the Region and demonstrated that KMK Consultants has highly qualified and knowledgeable personnel to complete the respective assignments successfully.

Regional staff selected the proposal by Marshall Macklin Monaghan Limited as the preferred consulting firm for the Mount Albert Community Class EA study and Water Resource Exploration. The proposal represented the best overall value to York Region and demonstrated that Marshall Macklin Monaghan has highly qualified and knowledgeable personnel to complete the assignment successfully.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.