

6

YORK REGION TRANSIT MOBILITY PLUS CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD

The Transportation Services Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendation contained in the following report dated March 11, 2010, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services.

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that this report be received for information.

2. PURPOSE

This report updates Regional Council on York Region Transit's Mobility Plus Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card Program for 2009. (See *Attachment 1* for 2009 results.)

3. BACKGROUND

In 2008, York Region Transit (YRT) Mobility Plus commenced a Contractor Report Card program to record and score contractor performance

The report card provides staff with a report on the performance of the bus and taxi contractors that operate the Mobility Plus service. This report card was first introduced to Regional Council in September 2009 and reported on the last quarter of 2008. The Mobility Plus report card follows a similar reporting process as is currently undertaken with the YRT/Viva conventional service and will be reported on a semi-annual basis.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

2009 CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD RESULTS OVERVIEW

Mobility Plus bus and taxi contractors continue to meet the Region's overall expectations

This report card scores the Mobility Plus service on 18 bus and 14 dedicated taxi (sedan and mini-van) performance standards identified in the performance-based operations and maintenance contracts. In addition, the report card scores several unique Mobility Plus-

specific standards that deal with driver escorting and passenger securement. Results of the accumulated Q4 Contractor Report Card indicate that all contractors are meeting the Region's overall performance expectations. Where contractors fall below the benchmark established for performance standards, staff initiate corrective action and work with the contractors to improve the deficient areas. The 20 performance standards are described in detail in Table 1 below.

Table 1
Performance Standards

	Performance Standard	Measure ment Period	Benchmark Score
1A	On-Time Departures <i>% of on-time pick-ups, drop-offs or departure (bus) observations; departing no later than 10:00 minutes after the scheduled departure time</i>	Quarterly	94 – 96%
1B	Missed Trips (Bus) - Vehicle No Shows (Mini Vans and Sedans) <i>% of not missed trip observations; vehicles departing more than 20:00 minutes late shall be considered a missed trip</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2A	Kilometres Between Road Calls (Bus Only) <i>Average # of km per vehicle per in-service Road Call</i>	Quarterly	8,000 – 10,000 km
2B	In-Service Wheelchair Lift / Ramp Failures <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning wheelchair lifts / ramps</i>	Quarterly	100%
2C	In-Service Air Conditioning / Heating <i>% of vehicle observations with functioning HVAC systems</i>	Quarterly	100%
2D	Preventative Maintenance Inspections (Bus Only) <i>% of incidences within 1,000 km PMI interval</i>	Quarterly	90 – 95%
2E	Repairs Required as a Result of Maintenance Inspections/Audits <i># of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles – non safety-related</i>	Quarterly	Repair allowance of 20 days
2F	Accident Damage Repairs <i># of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles</i>	Quarterly	Repair allowance of 20 days
2G	Exterior Clean <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned exteriors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
2H	Interior Clean <i>% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned interiors</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
3A	CVOR (Bus Only) <i>Commercial Vehicle Operator's Registration; status of carrier safety rating</i>	Annually	Satisfactory – unaudited
3B	Accidents <i>Average kilometres per vehicle per preventable accident</i>	Quarterly	30,000 km
4A	Customer Complaints <i># of complaints per 1,000 passenger trips</i>	Quarterly	5 – 10 complaints
4B	Customer Satisfaction Survey <i>(Biennial survey)</i>	Every Two Years	85 – 90%
5A	Service Training <i>All operators to be certified and receive annual training refreshers 18 hrs – Bus; 3 hrs for Mini-vans and Sedan (Pass or Fail)</i>	Annually	100%
6A	Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets³ <i># of days late for all reports</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
6B	Accident / Incident Reports² <i># of days beyond reporting allowance for all accidents</i>	Quarterly	95 – 98%
7A	Escorting To/From Accessible Door <i>% of reported or observed incidents of failure to escort</i>	Quarterly	Pass/Fail

Report No. 4 of the Transportation Services Committee
Regional Council Meeting of April 22, 2010

7B	Securement <i>% of reported or observed incidents of failure to properly secure customers</i>	Quarterly	Pass/Fail
7C	Hand-to-Hand Policy <i>% of reported or observed incidents of failure to properly follow 'Hand-to-Hand' Policy</i>	Quarterly	Pass/Fail

- Notes: 1. Average calculated using either three or four contractors, based on available data. (See Attachment 1, Report Card)
2. Accident / Incident Reports to be submitted within 2 days of event.
3. Management Reports and TW Cares Tickets to be submitted within average 3 days.

Performance standards determine whether or not the contractor exceeds, meets or falls below the benchmark

Each quarter, random checks of service schedule adherence, escorting, securement, and equipment are performed by the Mobility Plus Inspector and the Customer Service Representative. In addition, data pertaining to vehicle maintenance, accident reports, responses to customer concerns and personnel training is provided to Mobility Plus by the contractors. This data is submitted on a daily, monthly and annual basis as specified in the performance-based contract. The results of the Mobility Plus random checks and data collection are compiled and used to score each of the performance standards. The Mobility Plus Customer Satisfaction Survey results are also factored into this report.

Each of the 20 performance standards has been assigned a benchmark score. Scores are illustrated by a percentage, percentage range, or pass/fail. Scoring and ranking of the performance standard is done using 1, 2, or 3 scores, where:

1. Exceeds benchmark
Contractor's score is greater than the benchmark score.
2. Meets benchmark
Contractor's score is equal to the benchmark score.
3. Below benchmark
Contractor's score is less than the benchmark score.

A summary of the final ranking is shown in Table 2.

Table 2
2009 Mobility Plus Contractor Ranking

Contractor	Bus	Accessible Van	Rank	Sedan	Rank
Royal Taxi	☒	☑	3	☑	2
Care Accessible	☒	☑	2	☒	N/A
Mobility Transportation Specialists	☒	☑	1	☑	1
Tokmakjian	☑	☒	N/A	☒	N/A

Royal Taxi ranks third amongst three dedicated accessible minivan contractors and second amongst two dedicated sedan contractors

Royal Taxi operates, under two separate contracts, 10 dedicated accessible minivan and 20 dedicated sedan vehicles for Mobility Plus. This represents approximately 40% of the total Mobility Plus service.

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding benchmark) or two (meeting benchmark) for each contract are listed in Table 3.

Table 3
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark
(Royal Taxi)

Exceeding Standard Benchmark	Meeting Standard Benchmark
• On-Time Performance • Missed Trips • In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating • Repairs Required as a result of Maintenance Inspections • Accident Damage Repairs • Customer Complaints • Customer Satisfaction Survey • Hand-to-Hand Policy	• Interior Clean (Sedans) • Vehicles Removed from Service for Safety-Related Deficiencies • Escorting • Securement

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 4.

Table 4
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Royal Taxi)

Below Standard
• Exterior Clean • Interior Clean (Accessible Vans) • Service Training • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Accidents/Incident Reports

Care Accessible ranks second overall amongst the three dedicated accessible minivan contractors

Care Accessible operates seven dedicated accessible minivan vehicles for Mobility Plus. This represents approximately 10% of the total Mobility Plus service.

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) for each contract are listed in Table 5.

Table 5
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark
(Care Accessible)

Exceeding Standard Benchmark	Meeting Standard Benchmark
• On-Time Performance • Missed Trips • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating • Repairs Required as a result of Maintenance Inspections/Audits • Accident Damage Repairs • Customer Complaints • Customer Satisfaction Survey • Service Training • Hand-to-Hand Policy	• In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • Vehicles Removed from Service for Safety-Related Deficiencies • Escorting • Securement

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 6.

Table 6
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Care Accessible)

Below Standard Benchmark
• Exterior Clean • Interior Clean • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Accidents/Incident Reports

Mobility Transportation Specialists (MTS) ranks first amongst the three dedicated accessible minivan contractors and first of the two dedicated sedan contractors

Mobility Transportation Specialists operates, under two separate contracts, six dedicated accessible minivan and 11 sedan vehicles for Mobility Plus. This represents approximately 24% of the total Mobility Plus service.

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) for each contract are listed in Table 7.

Table 7
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark
(Mobility Transportation Specialists)

Exceeding Standard Benchmark	Meeting Standard Benchmark
• On-Time Performance • Missed Trips • Repairs Required as a result of Maintenance Inspections/Audits • Accident Damage Repairs • Vehicles Removed from Service for Safety-Related Deficiencies • Customer Complaints • Customer Satisfaction Survey • Service Training • Escorting (Accessible Vans) • Securement (Sedans) • Hand-to-Hand Policy	• In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failures • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating • Escorting (Sedans) • Securement (Accessible Vans)

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed in Table 8.

Table 8
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (MTS)

Below Standard Benchmark
• Exterior Clean • Interior Clean • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Accidents/Incident Reports

Tokmakjian Inc. operates Mobility Plus and Community Bus services and is not ranked due to different services and equipment

The services provided by Tokmakjian include:

- Buses operate both regular Mobility Plus and conventional Community Bus routes and are required, in the case of Community Bus, to adhere to a fixed bus stop and schedule. Staff monitor schedule adherence from beginning and end points on routes, through both physical observation and the Computer Aided Dispatch/Automatic Vehicle Location (CAD/AVL) system.
- Tokmakjian bus drivers are required to maintain a higher training standard including, a valid BZ drivers licence, training on the daily correct use of the on-board CAD/AVL equipment, destination signs, and customer service (Ambassador) training.
- Tokmakjian is the only contractor operating the Mobility Plus bus service. They are not required to operate accessible vans and sedans.
- Tokmakjian drivers must be able to operate two different types of buses; the 25 ft. ELF Mobility Plus bus and the 30 ft. Eldorado conventional bus.
- Preventative Maintenance and Road Call requirements in the performance-based contract are much more stringent than in the taxi contracts.

Performance standards scoring one (exceeding standard benchmark) or two (meeting standard benchmark) for Tokmakjian Inc. are listed in Table 9.

Table 9
Performance Requirements Exceeding or Meeting Standard Benchmark
(Tokmakjian)

Exceeding Standard Benchmark	Meeting Standard Benchmark
• Missed Trips • Kilometres Between Road Calls • In-Service Wheelchair Lift/Ramp Failure • In-Service Air Conditioning/Heating • Preventative Maintenance Inspections • Repairs Required as a result of Maintenance Inspections/Audits • Accident Damage Repairs • Exterior Clean • Interior Clean • Commercial Vehicle Operators Registration - CVOR • Vehicles Removed from Service for Safety-Related Deficiencies	• On-Time Performance • Escorting

- Customer Complaints
 - Customer Satisfaction Survey
 - Service Training
 - Securement
 - Hand-to-Hand Policy
-

Performance standards scoring three (below standard benchmark) and indicating a need for improvement are listed below in Table 10.

Table 10
Performance Requirements Below Standard Benchmark (Tokmakjian)

Below Standard Benchmark
• Accidents (Preventable) • Service Training • Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets • Accidents/Incident Reports

CORRECTIVE MEASURES

Mobility Plus staff continue to work with contractors to implement corrective measures to improve upon their overall performance

Current initiatives include:

- Monthly review of report card data with contractors by both Operations and Fleet sections of YRT.
- Development of an electronic vehicle maintenance tracking database for Mobility Plus buses.
- Continue to work with YRT's Capital Assets group to include the Mobility Plus bus and dedicated taxi fleet (accessible minivans and sedans) in their audit process.
- Additional audits and verification meetings to be held with contractors that focus solely on training issues. This includes a review of current training delivery methods, vulnerable sector screening, securement, and customer service.
- Implement additional random vehicle inspections focusing on interior and exterior cleaning, and vehicle maintenance.
- Continue to work with each contractor to improve and investigate various cleaning practices pertaining to interior and exterior cleaning.
- Introduction of new inspection audits for vehicle maintenance and training records at the contractors garage. The objective will be to inspect 25% of all contracted vehicles in each quarter.
- Continue to conduct monthly operations meetings with contractors to discuss service issues, resource issues, and operator training requirements.
- Continue to hold twice annual contractor workshops.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Incentives paid to the Mobility Plus contractors for 2009 totalled \$21,100

Incentive payments are made to the Mobility Plus contractors based on data collected pursuant to the performance-based contract. Each dedicated sedan taxi contractor and accessible van contractor has the opportunity to receive up to a total of \$17,500 in incentive payments during each contract year. In addition, the bus-only contractor has the opportunity to receive up to a total of \$20,000 in incentive payments during each contract year. The total annual amount of performance-based incentives available for all Mobility Plus contractors collectively amounts to \$102,000. This represents 1.5% of the total annual value of all Mobility Plus contracts.

Contractors receive incentives for individual performance standards when they exceed the benchmark score. Disincentives are levied against the contractor when they do not meet the benchmark score. For example, in 2008, Royal Taxi was awarded a total of \$13,250 in incentives and assessed \$8,700 in disincentives. The net result is an incentive payment of \$4,500. Performance standards such as failing to escort or failing to properly secure customers are assessed at \$100 disincentive for each verified occurrence. They can quickly add up to the point where they negate any incentives earned.

Total incentive payments made to Mobility Plus contractors in 2008 and 2009 are outlined in Table 11.

Table 11
Performance Payments to the Mobility Plus Contractors

Contractor	2008 Incentives*	2009 Incentives
MTS (Sedan & Minivans)	\$9,600	\$11,900
Care Accessible (Minivans)	\$8,000	\$7,500
Royal Taxi (Sedan & Minivans)	\$4,500	(\$4,700)
Tokmakjian (Bus)	\$6,700	\$6,400
Total	\$28,800	\$21,100

*Each performance standard has a different value. Incentive payments to the contractor are determined by the number of performance standards exceeded by the contractor and the value associated with those performance standards. Disincentive payments to the contractor are determined by the number of performance standards falling below expectations by the contractor and the value associated with those performance standards.

The funding required for the maximum incentive payments to the contractor is included in the operating budget each year.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Transit customers from the local municipalities benefit from the Contractor Report Card Program through the continual monitoring of service, and the identification of areas in need of improvement. This ensures that customers will continue to receive quality public transit services.

7. CONCLUSION

The Contractor Report Card provides staff with a management tool that continually monitors the performance of Mobility Plus operations and maintenance contractors, and identifies opportunities for quality improvement.

The 2009 Mobility Plus Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card summary is attached as *Attachment 1*.

For more information on this report, please contact Sharon Doyle, Manager, Mobility Plus at Ext. 5634.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause is attached to this report.)

January 1 to December 31, 2009

Bus		Accessible Minivan										Sedan				
		Can-Ar		Care Accessible		MTS		Royal		MTS		Royal				
		Date	Score	Date	Score	Date	Score	Date	Score	Date	Score	Date	Score			
Performance Standards		Per.	Req.											Average		
1A	On-Time Performance (% of on-time pick-ups, drop-offs or departure (bus) observations; being late no more than 10 minutes) Missed Trips = Bus/Vehicle No Shows = Minivan & Sedan (% of not missed trip observations; vehicles departing more than 20.00 minutes late shall be considered a missed trip)	Q	94-95.99%	95.64%	2	99.22%	1	96.09%	1	96.88%	1	97.40%	1	90.63%	1	95.98%
1B		Q	95 - 98%	99.99%	1	100.00%	1	99.99%	1	99.99%	1	99.99%	1	100.00%	1	99.99%
2A	Kilometres Between Road Calls (Bus Only) (average # of km per vehicle per In-service Road Call)	Q	8,000 - 10,000 km	12.291	1	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		8.690
2B	In-Service Wheelchair Lift / Ramp Failures (% of vehicle observations with functioning wheelchair/scooter lifts/ramps)	Q	100%	100%	1	97.90%	2	97.27%	2	97.83%	2	N/A		N/A		98.90%
2C	In-Service Air Conditioning / Heating (% of vehicle observations with functioning HVAC systems)		100%	100%	1	100.00%	1	96.36%	2	98.91%	2	100.00%	1	100%	1	99.20%
2D	Preventative Maintenance Inspections (Bus Only) (% of incidences within 1,000 km PMI interval)	Q	90-95%	97.70%	1	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		92.86%
2E	Repairs Required as a Result of Maintenance Inspections/Audits (# of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles - non-safety related)	Q	Repair allowance of 10 days	0.00	1	0.00	1	0.00	1	1.00	2	0.00	1	0.00	1	0%
2F	Accident Damage Repairs (# of days beyond repair allowance for all vehicles)	Q	Repair allowance of 20 days	0.00	1	0.00	1	0.00	1	0.00	1	0.00	1	0.00	1	0
2G	Exterior Clean (% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned exterior's)	Q	95 - 98%	98.77%	1	86.01%	3	90.00%	3	80.43%	3	88.97%	3	86.72%	3	88.10%
2G	Interior Clean (% of vehicle observations with properly cleaned interior's)	Q	95 - 98%	100.00%	1	90.21%	3	90.91%	3	89.67%	3	91.03%	3	96.88%	2	93.60%
3A	CVOR (Bus Only) (Commercial Vehicle Operator's Registration; status of carrier safety rating)	Q	satisfactory - unaudited	Satisfactory -	1	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A
3B	Accidents (Bus Preventable & Non-Preventable only) (avg. kilometres per vehicle per preventable accident)	Q	30,000 km	11.950	3	N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A		N/A
3C	Vehicle Removed from Service for Safety Related Deficiencies (% of vehicle not removed from service)	Q	100%	100%	1	97.20%	2	100.00%	1	97.28%	2	100.00%	1	96.48%	2	98.10%
4A	Customer Complaints (# of complaints per 1,000 passenger trips)	Q	5 - 10 complaints	0.75	1	1.05	1	0.46	1	2.39	1	0.26	1	1.47	1	1.18
4B	Customer Satisfaction Survey (biennial survey)	BA	85-90%	92%	1	91%	1	91%	1	91%	1	90%	1	90%	1	91%
5A	Service Training (All operators to be certified and receives annual training refreshers 18 hrs - bus; 3 hrs - minivan & sedan; pass/fail)	A	100%	Fail*	1	Pass	1	Pass	1	Fail*	3	Pass	1	Fail*	3	Pass
6A	Management Reports and TW CARES Tickets (# of days late for all reports)	Q	95 - 98%	47.00%	3	43.00%	3	53.00%	3	71.00%	3	50.00%	3	78.00%	3	57%
6B	Accident / Incident Reports (# days beyond reporting allowance for all accidents/incidents)	Q	95 - 98%	48%	3	0%	3	0%	3	14%	3	20%	3	71%	3	26%
7A	Personnel Escorting (% of observations with drivers properly escorting customers to and from first accessible door) Random, telephone/CARE Tickets	Q	100%	98.77%	2	99.30%	2	100.00%	1	99.46%	2	98.62%	2	98.05%	2	Pass
7B	Securement (% of observations with drivers properly securing customers)	Q	100%	100.00%	1	97.90%	2	95.45%	2	96.74%	2	100.00%	1	98.83%	2	Pass
7C	Hand to Hand Policy (% of observations with drivers properly following Hand to Hand Procedures) Random, Telephone and CARE Tickets	Q	100%	100.00%	1	100.00%	1	100.00%	1	100.00%	1	100.00%	1	100.00%	1	Pass
Total Score				29	29		28		33		25		28			
OVERALL RANK		N/A		2		1		3		1		2				