

9

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES LESLIE STREET ROAD IMPROVEMENTS TOWNS OF AURORA AND RICHMOND HILL, PROJECT 97150

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendation contained in the following report, February 7, 2005, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Dillon Consulting Limited be engaged to undertake the Engineering Services for the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for reconstruction of Leslie Street (Y.R. 12) from south of Bethesda Sideroad to north of Bloomington Road (Y.R. 40) at a total upset limit fee of \$315,335.00, plus GST.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends the retention of consulting engineers to complete the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design for reconstruction of Leslie Street from south of Bethesda Sideroad to north of Bloomington Road.

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Project Description

The Regional Municipality of York's transportation and roadway management strategies have identified future road network needs along the Leslie Street corridor from south of Bethesda Sideroad to north of Bloomington Road.

To address these needs, York Region's objectives for this project are, but not limited to, the following:

- Enhancing road user safety by improving the geometry and roadside environment of Leslie Street.
- Reducing the accident rate and severity on this section of Leslie Street to below the York Region average.
- Reducing annual operating and maintenance costs.
- Improving the strategic linkages between communities within York Region by systematically upgrading Leslie Street between Aurora and Richmond Hill.

3.2 Scope of Assignment

The scope of work for this assignment includes:

- A complete study of roadway improvements for Leslie Street from south of Bethesda Sideroad to north of Bloomington Road in accordance with all requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) document for municipal projects, prepared by the Municipal Engineers Association dated June 2000. The study shall be classified as a Schedule 'C' and be completed through to the end of Phase 4 as outlined in the Class EA document.
- Complete the study to meet the requirements of Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) as required and coordinate it with the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, under the concept of "one project – one assessment".
- Complete the preliminary design of the project requirements, including all field investigations, reviews, relevant tests, inspections and studies, with due regard for environmental, traffic accommodation and safety concerns, capital cost and operating efficiency all in accordance with York Region standards, specifications and practices.

3.3 Project Phasing

The Region's 10 Year Road Construction Program for 2005 has identified the timing for the works on Leslie Street as follows:

- Leslie Street Schedule 'C' Class Environmental Assessment (EA) – 2005/2006.
- Leslie Street Detailed Design – 2006/2007.
- Leslie Street Construction – 2008.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Outcome of Evaluation of Proposals

In accordance with the Purchasing By-law, Expressions of Interest (EOI) were received for this work in response to an appropriate advertisement in a publication of general circulation. All EOI's were reviewed and based on the results of the evaluation three firms were invited to submit a response to our Request for Proposal (RFP) document.

The three firms invited to submit written proposals for this assignment were as follows:

- Chisholm Fleming and Associates.
- Dillon Consulting Limited.
- National Capital Engineering Limited.

All three consulting firms submitted a proposal in response to this RFP.

The Region used the "two envelope" evaluation process for this RFP, in which Technical/Management Proposals were opened and evaluated prior to the opening and evaluation of the corresponding Financial Proposals. The total weighting of the technical/management proposal is 80% and the total weighting of the financial proposal is 20%. This allocation of technical/management and financial will ensure that the assignment is awarded to not only a very technically competent consultant but also a cost competitive consultant.

The technical proposals were evaluated based on the following technical criteria:

- Project Team Experience.
- Project Management.
- Project Implementation.

In accordance with the terms of the RFP, the financial proposals were opened only after Region staff agreed to the overall technical scores. After compliance of the financial proposals had been established, the overall proposal was evaluated based on a weighting of 80% for the technical/management proposal and 20% for the financial proposal. The best proposal was deemed the one with the highest total score.

The consultant proposal evaluation summary is presented in Table 1 and includes the Technical Score, the Upset Limit Fee and corresponding Financial Score and the Total Score for each proponent.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 80)	Upset Limit Fee Excluding GST	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
Dillon Consulting Limited	60.5	\$315,335	12.0	72.5
National Capital Engineering Limited	61.2	337,500	11.2	72.4
Chisholm Fleming and Associates	48.4	\$189,649	20.0	68.4

Dillon Consulting Limited was ranked second highest on the technical portion of the proposal. The Dillon Consulting Limited technical proposal had a good combination of project management and technical staff with a firm corporate commitment of the necessary resources to complete this complex assignment. Their proposal presented a sound understanding of the unique project requirements and the sensitive environmental issues. Their proposal elaborated on the significant involvement and communication that will be required with agencies and stakeholders and elaborated on the need to not only meet but also exceed the minimum requirements of the Municipal Class EA document. Dillon Consulting Limited developed a reasonable and achievable project work plan and schedule that focused on project delivery and milestone deliverables and highlighted the importance of coordination and communication.

The best overall (combination of technical and financial) proposal was received from Dillon Consulting Limited as their proposal had the highest total score and represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

Although Chisholm Fleming and Associates proposed the lowest upset limit fee, their Total Score was less than the other proponents. This resulted from the relatively low Technical Score which was based on the evaluation team's consensus score of their proposal. It should be noted that the project management portion of their proposal, which includes schedule development and control, staff/sub-consultant allocation and control and quality control of services, did not meet the Region's expectations.

In addition, the technical proposal submitted by Chisholm, Fleming and Associates did not convey a strong understanding of the environmental sensitivities of this project. Specifically, the allocation of time to environmental field investigations and analysis did not meet the minimum expectations. It should be noted that the financial proposal also reflected a significantly lower level of effort allocated to the environmental investigations and analysis. As a result the upset limit fee proposed by Chisholm Fleming and Associates was lower than the other proponents.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the work is \$315, 335.00 plus GST.

There are sufficient funds in the 2005 budget for the assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project will improve traffic safety and operations for the travelling public within the local road network. It will also support continued growth within the Towns of Aurora and Richmond Hill.

Throughout the Class EA, Regional staff will work closely with staff from the Towns of Aurora and Richmond Hill to accommodate their requirements in the Class EA and preliminary design.

7. CONCLUSION

Consultants' proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, by-laws and practices. The proposal submitted by Dillon Consulting Limited addressed all of the requirements for this assignment, including qualified and knowledgeable personnel, and proposed a sound methodology to complete this assignment. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The consulting engineering firm of Dillon Consulting Limited be engaged to carry out the Class Environmental Assessment and preliminary design for improvements to Leslie

Street from south of Bethesda Sideroad to North of Bloomington Road at an upset limit fee of \$315,335.00 excluding GST.

The appropriate Regional officials be authorized to take all necessary steps to execute a formal agreement with Dillon Consulting Limited for the delivery of these services.

This report has been reviewed by the Senior Management Group.