

6

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES GAMBLE ROAD / 19TH AVENUE AND BAYVIEW AVENUE TOWN OF RICHMOND HILL

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report dated February 19, 2009, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services.

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. Regional Council authorize retaining the consulting firm of McCormick Rankin Corporation for engineering services for road widening, structures and associated works for Gamble Road/19th Avenue (Y.R 29) and Bayview Avenue (Y.R. 34) in the Town of Richmond Hill, at a cost not to exceed \$3,597,867, inclusive of GST.
2. The Region enter into a contract with McCormick Rankin Corporation for the provision of engineering services as set out in this report.
3. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to execute the contract, subject to terms and conditions acceptable to the Commissioner of Transportation Services and the approval of Legal Services as to form and content.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends retaining a consulting engineering firm to provide professional and technical engineering services to complete the detailed design of the following road works in the Town of Richmond Hill:

- Gamble Road from 180m east of Bathurst Street to Rothbury Road.
- 19th Avenue from Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue.
- Bayview Avenue from Elgin Mills Road to Stouffville Road.

A location plan is appended to this report (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with the Region's Purchasing By-law, a report to Regional Council is required to award an assignment when a Request for Proposal (RFP) has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

York Region's 10-Year Capital Program provides for the widening of Gamble Road/19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue in the Town of Richmond Hill. Accordingly, an RFP was issued to qualified firms to deliver the detailed design, obtain the requisite permits and prepare construction tender packages necessary to fulfill the undertakings and commitments identified in the 10-Year Capital Program and as planned for in the previously approved:

- Environmental Study Report, Gamble Road/19th Avenue from Bathurst Street to Leslie Street.
- Environmental Study Report, Bayview Avenue from Elgin Mills Road to Stouffville Road.

Both Environmental Study Reports (ESR) recommended the widening of the road sections noted herein to provide four lanes of through traffic, plus auxiliary turning lanes at intersections.

The project is in a sensitive natural environment

The southern limit of the Oak Ridges Moraine is located south of 19th Avenue. The project area is located within the headwaters area of the Rouge River Watershed and the Rouge River Headwater Wetland Complex, a provincially significant wetland.

The central and south portions of the project area along Bayview Avenue are covered with a surface deposit of glacial till. Beneath the till is the regionally extensive Oak Ridges Moraine Aquifer Complex, which if exposed, will cause groundwater to rise and flow above ground. This happened when the CN structure on Bayview Avenue, north of 19th Avenue was constructed in 1968. The groundwater table was intercepted and started providing cold water base flow to the ditches on the east and west sides of Bayview Avenue, south of the CN structure. Today, the watercourses flowing along the ditches are a sensitive cold water fish habitat supporting a resident Brook Trout fishery and are a part of the Rouge River headwater system. As part of this assignment the watercourse on the east side of Bayview Avenue has to be relocated to allow for the road widening on Bayview Avenue.

Gamble Road and 19th Avenue to be widened to four through lanes

The approved ESR completed in 2001, recommended the widening of Gamble Road and 19th Avenue proceed in phases, with an interim three-lane cross section envisioned for 2002 and an ultimate five-lane cross section by 2011. The approved ESR also provided for a grade separation at the CN/GO Transit Rail crossing if warrants were met at the time of ultimate widening to five lanes.

To date, York Region has completed a portion of the recommendations from the ESR. In 2004, Gamble Road was widened from two lanes to three lanes, from 180m west of Bathurst Street to Rothbury Road, and to five lanes, from Rothbury Road to Yonge Street. Sidewalks and illumination were implemented on Gamble Road at that time. The proposed work on Gamble Road under this assignment requires installation of storm sewers in the existing north side ditches, the provision of two additional lanes on the north side of Gamble Road and the associated restoration.

The originally envisioned widening of 19th Avenue, from Yonge Street to Bayview Avenue, to an interim three-lane cross section per the ESR, has not been undertaken because of the recent need to install the York Durham Sanitary Sewer (YDSS) within this area. The YDSS project was completed in 2008. Due to continued growth and development in the adjoining area, the need for the ultimate five-lane cross section on 19th Avenue has now materialized. Accordingly, 19th Avenue is now to be designed to suit the ultimate cross section provided for in the ESR and the plans include the construction of a new bridge to carry CN Rail over 19th Avenue.

Bayview Avenue to be widened to four through lanes

The Bayview Avenue ESR was filed in 2006 and was approved by the Minister of Environment in 2008. In addition to approving the road widening, the approved ESR requires the Region to maintain existing cold water base flows feeding existing fisheries ditches located on both sides of the road. In order to widen the road, the ESR proposed to relocate the existing fisheries to a new cold water stream envelope on the east side of Bayview Avenue, south of 19th Avenue. The ESR also includes reconstruction and widening of the intersection of 19th Avenue to accommodate the ultimate widening of 19th Avenue. None of the recommended improvements identified in the ESR have been implemented to date. Although the Bayview Avenue sections are included in the Region's 10-Year Roads Construction Program for construction in 2015, considerable advance work will be undertaken on Bayview Avenue as part of the 19th Avenue contract including major improvements at the intersection of 19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue and the relocation of watercourses along Bayview Avenue.

Beneficial to combine the two projects

Both projects face complex issues including challenging ground conditions, significant geometric improvements at a common intersection, common rail authority, and have regulatory requirements for cold water fisheries on the same watercourses. Accordingly, the Region has combined the detailed design assignments for Gamble Road/19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue into one assignment, to benefit from synergies and avoid duplication of effort with the view to streamlining the approvals and permitting processes and ultimately the delivery of the tender packages.

Assignment includes the preparation of five construction packages

The detailed design assignment is split into five parts and includes the preparation of five construction packages as follows:

- Part 1 - Widening of 19th Avenue to four through lanes from Yonge Street to 100m east of Linda Margaret Crescent
- Part 2 – Widening of Gamble Road from two to four through lanes from 180m east of Bathurst Street to Rothbury Road
- Part 3 – Widening of 19th Avenue to four through lanes from Linda Margaret Crescent to 200m east of Bayview Avenue including a structure over CN Rail and complete watercourse relocation on Bayview Avenue
- Part 4 – Widening of Bayview Avenue to four through lanes from Elgin Mills Road to 19th Avenue
- Part 5 – Widening of Bayview Avenue to four through lanes from 19th Avenue to Stouffville Road

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms were selected from Expression of Interest No. P-08-66 and were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. The following firms were invited to submit proposals:

- AECOM
- Delcan Corporation
- McCormick Rankin Corporation

AECOM participated in the RFP process but did not submit a proposal. Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened and the proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

Evaluation summary

The proponents, their technical scores and upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Gamble Road/19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue

Consultant	Technical Score (Out of 80 pts)	Financial Score (Out of 20 pts)	Total Score (Out of 100 pts)	Total Upset Fee (Including GST)
McCormick Rankin Corporation	53.5	20.0	73.5	\$3,597,867.00
Delcan Corporation	49.6	19.6	69.2	\$3,642,413.88

Both technical proposals from Delcan Corporation and McCormick Rankin Corporation were technically competent and within five points of each other. McCormick Rankin scored better technically and their financial proposal was slightly lower, receiving the highest score of 73.5. McCormick Rankin Corporation undertook the environmental assessment study for Bayview Avenue and the preliminary design for the 19th Avenue structure over CN Rail and are familiar with the project. Their proposal demonstrated a better understanding of the project issues, timelines, permitting requirements, sensitivities and constraints.

McCormick Rankin's proposal with the highest technical score, the lowest fee and the lowest total cost per technical point represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

The Supplies and Services Branch has reviewed the evaluation summary and has issued their internal report confirming McCormick Rankin Corporation be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Gamble Road/ 19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue detailed design assignment under Request for Proposal P-08-105.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the detailed design assignment is \$3,426,540, excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in the Region's approved 2009 10-Year Roads Construction Program.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project is required in order to address the transportation needs and accommodate growth in the Region and the Town of Richmond Hill. The project will improve traffic safety, capacity and operations for the travelling public within the Regional and local road network. The detailed design assignment will facilitate the road improvements required to enhance existing operations and support future growth.

Throughout the course of the detailed design assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Town of Richmond Hill to accommodate their requirements for sidewalks and illumination in the Gamble Road/ 19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue corridors.

Town and Regional staff have explored the option to build a temporary sidewalk on 19th Avenue between Yonge Street and Linda Margaret Crescent, prior to the Region's road widening contract. As the Region plans to construct this section of Bayview Avenue in 2010, Richmond Hill staff have agreed that the benefits of waiting for a permanent sidewalk as part of the Region's contract outweigh the throwaway costs and impacts associated with installing a temporary sidewalk for less than a year.

7. CONCLUSION

It is necessary to proceed with the Gamble Road/ 19th Avenue and Bayview Avenue detailed design assignment under Request for Proposal (RFP) P-08-105, in order to implement the undertakings programmed under the Region's 10-Year Capital Program.

Consultant's proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Region's Purchasing By-law. The proposal from McCormick Rankin Corporation represents the best overall value to the Region and it is recommended that the proposal assignment be awarded to them.

For more information on this report, contact Paul Jankowski, General Manager, Roads at extension 5901 in the Transportation Services Department.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the March 4, 2009 Committee meeting.)