

12

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES DAVIS DRIVE IMPROVEMENTS TOWN OF NEWMARKET, PROJECT 81800

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, February 15, 2006, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of NCE Limited be engaged to undertake the engineering services for the Class Environmental Assessment and preliminary design for road improvements on Davis Drive (Y.R. 31) from Yonge Street (Y.R. 1) to Highway 404 at a total upset limit fee of \$755,580.50, including GST
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report recommends the retention of consulting engineers to complete the class environmental assessment and preliminary design for road improvements on Davis Drive from Yonge Street to Highway 404. A location plan is appended to this report (*see Attachment 1*).

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Project Description

The Region's transportation and roadway management strategies have identified the potential for operational and safety improvements in the area of the Davis Drive corridor between Main Street and Prospect Street. Accordingly, the Region's latest approved 10-Year Roads Construction Program has scheduled the implementation of improvement works on Davis Drive between Main Street and Prospect Street, in 2009.

In 2004, through network screening analysis, Davis Drive between Yonge Street and Highway 404 was identified as a corridor with high potential for operational and safety improvement. It was included in the 2004 Traffic Safety Improvement Program and staff subsequently conducted an Operational Safety Review of the Davis Drive corridor

between Highway 404 and Yonge Street. The review identified the potential for roadway improvements in order to reduce collisions and congestion on Davis Drive.

In response to the findings of review, in the summer of 2005, it was decided to extend the study area limits for the Environmental Assessment Study to cover the Davis Drive from west of Yonge Street to Highway 404. Depending on the recommendations of the study, Regional priorities and available funding, the scope of works currently included in the Region's 10 Year Construction Program, may be revised.

Southlake Regional Health Centre, located on Davis Drive and within the study area, is currently undergoing significant expansion. The expansion plans include the construction of a Medical Arts Building, Regional Cancer Centre and car parking structure at the intersection of Davis Drive and Prospect Street. The redevelopment will allow Southlake to offer the highest level of care available in York Region, Simcoe County and south Muskoka in areas such as cancer and cardiac care, among a range of health care services.

The study may identify improvements to Davis Drive that will enable better access to the hospital and improve traffic operations in the vicinity of the hospital. Regional staff have already met with staff from Southlake Regional Health Centre and the Town of Newmarket to work in cooperation to facilitate the hospital's expansion plans, as well as to discuss and scope the Davis Drive Improvements study. Over the duration of the study, the Region will continue to work closely with staff from the Town and hospital to accommodate their requirements wherever possible.

The purpose of this assignment is to conduct a Class Environmental Assessment Study (Schedule "C") to determine specific improvements to Davis Drive from west of Yonge Street to Highway 404 for implementation in the Region's 10-Year Roads Construction Program. If required, the study shall identify the phased implementation of the improvements.

3.2 Scope of Assignment

The scope of work for this assignment includes:

- A complete study of roadway improvements for Davis Drive from Yonge Street to Highway 404 in accordance with all requirements of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) document for municipal projects, prepared by the Municipal Engineers Association dated June 2000. The study shall be classified as a Schedule 'C' and be completed through to the end of Phase 4 as outlined in the Class EA document.
- Complete the study to meet the requirements of Canadian Environmental Assessment Act (CEAA) as required and coordinate it with the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment, under the concept of "one project – one assessment".

Complete the preliminary design of the project requirements, including all field investigations, reviews, relevant tests, inspections and studies, with due regard for environmental, traffic accommodation and safety concerns, capital cost and operating efficiency all in accordance with York Region standards, specifications and practices.

3.3 Project Phasing

The Region's proposed 2006 10-Year Road Construction Program has identified the timing for the improvement works on Davis Drive from Main Street to Prospect Street is scheduled for 2009. Depending on the recommendations of the Class EA study, Regional priorities and available funding the scope of works currently included in the Region's 10-Year Capital Forecast, may be revised. The timing for construction may be revised to 2010, depending on ease of property acquisition and subsequent utility relocation.

The anticipated schedule for the first stage of this work is as follows:

- Davis Drive Schedule 'C' Class Environmental Assessment (EA) – 2006/2007.
- Detailed Design – 2007/2008
- Construction – 2009/2010

Through the study, the Region will assess the requirements for improvements and prioritize the works. Where possible, staff will make efforts to facilitate acceleration of the works adjacent to the hospital in order to coincide with completion of the hospital redevelopment, scheduled for the end of 2008.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Outcome of Evaluation of Proposals

In accordance with the Regional Purchasing By-law, Expressions of Interest (EOI) were received for this work in response to an appropriate advertisement in a publication of general circulation. All EOI's were reviewed and based on the results of the evaluation three firms were invited to submit a response to our Request for Proposal (RFP) document.

The three firms invited to submit written proposals for this assignment were as follows:

- iTRANS Consulting Inc.
- NCE Limited
- Stantec Consulting Ltd.

Stantec Consulting did not attend the mandatory proponents meeting and were therefore disqualified. Stantec did not submit a proposal.

The Region used the "two envelope" evaluation process for this RFP, in which technical/management proposals were opened and evaluated prior to the opening and evaluation of the corresponding financial proposals. The total weighting of the technical/management

proposal is 70% and the total weighting of the financial proposal is 30%. This allocation of technical/management and financial will ensure that the assignment is awarded to a consultant that is very technically competent as well as cost competitive.

The technical proposals were evaluated based on the following technical criteria:

- Project Team Experience
- Project Management
- Project Implementation

In accordance with the terms of the RFP, the financial proposals were opened only after Region staff agreed to the overall technical scores. After compliance of the financial proposals had been established, the overall proposal was evaluated based on a weighting of 70% for the technical/management proposal and 30% for the financial proposal. The best proposal was deemed the one with the highest total score.

The consultant proposal evaluation summary is presented in Table 1 and includes the Technical Score, the Upset Limit Fee and corresponding Financial Score and the Total Score for each proponent.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 70)	Upset Limit Fee Excluding GST	Financial Score (Out of 30)	Total Score (Out of 100)
iTRANS Consulting Inc.	44.0	\$832,567.00	25.4	69.4
NCE Limited	51.8	\$706,150.00	30.0	81.8

The best overall (combination of technical and financial) proposal was received from NCE Limited as their proposal had the highest total score and represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

The proposal from NCE Limited received the highest technical score and featured a good complement of senior project management and technical staff. They have indicated a firm corporate commitment to carry out the project to the satisfaction of the Region and within the time frame required. Their proposal presented a sound understanding of the unique project requirements and constraints. In addition, their proposal featured an enhanced public consultation plan which will be a key component to the success of this study by managing agency, public and stakeholder expectations.

The Supplies and Services Branch has reviewed the evaluation summary and has issued their internal report confirming that NCE Limited be recommended as the successful overall proponent for this assignment

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the work is \$706,150.00 excluding GST.

As indicated above, the scope of the study has been significantly increased and therefore sufficient funds are not currently allocated in the Region's proposed 2006 Roads Capital Budget and Ten-Year Program for this study. Current expenditures and sources of funding allocated for this project are given in the following table:

Table 2
Proposed Budgeted Expenditures and Sources of Funding (Cash Flow in 000s)

Project	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	Total
Davis Drive from Yonge Street to Hwy 404	\$70	\$50	\$105	\$280	\$1,240	\$1,745
Total	\$70	\$50	\$105	\$280	\$1,240	\$1,745
DCs	\$42	\$30	\$62	\$167	\$738	\$1,038
Tax Levy	\$28	\$20	\$43	\$113	\$502	\$707

A major portion of the engineering fee for this Class EA Study will be required in 2006/2007. Depending on the recommendations of the study and Regional priorities, implementation of improvements may be revised to include sections of Davis Drive on a prioritized basis. Capital funding will be adjusted accordingly in the upcoming 2007 Capital Budget Process.

The section of 19th Avenue between Yonge Street and Leslie Street included in the 2006 10-Year Roads Construction Program, is scheduled for construction starting in 2006 with \$8.2 Million included in the 2006 budget. As implementation of the project has been delayed due to sequencing of works related to the 19th Avenue YDSS Interceptor project, sufficient funds are available in the 2006 Roads Capital Budget to be reallocated to this project. It is proposed to reallocate funds for the Davis Drive project to cover 2006 expenditures and adjust funding for both projects in the upcoming 2007 Capital Budget in order to reinstate funds for the 19th Avenue project and allocate additional funds for the Davis Drive study, for use in 2007.

The upset limit fee includes provisional items for consulting engineering activities such as stage two archaeological assessments or additional public meetings, if required. The

consultant will only be paid for the provisional item(s) if specifically directed by the Region to undertake the work covered under the provisional item(s).

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The Davis Drive road improvements will be constructed in the Town of Newmarket. The project will improve traffic safety and operations for the travelling public and pedestrians within the local road network. The Town of Newmarket has noted many concerns from the residents and business community requesting improvements to address the high levels of congestion, particularly in the section from Yonge Street to Prospect Street. It will also identify streetscaping opportunities for this main roadway in the Town of Newmarket.

Throughout the Class EA, Regional staff will work closely with staff from the Town of Newmarket to accommodate their requirements in the Class EA and preliminary design.

7. CONCLUSION

Consultants' proposals for this project were evaluated in accordance with Regional policy, by-laws and practices. The proposal submitted by NCE Limited addressed all of the requirements for this assignment, including qualified and knowledgeable personnel, and proposed a sound methodology to complete this assignment. The proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the March 1, 2006 Committee meeting.)