

6

CONSULTANT SELECTION NORTH DON COLLECTOR SEWER REHABILITATION AND RIVER BANK STABILIZATION

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends:

- 1. The recommendations contained in the following report, January 21, 2004, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works be adopted; and**
- 2. Staff be requested to review the evaluation process and provide a report to Committee regarding this matter.**

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of MacViro Consultants Inc. be retained to undertake the detailed design and contract administration activities necessary to complete the North Don collector sewer rehabilitation and river bank stabilization for an upset fee of \$103,604.20 including GST.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to retain an engineering consultant to complete the detailed design, tendering and contract administration services for the rehabilitation and river bank stabilization of the North Don sewage collector.

3. BACKGROUND

The York Durham Sewer System provides wastewater collection services to the core urban areas of Vaughan, Markham, Richmond Hill, Aurora and Newmarket. As part of the annual maintenance program, sections of the sewer are inspected on an annual basis to monitor leakage and pipe condition.

Inspections along the North Don collector revealed significant amounts of infiltration as well as material accumulation and encrustation along the internal pipe walls. In addition, a section of the Little Don River was found to be encroaching on some of the sewer and requires re-alignment and bank stabilization to protect an adjacent maintenance access structure.

This section of the North Don Collector will also be transmitting future flows from residential development currently approved for Blocks 10 and future developments pending approval in Blocks 10, 11 and 12 within Vaughan. Sewage from these areas will be increasing as the developments proceed.

It is expected that this section of the North Don collector rehabilitation will be completed in 2004.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

A Request for Proposal was issued to four consulting firms and closed on December 16, 2003. The RFP was issued through invitation as the fees for the assignment were expected to be less than \$100,000. The four firms invited to submit proposals were:

- Conestoga Rovers and Associates.
- MacViro Consultants Inc.
- R. V. Anderson and Associates.
- Totten Sims Hubicki and Associates.

Proposals were received from MacViro Consultants Inc. and Totten Sims Hubicki and Associates (TSH).

Proposals were evaluated based on technical and financial merit. The technical evaluation was based on predefined criteria which accounted for 80% of the evaluation score. Firms achieving a score of 60% or higher were further evaluated based on the financial information which was scored to a maximum of 20%.

The proposal evaluation results are summarized in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Fee Proposal	Financial Score (Out of 20)	Total Score (Out of 100)
MacViro Consultants	63.8	\$103,604.20	19.0	82.8
TSH	60.4	\$98,190.00	20.0	80.4

MacViro Consultants ranked highest in the technical score and, rate the highest in the combined technical and financial score.

There were two factors which resulted in MacViro achieving a higher score. The first factor was previous experience with rehabilitation projects along this particular section of the North Don collector. This experience provides MacViro with first hand knowledge of the soil conditions and other site specific challenges that could be encountered in this project.

The second factor was the consultant's proposed methodology for obtaining approvals from the various agencies. Region staff have encountered significant challenges in the

past with regard to approvals for watercourse works and the consultant's proposed methodology appears to address these issues.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The fee for this assignment is \$103,604.20 including GST and there are sufficient funds allocated in the proposed 2004 budget.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The North Don collector was constructed in the mid 1970's and forms an important link to area wide servicing in York Region. The proposed developments for Blocks 10, 11 and 12 within Vaughan as well as areas in Richmond Hill are relying on the availability of this link as part of the area servicing scheme.

7. CONCLUSION

Based on the prescribed competitive proposal process, Region staff recommend that MacViro Consultants be retained to perform the necessary works to design and administer the North Don collector sewer rehabilitation and river bank stabilization project for the upset fee of \$103,640.20 including GST.

There is sufficient funding in the proposed 2004 budget for this assignment.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.