

5

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES LESLIE STREET TOWNS OF AURORA AND NEWMARKET (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-07-44) PROJECTS 84180, 84190, 70050

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, January 24, 2008, from the Commissioner of Environmental Services:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Genivar Ontario Inc. be engaged to undertake the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) for Road Improvements on Leslie Street (Y.R. 12) from Wellington Street (Y.R. 15) to Mulock Drive (Y.R. 74) and the Class EA, detailed design and construction administration of a new watermain to connect the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts along Leslie Street from Wellington Street (Y.R. 15) to Davis Drive (Y.R. 31) as outlined in this report, at an upset limit cost of \$1,818,755 excluding GST.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

This report is to engage a qualified consulting engineering firm to carry out the following:

- Class EA for Road Improvements to Leslie Street from Wellington Street to Mulock Drive in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket (*see Attachment 1*).
- Class EA, detailed design, and construction administration for a watermain to connect the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts along Leslie Street, from Wellington Street to Davis Drive in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket (*see Attachment 1*).

In compliance with the Region's purchasing by-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

The Region's Transportation Master Plan identified future road needs in the Leslie Street corridor between Wellington Street and Mulock Drive. The 2008 10-Year Roads Capital Program includes Leslie Street road improvements between State Farm Way and Mulock Drive in 2015.

The 2004 Long Term Water Master Plan identified the need to interconnect the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts. The identified connection will utilize the Leslie Street corridor from Wellington Street to Davis Drive. A pressure regulating valve chamber will connect the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts. The watermain has been identified to be in service by 2011.

The road improvements Class EA Study has been combined with the watermain Class EA Study, detailed design and construction administration to enhance the value of services obtained under this consulting assignment, eliminate duplications in work, and ensure timely delivery of the project.

3.1 Project Description

The Leslie Street corridor between Wellington Street and approximately 400m north of St. John's Sideroad is located within the Town of Aurora and the Leslie Street corridor from approximately 400m north of St. John's Sideroad to Davis Drive is located within the Town of Newmarket.

Some of the major features located within the Leslie Street study area are nine regulatory area crossings containing tributaries of Marsh Creek, Weslie Creek, and Bogart Pond that will require permits from the Lake Simcoe Region Conservation Authority (LSRCA).

Leslie Street between Wellington Street and State Farm Way (approximately 600m north of Wellington Street) has been constructed to a five-lane urban cross section by development. The Leslie Street corridor from State Farm Way northerly to Mulock Drive is a two-lane rural cross-section. There are six signalized intersections within the road improvement study corridor and the intersection configurations typically include exclusive right-turn and left-turn lanes. Leslie Street from Mulock Drive to Davis Drive is a five-lane urban cross-section.

The York Region Official Plan right-of-way for the Leslie Street corridor under study is up to 36 metres. The existing regional right-of-way varies from 20 metres to in excess of 36 metres.

Land uses adjacent to the Leslie Street corridor include residential, commercial, and industrial uses.

3.2 Project Purpose

The purpose of this assignment is to:

1. Conduct a Class EA Study (Schedule “C”) to determine specific road improvements on Leslie Street from Wellington Street to Mulock Drive to address capacity, operational and safety deficiencies. The improvements within the Leslie Street corridor may include, but are not limited to, the potential widening of the roadway from two to four lanes, addition of bike lanes and/or bike routes, culvert replacements, environmental enhancements, and pedestrian friendly infrastructure improvements.
2. Conduct a Class EA Study (Schedule “A+”) for a new watermain connection from the Aurora East Pressure District to the Newmarket East Pressure District. The watermain will transmit water from the Aurora East Pumping Station (located approximately 500 metres west of Leslie Street) along Wellington Street to Leslie Street and along the Leslie Street corridor northerly to Davis Drive.
3. Complete the detailed design and provide construction administration of the new watermain.

3.3 Coordination With Other Studies

This assignment will include coordination with several other concurrent Regional studies. These studies include:

- Transportation Master Plan update.
- 10-Year Roads Construction Program annual update.
- 10-Year Water Construction Program annual update.
- Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Region’s Purchasing By-law, interested firms, as selected from Request for Qualification (RFQ) No. P-07-44, were invited to submit proposals for the Leslie Street assignment. A short-list of consultants, with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences, structural engineering, and watermain design and construction administration were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fee.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposals and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project Plans, more specifically, discussions on scope, time, cost, quality, human resources, communications, and risk management controls.
- Project implementation, including project understanding, discussion on key project issues, and value and innovation of services.

The fee envelopes were opened following the technical evaluations of the proposals. The proposed fees were converted to a score and weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

4.1 Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary-Leslie Street

Firm	Technical Score	Upset Limit (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)	Dollars per Technical Point
Totten Sims Hubicki Associates Limited (TSH)	49.05	\$1,903,235	17.36	66.41	\$38,801.94
Genivar	47.50	1,818,755	18.17	65.67	38,289.58
Chisholm, Flemming & Associates (CFA)	41.60	1,652,000	20.00	61.60	39,711.54

All three proposals provided thorough project management plans and discussions on their understanding of the key issues and details such as the coordination of the road and watermain improvements, environmental challenges within the corridor, approval requirements and project deliverables.

The total scores of the proposals were within five points of each other. When this occurs, the Region's Purchasing By-law states that the "dollar cost methodology" shall be used. Therefore the proposal with the lowest dollars per point shall be selected.

In the evaluation of the proposals, TSH and Genivar scored high on the technical portion based on their experience in managing Environmental Assessment studies and their understanding of key issues to this project.

The CFA proposal provided the lowest upset limit, therefore receiving full allotment of points for their financial proposal. Once the “dollar cost methodology” was applied Genivar represented the best value to the Region.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that Genivar be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Leslie Street road improvements Class EA and watermain Class EA, detailed design and construction administration assignment under Request for Proposal P-07-44.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the road improvement Class EA and watermain Class EA, detailed design and construction administration assignment is \$1,818,755, excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in the Region’s approved 2008 10-Year Roads Construction Program and 2008 10-Year Water Construction Program.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. stage two archaeological assessments, additional public meetings, additional work to satisfy the *Canadian Environmental Assessment Act* requirements, exposing underground utilities, responding to Requests for Part II Orders, preparation of Legal Reference Plans and obtaining a Permit to Take Water, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The combination of road improvements to Leslie Street and a new watermain connection between the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts will address transportation and water servicing deficiencies in York Region; specifically in the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket.

Throughout the course of the assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Towns of Aurora and Newmarket to accommodate any staged construction of the watermain as required to also meet local priorities.

7. CONCLUSION

The Region’s Transportation Master Plan identified transportation improvements within the Leslie Street corridor. The Class EA assignment must be undertaken to permit the improvements as programmed in the approved 2008 Regional Roads Capital Program.

The 2004 Long Term Water Master Plan identifies the need to connect the Aurora East and Newmarket East Pressure Districts along the Leslie Street corridor. The Class EA assignment must be undertaken to permit the installation of infrastructure as programmed in the 2008 Regional Water Capital Program. To promote timely and cost-effective delivery of this project, detailed design and construction administration services have been included in this assignment.

Three proposals for provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with the Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal from Genivar represents the best overall value to York Region. It is recommended that the assignment be awarded to Genivar as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-07-44.

For more information on this report, contact Bala Araniyasundaran, extension 5131, Director, Capital Delivery of the Water and Wastewater Branch in the Environmental Services Department.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the February 6, 2008 Committee meeting.)