

2

YORK REGION TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE CONTRACTOR REPORT CARD

The Transit Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendation contained in the following report, January 31, 2007, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that this report be received for information.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to provide Transit Committee and Regional Council with the results of York Region Transit's Operations and Maintenance Contractor Report Card for the third quarter of 2006.

3. BACKGROUND

In September of 2006, YRT staff submitted a report on the Contractor Report Card program to Transit Committee and Regional Council. The Report Card provides an enhanced management tool to review and compare the performance of contractors who operate conventional and Viva bus rapid transit services in the Region. This report is being used to regularly monitor contractor performance based on key indicators and identify areas in need of improvement (see *Attachment 1*).

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Report Card

The Contractor Report Card measures contractor performance in the following key areas:

- Schedule adherence
- Vehicle maintenance
- Safety
- Customer satisfaction
- Personnel training and appearance
- Reporting requirements

Each key area has several performance measures that are used to score and rank each contractor. In total there are 22 performance measures and each has a benchmark to

determine if an incentive or disincentive is applied. Scoring of the Viva service was introduced in the Q3 contractor report card with 18 of 22 performance measures scored. The Viva service schedule adherence was not officially monitored for the Q3 contractor report card. Further analysis is required on how to utilize the technical data generated from the automatic vehicle location system.

4.2 Scoring

Each quarter, physical random checks for service schedule adherence and equipment are performed by YRT Operations Inspectors. In addition, data pertaining to vehicle maintenance, accident reports, responses to customer concerns and personnel training is provided to YRT by the contractors. This data is submitted on a daily, monthly and annual basis as specified in the performance based contract. The results of the YRT random checks and data collected from the contractors is compiled and used to score each of the 22 performance measures. Each of the 22 performance measurements has been assigned a benchmark score. Scores are illustrated by a percentage, percentage range, pass or fail. The performance benchmarks determine whether or not the contractor has exceeded, meets or falls below the standard. (*Attachment 1*) Scoring of the performance measures is done using 1, 2, or 3 scores, where:

1. Exceeds standard
Contractor's score is greater than the benchmark score.
2. Meets standard
Contractor's score is equal to, or, falls within the percentage range.
3. Below standard
Contractor's score is less than the benchmark score.

The performance measures scoring 3 (below standard) are the primary focus. YRT and the contractor's staff work towards meeting the requirement outlined in the terms of their contract with the Region.

4.3 Q3 Contractor Report Card Results

4.3.1 Division 2 - Laidlaw Transit

Laidlaw ranked first with a score of 32, scoring 1 or 2 in 85% of the performance measurements.

Areas scoring 3 (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are:

- Operating ahead of schedule
- Kilometres between road calls
- Diesel Technician training

In 2007, YRT and Laidlaw staff will be reviewing service running times to identify efficiencies. It is anticipated that adjustments to running times will avoid buses operating ahead of schedule.

In December 2006, Laidlaw received five new 30' Eldorado buses. It is anticipated that with a lower average fleet age, an increased spare ratio and a continuing high level preventative maintenance program, the need for road calls will be reduced.

YRT staff will be working with Laidlaw to ensure compliance to the training requirements.

4.3.2 Division 4 - Tokmakjian Transit (CanAr)

Tokmakjian (CanAr) ranked second with a score of 35, scoring 1 or 2 in 70% of the performance measurements. Tokmakjian was the only contractor to elect to have a facility audit conducted by the Ontario Ministry of Transportation resulting in a carrier safety rating of "satisfactory – audited".

Areas scoring a 3 (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are:

- Operating ahead of schedule
- Preventative maintenance inspection
- In service vehicle damage

In 2007, YRT and CanAr staff will be reviewing service running times to identify efficiencies. It is anticipated that adjustments to running times will assist with buses operating ahead of schedule.

In December 2006, YRT and CanAr Fleet staff worked together to identify both minor body damage and major structural repairs necessary. This project will continue throughout 2007.

Overall, CanAr has improved from the Q2 report card.

4.3.3 Division 1 - Miller Transit

Miller Transit ranked third overall with a score of 37, scoring a 1 or 2 in 70% of the performance measures.

Areas scoring 3 (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are:

- Operating ahead of schedule
- Interior bus clean
- Preventative maintenance

In 2007, YRT and Miller staff will be reviewing service running times to identify efficiencies. It is anticipated that adjustments to running times will avoid buses operating ahead of schedule.

Miller's management staff is aware of the deficiency in their preventative maintenance program and interior bus clean. Miller has re-organized their yard operations and hired staff in anticipation of improving transit services overall.

4.3.4 Division 7 - Veolia Transportation

YRT staff excluded Veolia from the disincentive and report card process in the first year of the implementation of Viva services in order for YRT and Veolia staff to identify and correct any operating and technical issues that would arise. Veolia's performance was monitored during the first year but not officially reported through the report card process.

Beginning with the 2006 Q3 contractor report card, Veolia is now being scored on 18 of the 22 key performance areas excluding schedule adherence. The methodology to analyse Viva's schedule adherence is under review. The automatic vehicle locating system on Viva allows YRT to collect arrival and departure times, however, operational requirements at the terminals skew the data causing negative results. Adjustments to the parameter setting within the system are to be complete in February 2007. It is anticipated that with these adjustments YRT staff will be able to extract accurate schedule adherence data from the system. Until it can be determined that these adjustments are successful, YRT staff will perform physical schedule adherence random checks, as is being done with the conventional service. The results of the random sampling will be introduced in the First Quarter 2007 Contractors Report Card.

Veolia scored 1 or 2 in 94% of the 18 key areas measured during the Third Quarter 2006 Contractor Report Card.

Areas scoring a 3 (below standard) and indicating a need for improvement are:

- Interior bus clean

To assist in improving the interior bus cleanliness issue, Veolia staff will supply waste bags, in the driver's compartment area, on each Viva bus to allow the driver to easily pick up discarded waste at the terminals when time is available.

YRT staff will continue to work with Veolia to ensure that their service remains at this exemplary level. In 2007, YRT and Veolia staff will work towards the development of the methodology to collect and interpret technical data captured by the CAD/AVL system.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no financial implications with the utilization of the Contractor Report Card program.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Transit customers from the local municipalities will benefit from the Contractor Report Card program as service will continually be monitored and a mechanism provided to identify areas in need of improvement.

7. CONCLUSION

The Contractor Report Card provides staff with another management tool to continually monitor the performance of transit operations and maintenance contractors, and identify opportunities for quality improvement.

The Q3, Operations and Maintenance Contractors Report Card is attached as *Attachment 1*.

For more information on this report contact Ann-Marie Carroll, Assistant Manager, Operations (Ext. 5677) or Rick Takagi, Manager, Operations (Ext. 5624), of the Transit Branch in the Transportation and Works Department.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause is attached to this report.)