

9

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES NINTH LINE, TOWNS OF MARKHAM AND WHITCHURCH-STOUFFVILLE (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-06-17)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, September 27, 2006, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The proposal of Chisholm Fleming and Associates Limited, with an upset limit amount of \$563,997 excluding GST, be accepted for the Environmental Study Report review of Ninth Line (Y.R. 69) from Major Mackenzie Drive (Y.R. 25) to Main Street (Stouffville) and for the detailed design of road improvements on Ninth Line (Y.R. 69) from Markham By-pass (Y.R. 48) to Major Mackenzie Drive (Y.R. 25); Major Mackenzie Drive (Y.R.25) from east of Markham By-pass (Y.R. 48) to Ninth Line (Y.R. 69) including the jog elimination; and improvements at the intersection of Ninth Line (Y.R. 69) and Elgin Mills Road (Y.R. 49) including the jog elimination in the Towns of Markham and Whitchurch-Stouffville.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to recommend the retention of a consulting engineering firm to carry out the Environmental Study Report (ESR) review for Ninth Line from Major Mackenzie Drive to Main Street (Stouffville) and detailed design services for roadworks (*see Attachment 1*), in the Towns of Markham and Whitchurch-Stouffville.

In compliance with the Region's purchasing by-law, a report to Council is required prior to authorizing an award when a Request for Proposals (RFP) has been issued and the total cost of the contract exceeds \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

York Region completed a Schedule 'C' Class Environmental Assessment (EA) for Ninth Line from Highway 407 to Main Street (Stouffville) in August 1999. Under the approved 2006 – 10 Year Road Construction Program, implementation of the preferred alternative has been scheduled as noted Table 1.

Table 1
Ninth Line Programmed Improvements

Project No	Project Description	Year
94200	Highway 407 to Markham By-pass	2006
83880	Intersection Improvements at Major Mackenzie Drive	2007
83870	Intersection Improvements at Elgin Mills Road	2007
83880	Markham By-pass to Major Mackenzie Drive	2008
80660	Major Mackenzie Drive to Main Street (Stouffville)	2009

York Region completed a Schedule 'C' Class EA for Major Mackenzie Drive from Highway 48 to Ninth Line in June 2000. Implementation of the preferred alternative from Highway 48 to Markham By-pass was completed in 2004 under Contract 02-103. Under the approved 2006 – 10 Year Road Construction Program, implementation of the preferred alternative from Markham By-pass to Ninth Line is scheduled for 2008.

Ninth Line between Major Mackenzie Drive and Main Street (Stouffville) is a two-lane rural section with “jogged” intersections at Major Mackenzie Drive, Elgin Mills Road, 19th Avenue and Main Street (Stouffville).

Major Mackenzie Drive from Markham By-pass to Ninth Line is a two-lane rural section.

Under the 1999 Class EA for Ninth Line, the preferred alternative included varying cross-sections of roadway:

- Markham By-pass to Major Mackenzie Drive
 - Four-lane rural cross-section.
 - Turning lanes at Major Mackenzie Drive.
 - Elimination of the “jogged” intersection by realigning Major Mackenzie Drive east of Ninth Line such that the east leg of Major Mackenzie Drive aligns with the west leg of Major Mackenzie Drive.
- Major Mackenzie Drive to Sunset Boulevard
 - Two-lane rural cross-section.
 - Turning lanes at Elgin Mills Road.
 - Turning lanes at 19th Avenue.
 - Elimination of the “jogged” intersection by realigning Elgin Mills Road west of Ninth Line such that the west leg of Elgin Mills Road aligns with the east leg of Elgin Mills Road.
- Sunset Boulevard to Main Street (Stouffville)
 - Three-lane rural cross-section (1 lane northbound, 1 lane southbound and 1 centre left-turn lane).

- Improvements to the Ninth Line at Main Street (Stouffville) intersection, including widening along Main Street (Stouffville), signalization of the south and north legs of the intersection and improved signage.

Under the 2000 Class EA for Major Mackenzie Drive the preferred alternative is as follows:

Markham By-pass to Ninth Line

- Four-lane rural cross-section.
- Turning lanes at Ninth Line.

Award of the construction contract for the section of Ninth Line from Highway 407 to Markham By-pass is expected in October 2006. However, implementation of the preferred alternative for the section of Ninth Line from Major Mackenzie Drive to Main Street (Stouffville) requires a review of the Ninth Line ESR to confirm the validity of the preferred alternative for this section in light of additional development areas approved by the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville subsequent to the completion of the Ninth Line Class EA, and traffic operations in the vicinity of the Ninth Line intersections on Main Street.

The work to be undertaken by the successful Proponent under RFP P-06-17 includes:

Part 1 -ESR Review and addendum, if required, for Ninth Line from Major Mackenzie Drive to Main Street (Stouffville), including the review of options for the Ninth Line intersections.

Part 2 -Detailed design and contract preparation for Ninth Line from Markham By-pass to Major Mackenzie Drive, intersection improvements at Major Mackenzie Drive, including realignment of Major Mackenzie Drive to eliminate the jogged intersection at Ninth Line and Major Mackenzie Drive from east of Markham By-pass to Ninth Line.

Part 3 -Detailed design and contract preparation for intersection improvements at Elgin Mills Road, including realignment of Elgin Mills Road to eliminate the jogged intersection at Ninth Line.

The expected benefits realized as a result of retaining a single consultant team to carry out the above work are as follows:

- Completion of all project deliverables within the specified time periods.
- Close co-ordination of the project with the local municipality.
- Provide a single source of accountability for the engineering services and the management of the project.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Regional Purchasing By-law, interested firms, as selected from Expression of Interest No. P-05-69, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of consultants, with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering, were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

4.1 Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated in Table 2.

Table 2
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary – Ninth Line

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)
Chisholm Fleming and Associates Limited	58.1	563,997	20.0	78.1
Morrison Hershfield Limited	48.2	737,198	15.3	63.5
National Capital Engineering Limited	58.0	952,300	11.8	69.8
R.V. Anderson Associates Limited	47.9	975,700	11.6	59.5

The technical proposals from Chisholm Fleming and Associates Limited and National Capital Engineering Limited scored very well. In each of these proposals, the proponents demonstrated a sound understanding of the project sign and presented a thorough understanding of the key issues and details of this project.

The technical proposals from Morrison Hershfield Limited and R.V. Anderson Limited although complete, were not as thorough as the proposal submitted by Chisholm Fleming and Associated Limited, specifically in the areas of quality control of services, project understanding and scope and discussion on project issues.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that Chisholm Fleming and Associates Limited be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the ESR review, Ninth Line from Major Mackenzie Drive to Main Street (Stouffville) and detailed design for roadworks under Request for Proposal P-06-17.

4.2 Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan

York Region has initiated a Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan Study. The plan, when completed, will provide a coordinated and integrated Regional pedestrian and cycling system serving both the urban and rural areas of York Region.

As part of the Ninth Line EA review and detailed design for road improvements, the recommendations of the Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan will be considered and provision for same be incorporated, where appropriate.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Funding for these projects is included in the Region's approved 2006 10-Year Roads Construction Program, which allocates funds for these projects amounting to \$305,000 in fiscal 2006 and \$50,000 in fiscal 2007. The 2006 funds are sufficient to cover the anticipated 2006 expenditures. Sufficient funds will be allocated in the 2007 budget to cover these anticipated 2007 expenditures.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. stage two archaeological assessments, additional public consultation, permits and approvals), if required. The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project is required to address the transportation needs and accommodate growth in the Towns of Markham and Whitchurch-Stouffville. The project will improve traffic safety and operations for the travelling public within the local and Regional road network.

7. CONCLUSION

The ESR review and detailed design for roadworks must be commenced to permit the improvements scheduled under the approved capital program to proceed in a timely manner.

Consultants' proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Regional purchasing by-law and it is recommended that the assignment be awarded as outlined, since the proposal represents the best overall value to York Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the October 4, 2006 Committee meeting.)