

7

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES DECOMMISSIONING AND DEMOLITION OF THE STOUFFVILLE WATER POLLUTION CONTROL PLANT AND WEST END PUMPING STATION TOWN OF WHITCHURCH-STOUFFVILLE, PROJECT 78110

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, September 28, 2004, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The consulting engineering firm of Conestoga-Rovers & Associates be engaged to undertake the detailed design, contract administration, and full time site supervision for the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville Water Pollution Control Plant (WPCP) and the West End Pumping Station (PS), at an upset limit cost of \$213,483.19 including GST.
2. The Commissioner of Transportation and Works be authorized to execute the necessary engineering contracts and to distribute funds to the selected engineering consultants.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to engage qualified consultants as soon as possible to ensure timely completion of Regional works in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. This report recommends the retention of consulting engineering firms to carry out the following project:

Detailed design, contract administration, and full-time site supervision services for the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville.

3. BACKGROUND

Brief details of the subject projects are provided below.

The Region has recently completed a Municipal Class “B” Environmental Assessment (EA) process to address the issues of projected growth in the Stouffville area with the understanding that the current WPCP is currently operating a full capacity. This EA report identified the preferred solution as an extension of the sewers and direct connection into the York Durham Sewer System (YDSS), thereby eliminating the need for the Stouffville WPCP and West End PS.

The sewer work is currently under construction with anticipated completion in late 2005. The work under the proposed project entails developing a work plan and the necessary contract document to properly disconnect and decommission the WPCP and PS, then demolition of the facilities, disposal of the materials and restoration of the sites.

It is noted that the timing of decommissioning and demolition of the plant is under review. Because of system capacity issues, there may be a need to keep the plant in operation for a short period of time after the completion of the sewage works currently under construction. The engagement of consultants as proposed in this report will allow preparation of detailed design and contract documents and a decision of the timing of the contract for the demolition can then be made subsequently.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

4.1 Submission of Proposals

The following three firms submitted written proposals in response to the Request for Proposal (RFP) issued on April 26, 2004, for the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS:

- AWS Engineers & Planners
- Conestoga-Rovers & Associates
- Totten Sims Hubicki Associates

The RFP for the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS, was issued via invitation to the above companies following the review of the Expressions of Interest P-02-63 submitted in May 2002.

4.2 Proposal Evaluation

The submission deadline for technical and price proposals was May 19, 2004.

The technical proposals were evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team qualifications.
- Project implementation (including project understanding, approach and methodology, project management and quality assurance and quality control).

The financial proposals were opened once the technical evaluations were complete and the prices were factored into the proposal evaluation using standard procedures. The evaluation results are summarized in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary
Decommissioning and Demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS

Firm	Technical Score (Out of 60)	Upset Fee (including GST)	Financial Score (Out of 40)	Total Score (Out of 100)
Conestoga-Rovers & Associates	40.5	\$213,483.19	35.9	76.4
AWS Engineers and Planners	34.0	\$191,656.26	40.0	74.0
Totten Sims Hubicki Ltd	31.4	\$266,056.57	28.8	60.2

For the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS, the Conestoga-Rovers & Associates proposal provided a greater overall understanding of the project and demonstrated a superior approach to public communications, regulatory approvals and project management.

The Conestoga-Rovers & Associates proposal ranked highest in the overall evaluation and represents the best value to the Region.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fees for the project is \$213,483.19.

The fee for the contract administration services for this project was based on the assumed contract duration of 40 weeks.

The consultant quoted on the contract administration based on the assumed duration. The proposals provided the Region with a “per-week” cost to establish a pro-rata cost if the contract varies from the assumed durations and approvals for any adjustments would be obtained through a Council approved process.

Sufficient funds are included in the 2004 and 2005 Budgets and Business Plans for this assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville is required to ensure the integrity of the wastewater treatment system and accommodate growth in the Town of Whitchurch-Stouffville. The decommissioning of the infrastructure will be undertaken after the completion of the Ninth Line trunk sewer extension to Stouffville.

7. CONCLUSION

The proposal by Conestoga – Rovers & Associates is proposed as the preferred proposal for the decommissioning and demolition of the Stouffville WPCP and the West End PS. The proposal represents the best overall value to the Region.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.