

12

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES DOANE ROAD ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT WOODBINE AVENUE TO YONGE STREET TOWN OF EAST GWILLIMBURY

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, November 21, 2008, from the Commissioner of Transportation Services:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. Regional Council authorize retaining the consulting firm of URS Canada Inc. to undertake the engineering services for the Class Environmental Assessment and preliminary design for road improvements to Doane Road (Y.R. 45) in the Town of East Gwillimbury, and such other services as may be deemed appropriate, at a cost not to exceed \$809,349, excluding GST.
2. The Region enter into a contract with URS Canada Inc., as set out in this report.
3. The Regional Chair and the Regional Clerk be authorized to execute the contract, subject to the approval of Legal Services as to form and content.

2. PURPOSE

This report seeks Council authorization to engage a qualified consulting engineering firm to complete the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) and preliminary design for improvements to Doane Road between Woodbine Avenue and Yonge Street.

In compliance with the Regional Purchasing By-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000. In addition, the recommended candidate is not the lowest cost responsive bidder.

3. BACKGROUND

The location of the study is depicted in *Attachment 1*. Doane Road is a two-lane east-west road located north of Mount Albert Road and south of Queensville Sideroad, and extends from Yonge Street easterly to McCowan Road with a posted speed of 70 km/hour. Doane

Road between Yonge Street and Woodbine Avenue has been under the jurisdiction of York Region since its transfer from the Town of East Gwillimbury in 2000.

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (June 2006) indicates that York Region will experience significant growth in population and employment. By 2031, the population of York Region is anticipated to be 1,500,000 with employment of 780,000. Prior to the release of the Growth Plan in June 2006, York Region and the Town of East Gwillimbury had developed community plans for Queensville (OPA 89), Sharon (OPA 122), and Holland Landing (OPA 60), as a means of planning for future population and employment growth in these areas.

In response to provincial growth policies, (*Places to Grow*), the Town of East Gwillimbury's population is expected to reach 75,000 - 90,000 persons by 2031. The majority of growth will occur in the communities of Queensville, Sharon and Holland Landing, from a combined existing population of 13,500 in 2007, to approximately 28,500 persons by 2016, and 55,500 persons by 2031. In support of this growth, the Queensville Community Plan, Schedule A, as well as Amendment No. 115 to the Official Plan for the Town of East Gwillimbury (OPA 115) identify an interchange at the intersection of the Highway 404 Extension and Doane Road, as well as a realigned Doane Road to the south between the proposed interchange and 2nd Concession. This proposed interchange at Doane Road and Highway 404 is the subject of a current Environmental Assessment being conducted by URS Canada Inc., to be completed by the end of 2009.

The Town and Region are in the process of reviewing the *Queensville Community Plan* to identify opportunities to accommodate the increased population and employment growth predicted for York Region. While Doane Road currently serves relatively low traffic volumes (less than 1,000 vehicles per day), the original *Queensville Community Plan* identifies Doane Road as a critical component in the Town of East Gwillimbury serving east-west travel demand to and from the Community of Queensville. The higher growth requirements included in the Growth Plan further reinforce the need for Doane Road to be upgraded to a higher standard arterial roadway.

Improvements to the Doane Road corridor between Woodbine Avenue and Yonge Street have been scheduled for construction in 2015, in both the 2008 and 2009 10-Year Roads Construction Programs. In order to proceed to construction in 2015, a Class EA Study needs to be initiated.

Key considerations include the following:

- Coordination with recent and current EA Studies in the area (Doane Road /Highway 404 Interchange EA, 2nd Concession EA).
- Physical features of importance (kettle lakes, steep grades, and woodlands in the vicinity of Doane Road and Leslie Street, Doane Road Forest at Doane Road and 2nd Concession, tributaries of the East Holland River).

- Land Use Planning (Proposed Queensville Community as depicted in OPA 115 which identifies a realignment of Doane Road between the Hwy 404 interchange 2nd Concession.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

Consultants were shortlisted

In accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law, interested firms as selected from the Expression of Interest No. P-08-66, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of three consultants with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering were invited to submit proposals, however one consulting company withdrew its submission. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Two of three requested proposals were evaluated

The two remaining proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the technical proposal and the fee proposal to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Qualifications and Experience.
- Project Deliverables.
- Project Implementation.

The financial proposal envelopes were then opened. The proposed fees were converted to a financial score and then weighted along with the technical score to determine the total score.

URS Canada Inc. Received Highest Total Score for their Proposal

The proponents, their technical scores, proposed upset limit fees (financial scores and total scores) are tabulated in Table 1.

Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Limit Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)
Dillon Consulting		Submission Withdrawn		
URS Canada Inc.	60.3	\$809,349	14.8	75.1
Genivar Consultant LP	45.5	\$598,500	20.0	65.5

The technical proposals from Genivar Consultant LP and URS Canada Inc. were evaluated based on the evaluation criteria summarized in the Request for Proposal P-08-82.

The technical proposal from URS Canada Inc. received the highest technical score because it was the most thorough and illustrated a better understanding of the key issues including study area context, potential stakeholder sensitivities (given the potential realignment of Doane Road), and staff resource dedication to address these key issues. Also, URS Canada Inc. did the consultant work for the interchange study of Doane Road and Highway 404 extension. The distinguishing elements of the URS Canada Inc. proposal include:

- Superior understanding of the complexity of study area, potential sensitivities of local stakeholders, and discussion of measures to address these issues.
- Superior project/implementation plan demonstrating thorough understanding of the study requirements, objectives, milestones and deliverables.
- Enhanced Public Consultation Plan including significant time allocation for meetings and time allocation of Project Manager to address key issues including First Nations Consultation.
- Thorough discussion of Quality Control of Services.

The technical proposal from Genivar Consultant LP scored lower than the technical proposal from URS Canada Inc. in the following areas of Project Implementation and Project Deliverables:

- Staff allocation to address anticipated stakeholder sensitivities, communication plans, noise analysis impacts, and First Nations Consultation.
- Quality control documentation.

The lower score in these areas represents an additional risk for scope of work changes compared with the URS Canada's proposal.

Although the financial proposal from Genivar Consultant LP was considerably lower than URS Canada Inc.'s financial proposal, Genivar Consultant LP's less thorough work plan, understanding of the study area context, and time allocation of key staff, reflected in their lower technical score, indicates a higher probability for budget increases through scope changes. The enhanced level of effort identified in URS Canada's proposal, reflected in their fees, is directly related to the complexity of the study area, potential sensitivities of stakeholders potentially affected, and effort needed to address these issues.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that URS Canada Inc. be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Doane Road environmental assessment assignment under Request for Proposal P-08-82.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the environmental assessment and preliminary design for improvements to the Doane Road is \$809,349, excluding GST, which is budgeted in 2009 and 2010 with 88% funding through development charges and the remainder through tax levy.

There are sufficient funds in the proposed capital 2009 budget for this assignment.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

Road improvements to Doane Road between Woodbine Avenue and Yonge Street will address anticipated future transportation servicing deficiencies in York Region, specifically in the Town of East Gwillimbury.

Upgrading this road to the Regional standards will provide a strong backbone to support the current and planned developments along this corridor, and the anticipated increase in level of traffic that will be generated.

Throughout the course of this assignment, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Town of East Gwillimbury to accommodate local municipal requirements.

7. CONCLUSION

Two of three proposals requested for the provision of professional engineering services were evaluated in accordance with York Region's Purchasing By-law and the proposal

from URS Canada Inc. represents the best overall value to York Region as it achieved the highest total score.

It is recommended that the assignment for Class Environmental Assessment on Doane Road from Woodbine Avenue to Yonge Street be awarded to URS Canada Inc. as successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-08-82.

For more information on this report, please contact Paul Jankowski, General Manager, Roads Branch at Extension 5901.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the December 3, 2008 Committee meeting.)