

8

CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES KENNEDY ROAD AND MCCOWAN ROAD, TOWN OF MARKHAM (REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL NO. P-06-108)

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, December 13, 2006, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that:

1. The proposal of Morrison Hershfield Limited, in the upset limit amount of \$1,192,059 excluding GST, be accepted for the Class Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design Studies of Kennedy Road (Y.R. 3) and McCowan Road (Y.R. 67), from Steeles Avenue to 16th Avenue (Y.R. 73) in the Town of Markham.
2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign the necessary agreement, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to recommend retaining a consulting engineering firm to carry out the Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) and Preliminary Design Studies for Kennedy Road and McCowan Road improvements, from Steeles Avenue to 16th Avenue in the Town of Markham. Location plans are appended to this report. (*See Attachments 1 and 2*).

In compliance with the Region's purchasing by-law, Council authorization is required when a Request for Proposal has been issued and the successful consultant's fee plus taxes is over \$500,000.

3. BACKGROUND

The Region's Transportation Master Plan identified future road network needs in the area of the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors between Steeles Avenue and 16th Avenue in the Town of Markham. The 2006 10-Year Roads Construction Program has scheduled the implementation of improvement works on Kennedy Road between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 in 2009 and McCowan Road between Steeles Avenue and 16th Avenue in 2011.

3.1 Project Description

Kennedy Road and McCowan Road (between Steeles Avenue and 16th Avenue) are north-south roads located in south-central Markham, approximately two km. apart and adjacent parallel corridors with many common features. (*see attachments 3 and 4*)

Some major features located within the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road study areas are the existing GO Transit at-grade crossings, CNR grade-separated crossings, Highway 407 corridor and interchanges, Rouge River corridor and water crossings, and Milne Dam Conservation Park within the McCowan Road corridor. The bridges that span over the Rouge River in the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors are typically four-lane wide structures. The Rouge River and its tributary crossings are within the regulation limits of the Toronto and Region Conservation Authority (TRCA) and the Milne Dam Conservation Park is an environmentally sensitive area that is owned by TRCA and maintained by the Town of Markham.

The land uses located adjacent to the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors are predominantly residential and scattered commercial uses. The adjacent commercial uses located within the Kennedy Road corridor are typically between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 and there are several larger existing retail centers located at Steeles Avenue, Denison Street, 14th Avenue and Highway 7. Within the McCowan Road corridor, the commercial uses are generally located around the vicinity of Highway 7. An existing regional retail center (i.e. Markville Mall) is located on the west side of McCowan Road and north of Highway 7.

3.2 Project Purpose

The purpose of this assignment is to conduct the Class Environmental Assessments (Schedule "C") and Preliminary Design Studies to determine specific improvements to Kennedy Road and McCowan Road between Steeles Avenue and 16th Avenue for implementation in the Region's 10-Year Roads Construction Program to address capacity operational deficiencies. The improvements within the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors may include, but are not limited to, the potential widening of the roadway from four to six lanes, the associated bridge and culvert improvements, transit/high occupancy vehicle lane strategies and the potential grade separations of the existing GO Transit rail/road crossings.

As the southerly limits of the study areas are the border between York Region and the City of Toronto, a review of the boundary road (specifically at the Steeles Avenue intersections) will also be undertaken to address the need for improvements to ensure that any proposed corridor improvements within York Region will not be negated by capacity restrictions across the boundary road between York Region and the City of Toronto.

There are many common roadway and environmental features within the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors that will need to be addressed by the same approval agencies for the two corridors as part of the Class EA process. By combining the

Kennedy Road and McCowan Road environmental assessments as one assignment, the expected benefits realized in retaining a single consultant to carry out both of the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road projects are the completion of all project deliverables within a shorter time period, close co-ordination of the two projects with provincial, regional and local agencies, and better co-ordination and resolution of project issues with approval agencies and local municipality.

3.3 Coordination with other Studies

3.3.1 Regional Studies

The Regional Municipality of York (York Region) is currently or will be undertaking several strategic transportation studies and projects, where the study findings and recommendations will be relevant to the proposed improvements on Kennedy Road and McCowan Road, and will be considered and implemented. These studies include the York Region Transportation Master Plan Update, 10-Year Roads Construction Program Update (annually), Pedestrian and Cycling Master Plan and 16th Avenue Class EA Study from Yonge Street to York/Durham Line. As many of these studies are ongoing, there will be coordination to ensure that any applicable results will be considered.

Furthermore, York Region is currently undertaking the installation of the adaptive traffic signal control system within the Kennedy Road corridor between Highway 7 and Steeles Avenue. The goal of this project is to improve the existing traffic flow and movement within this section of the corridor which currently experiences operational deficiencies.

There are other completed studies such as the Towards Great Regional Streets and Highway 7 Corridor and Vaughan North-South Link Public Transit Improvements Environmental Assessment that will also be considered and implemented in the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road Class EA studies.

3.3.2 Other Related Studies

There are other relevant municipal studies which are currently being carried out or have been completed (i.e. Town of Markham Highway 7 Streetscape Study, New Trunk Watermain from Kennedy Pumping Station to Major Mackenzie Drive Route Study etc.) that will be considered and included in this Class EA project. Other transportation studies related to proposed development plans within the Town of Markham and City of Toronto will also be considered as part of the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road Class EA and Preliminary Design Studies.

The new trunk watermain from Kennedy Pumping Station to Major Mackenzie Drive Route Study is an ongoing joint study being undertaken by York Region and the City of Toronto. The route planning study is to identify a preferred route for a future trunk watermain which will extend from the current Kennedy Pumping Station located north of McNicoll Avenue in the City of Toronto to the Milliken Pumping Station located west of Kennedy Road and south of 14th Avenue in the Town of Markham. The proposed trunk watermain will further extend from the Milliken Pumping Station northerly to

Major Mackenzie Drive within a north-south corridor bounded by Warden Avenue to the west and McCowan Road to the east which extends from McNicoll Avenue to Major Mackenzie Drive. The study has currently identified the Kennedy Road corridor as a preferred route for the future trunk watermain and is currently being completed. The requirements from the truck watermain route study will be considered.

4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

In accordance with the Regional purchasing by-law, interested firms, as selected from Expression of Interest No. P-04-61, were invited to submit proposals for the assignment. A short-list of consultants, with expertise in road planning and design, natural environmental sciences and structural engineering, were invited to submit proposals. This report identifies the preferred consultant for the assignment and the upset limit fees.

Proposals were evaluated using a two-envelope system. This system requires the project proposal and the fee to be submitted in two separate envelopes. The technical proposal envelopes were opened first and evaluated using the following criteria:

- Project team experience.
- Project management including quality assurance.
- Project implementation including project understanding, approach and methodology.

The fee envelopes were then opened for the proposals meeting the technical requirements. The proposed fees were converted to a score and then weighted along with the technical criteria to determine an overall score.

4.1 Evaluation Summary

The proponents, their technical scores and proposed upset limit fees are tabulated below:

Table 1				
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary – Kennedy Road and McCowan Road				
Firm	Technical Score (out of 80)	Upset Fee (Excluding GST)	Financial Score (out of 20)	Total Score (out of 100)
Dillon Consulting Ltd.	58.6	\$1,667,560	11.0	69.6
Giffels Associates Limited	38.9	\$ 919,195	20.0	58.9
Morrison Hershfield Limited	52.3	\$1,192,059	15.4	67.7

The technical proposals from Dillon Consulting Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited received comparable scores of above 50 points out of a possible technical score of 80 points, with Dillon Consulting Limited receiving the highest score. Both Dillon Consulting Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited provided thorough discussions of the understanding of the key issues and details such as the road and rail challenges within the corridors, approval requirements, significant natural environmental features, traffic

and operation assessments, and project time allocation and deliverables. The proposal from Giffels Associates Limited was scored lower than the other two proposals because it was not as thorough and provided limited details of the understanding of the key issues and details of the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road projects. The proposal from Giffels Associates Limited also proposed allocation of considerably less time commitment of project staff to addressing key project challenges compared with the other proposals.

The total scores, which comprised the combination of both technical and financial scores, for Dillon Consulting Limited and Morrison Hershfield Limited were within five or less points of each other and the “dollar cost methodology” was used to determine the proponent with the lowest dollar cost per technical point score (detailed in the Request for Proposal document) as the successful consultant. The dollar cost per technical point score for Dillon Consulting Limited is \$28,456.66 per technical point and for Morrison Hershfield Limited is \$22,792.72 per technical point.

Given the utilization of the dollar cost methodology, the lowest dollar cost per technical point score of \$22,792.72 per point from Morrison Hershfield Limited placed the firm in a position that the company be recommended to be engaged for the engineering assignment. The Morrison Hershfield Limited proposal, with the lowest dollar cost per technical point score, represents the best value for the Region on this assignment.

The Supplies and Services Branch have reviewed the evaluation summary and have issued their internal report confirming that Morrison Hershfield Limited be recommended as the successful overall proponent for the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road Class EA and Preliminary Design assignments under Request for Proposal P-06-108.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit fee for the Class EA and Preliminary Design studies is \$1,192,059, excluding GST. Funding for the project is included in the Region’s approved 2006 10-Year Roads Construction Program.

The upset limit fees provide for provisional items of consulting activity (i.e. stage two archaeological assessments, additional public consultation, exposing underground utilities, respond to Requests for Part II Orders, ORM Conservation Act and Conservation Plan and Greenbelt Act and Greenbelt Plan Requirements, if required). The consultant will only be paid for these items if specifically directed by the Region to complete them.

6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

The project is required to address the transportation needs and accommodate growth in the Region and the Town of Markham. The project will address improving traffic safety

and operations for the travelling public within the Regional and local road network. The study will confirm the need for road improvements that are required to improve existing operations and to support future growth.

Throughout the course of the Class EA and Preliminary Design studies, Regional staff will work closely and cooperatively with staff from the Ministry of Transportation, 407 ETR, TRCA and Town of Markham to accommodate their requirements in the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road studies.

7. CONCLUSION

The Region's Transportation Master Plan identified transportation improvements within the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road corridors. The 10-year Roads Construction Program scheduled the implementation of improvement works on Kennedy Road between Steeles Avenue and Highway 7 in 2009 and McCowan Road between Steeles Avenue and 16th Avenue in 2011. The Class EA and Preliminary Design assignments must commence to permit the improvements scheduled under the approved capital program and to proceed in a timely manner.

Consultants' Expressions of Interest were evaluated and the three highest scoring firms were invited to submit formal proposals to provide consulting services for the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road Class EA and Preliminary Design assignments. Consultants' proposals were evaluated in accordance with the Regional Purchasing By-law and the proposal from Morrison Hershfield Limited represents the best overall value to York Region. It is recommended that the Kennedy Road and McCowan Road Class EA and Preliminary Design assignments be awarded to Morrison Hershfield Limited as the successful proponent under Request for Proposal P-06-108.

For more information on this report contact Dino Basso, Director, Capital Delivery – Roads, extension 5902 in the Transportation and Works Department,

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

(The attachments referred to in this clause were included in the agenda for the January 10, 2007 Committee meeting.)