11
CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES
WOODBINE AVENUE WIDENING, WATERMAIN,
FORCEMAIN AND PUMPING STATION UPGRADES
TOWN OF GEORGINA, PROJECTS 72180, 72230, AND 9670

The Transportation and Works Committee recommends the adoption of the recommendations contained in the following report, February 8, 2006, from the Commissioner of Transportation and Works:

1. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

   It is recommended that:
   
   1. The consulting engineering firm of The Municipal Infrastructure Group be engaged to undertake the Environmental Assessment (EA), detailed design and contract administration for the construction of the Woodbine Avenue (YR8) and Ravenshoe Road (YR 32) watermain, the Joe Dales twin forcemains, upgrades to the Joe Dales Pumping Station and completion of the detailed design and contract administration for the widening of Woodbine Avenue (YR8) from Ravenshoe Road (YR32) to Morton Avenue (YR78), at an upset limit fee of $1,970,463.00, excluding GST.

   2. The Regional Chair and Regional Clerk be authorized to sign an engineering agreement with The Municipal Infrastructure Group, subject to review by Legal Services.

2. **PURPOSE**

   This report seeks Council authorization to retain consulting engineering services for the following interrelated items of work in the Town of Georgina (*see Attachment 1)*:

   - Environmental Assessment and detailed design for a trunk watermain from Woodbine Avenue and Church Street to the Keswick Reservoir on West Park Heights.
   - Environmental Assessment and detailed design for twin forcemains from the Joe Dales Pumping Station to the Keswick Water Pollution Control Plant.
   - Environmental Assessment and detailed design for upgrades to the Joe Dales Sanitary Pumping Station.
   - Completion of the detailed design for the widening of Woodbine Avenue including widening of the bridge over the Maskinonge River.
   - Tender document preparation and contract administration for all of the above.
3. **BACKGROUND**

Regional Water, Wastewater, and Transportation Master Plans have identified the need for various capital infrastructure works in the community of Keswick, Town of Georgina. These works include the following:

### 3.1 Trunk Watermain

Initiation and completion of a Class Environmental Assessment (Class EA) as well as detailed design and contract administration for the extension of a Regional trunk watermain, 750 mm diameter over most of its length, from its current terminus at Woodbine Avenue and Church Street to the Keswick reservoir on West Park Heights. The most probable routing, as identified in the Master Plan and subject to confirmation or revision through the Class EA, is southerly on Woodbine Avenue, thence westerly on Ravenshoe Road, and thence northerly on West Park Heights to the existing reservoir. This 9.6 kilometre section of trunk watermain will complete the direct connection between the new Georgina Water Purification Plant and the Keswick Reservoir.

### 3.2 Twin Forcemains

Initiation and completion of an Environmental Assessment as well as detailed design and contract administration for twin forcemains from the Joe Dales Sanitary Pumping Station on Joe Dales Drive to the Keswick Water Pollution Control Plant (WPCP) on Morton Avenue. The most probable routing, as identified in the design brief for the pumping station and subject to confirmation or revision through the Class EA, is easterly to Woodbine Avenue, thence northerly to, or almost to, Morton Avenue, and thence westerly along one of three optional routes to the WPCP.

### 3.3 Upgrades to Pumping Station

Initiation and completion of a Class Environmental Assessment, as well as detailed design and contract administration, for upgrades to the Joe Dales Sanitary Pumping Station. This pumping station was designed to be implemented in two phases. The first phase, commissioned in 2001, was designed as a local municipal facility pumping up to 56.75 L/s to a gravity sewer on The Queensway South. The intent in the ultimate design concept is for the station to be upgraded to pump up to 333.71 L/s directly to the WPCP through the aforementioned twin forcemains. With a direct connection to the WPCP, the station would meet the criteria to be assumed by the Region. The scope of the assignment includes additional changes to meet Region pumping station standards.

### 3.4 Widening of Woodbine Avenue

The detailed design and contract administration for the widening of Woodbine Avenue to a five lane cross-section from Ravenshoe Road to Morton Avenue including the bridge over the Maskinonge River. The Class EA for the widening, which was completed under a separate assignment, was approved in April 2002.
4. ANALYSIS AND OPTIONS

Proponents responded to Request for Qualifications (RFQ) P-05-69, which was advertised in the Daily Commercial News and on the Electronic Tender Network in accordance with the Purchasing By-law, on September 1, 2005. Based on the statements of qualifications received in response to the RFQ, four firms were invited to respond to Request for Proposal (RFP) No. P-06-10 for this project in Georgina. Proposals were received from all four firms.

The proposals were evaluated using the two envelope system – with technical and financial information kept in separate envelopes. The technical proposal was judged prior to any knowledge of financial bids. Technical content was weighted at 60%. The RFP require a proponent to achieve a minimum score (40 out of 60) technically to progress to the financial evaluation.

The technical evaluation was based on the following criteria:

- Project Team Experience.
- Project Understanding.
- Approach and Methodology.
- Project Management Approach.
- Quality Assurance and Quality Control.

Three of the submitted technical proposals received at least 40 out of 60 on the technical evaluation; therefore, three financial proposals were opened. After compliance of the financial proposals had been established, financial scores were assigned comprising the remaining 40% weight of the total evaluation. The best proposal was deemed to be the one with the highest total score.

This allocation of technical/management and financial weighting ensures that the assignment is awarded based on an appropriate, value-based, evaluation system, and that the financial scoring is commensurate with the technical scoring.

A summary of the evaluations of the consultants’ proposals is presented in Table 1 and includes the technical score, the upset limit fee (excluding GST), the corresponding financial score, and the total score for each proponent.
### Table 1
Consultant Proposal Evaluation Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Firm</th>
<th>Technical Score /60</th>
<th>Upset Limit Fee $</th>
<th>Financial Score, /40</th>
<th>Total Score, /100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Infrastructure</td>
<td>48.6</td>
<td>$1,970,463</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>88.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMK Consultants</td>
<td>42.6</td>
<td>$2,160,135</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>79.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totten Sims Hubicki</td>
<td>41.6</td>
<td>$2,285,000</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>76.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hatch, Mott MacDonald</td>
<td>37.6</td>
<td>Not Opened</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The firm with the best overall score as well as the lowest upset limit cost is The Municipal Infrastructure Group.

### 5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The upset limit cost included in the highest rated proposal is $1,970,463.00 excluding GST. Sufficient funds have been identified in the 2006 capital budget for all anticipated expenditures in this year.

The fees for contract administration and site inspection were based on 400 working days. If the actual contract duration exceeds the estimate, the fees for contract administration and site inspection will be adjusted based on the weekly fee provided in the proposal. The Municipal Infrastructure Group carried the lowest prices for these incremental costs as well.

### 6. LOCAL MUNICIPAL IMPACT

All aspects of this project serve to accommodate growth within the community of Keswick.

The trunk watermain is the final closing link between the new Georgina Water Purification Plant at Willow Beach and the Keswick Reservoir as envisioned in the Class EA Environmental Study Report for the Georgina Water Treatment Facility. The trunk main will ensure that the Town will be able to deliver water to the end users where and when it is required.

The twin forcemains and the upgrades to the pumping station will permit the continued development of concession three in Keswick north of Ravenshoe Road.

The widening of Woodbine Avenue will serve to accommodate traffic volumes that are increasing in Keswick and throughout York Region on a continuing basis.
7. **CONCLUSION**

Consultants’ proposals for this project were called and evaluated in accordance with Regional policy. It is recommended that the consulting engineering firm The Municipal Infrastructure Group be engaged to undertake the assignment at an upset limit cost of $1,970,463 excluding GST.

It is further recommended that the appropriate Regional officials be authorized to take all necessary steps to execute a formal agreement with The Municipal Infrastructure Group for the completion of these services.

The Senior Management Group has reviewed this report.

*(The attachment referred to in this clause was included in the agenda for the March 1, 2006 Committee meeting.)*